

Trans Students in post-compulsory education: A scoping review – preliminary findings

Alfonso Pezzella Associate Lecturer Mental Health, Middlesex University, UK

Dr Trish Hafford-Letchfield, Professor of Social Work, Middlesex University, UK

Dr Laura Cole, Research Fellow, Kings College London, UK



University of Applied Sciences and Arts Northwestern Switzerland
School of Social Work

Sexuality and Social Work Conference 2016
18-19 August 2016

Olten/Switzerland

Background to review

- The experiences/needs of students identifying on the trans*spectrum are under-researched and under-reported in the literature (Garvey et al, 2015).
- Need to search for/support the implementation of more inclusive ways of conceptualizing; understanding, listening and supporting students with trans identities in post-compulsory education.
- Gender-identity-based prejudice, discrimination and violence remain one of the least discussed issues even within the literature that addresses LGBT issues within education (Dilley, 2004).
- Post-compulsory education an important social space that if not inclusive and supportive, can have long term detrimental effects on students from the trans* community.

Aims / Objectives

Scoping current knowledge of Transgender (Trans*) students in higher education through the literature – mapping what it tells us about?

- 1) Differences and complexities of gender and its related concepts within the setting of post-compulsory education
- 2) Broader discourses under the LGBTQI banner and spaces for dialogue about Trans issues
- 3) Institutional policies, processes and engagement with Trans issues
- 4) Theoretical basis for trans* inclusion
- 5) Identifying spaces for dialogue and critical engagement with trans* issues in post-compulsory education
- 6) What innovations are needed?
- 7) The priorities for the research agenda?

Methods

- Systematic literature review conducted concerning knowledge of Transgender (Trans*) students in post-compulsory education.
- International and UK electronic bibliographic databases in the fields of education (e.g. ERIC) were used to search for relevant literature.
- Lateral searching techniques were also employed, such as searching key authors works and reference lists.
- A range of search terms were developed using guidance from the mnemonic PICO (Population, phenomenon of Interest, Context; Joanna Briggs Institute, 2011).
- An extraction table was created to summarize the main findings from each article (incorporating CASP).
- Final papers included were annotated, coded, categorised and broad themes identified

***(This presentation does not include analysis of literature not yet available)**

Table 1. Key terms used in search strategy using PICO[^] (JBI, 2011)

1.Population	2.phenomenon of Interest	3.Context
Student*	Trans* “Cross dress*” Intersex* LGBTQ Queer*	Higher education Curriculum Placement Universit* Further education

Notes:

[^]PICO: **P**opulation, **p**henomenon of **I**nterest, **C**ontext.

Table 2. Summary of eligibility criteria

Study designs: No restrictions

Publication status: published and unpublished

Dates: No limits. Conception of database to November 2015

Language: English

Settings: Post compulsory education facilities

Outcomes: Knowledge of Trans* students in post compulsory education

Trans* Review Exclusion / Inclusion Criteria

Exclude:

High School
Secondary school
Senior School
Secondary college

Include:

Community Colleges

EXCLUDE_abstract_ NoStudent
NoTrans*
NoEd
NotHigherEd
NoTransStudents

Broader discourses under the LGBTQI banner and spaces for dialogue about Trans issues

- 31 studies were inclusive of LGBTQI *
- Most studies report LGBT and LGBTQI findings
- Very few actually had Trans* students in sample
- Many of these studies do not breakdown the different and individual experiences of Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual and Trans* students
- All studies emphasise the a range of issues facing LGBTQI students in post-compulsory education which require a separate review

(*8 further abstracts identified where papers not yet obtained)

Papers included in the scoping review so far

- Bilodeau, B. (2005) Beyond the Gender Binary: A Case Study of Two Transgender Students at a Midwestern Research University, *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Issues in Education*, 3:1, 29-44, DOI: 10.1300/J367v03n01_05
- Duggan, J.P. Kusel, M.L., Simounet, D. M. (2012) Transgender College Students: An exploratory study of perceptions, engagement and educational outcomes. *Journal of College Student Development*, 53: 5, 719-736 September/October
- Effrig, J.C., Bieschke, K.J., Locke, B.D. (2011) Examining Victimization and Psychological Distress in Transgender College Students *Journal of College Counseling*. Fall 14: 143-157.
- Finger, E. F. (2010). *Beyond the Binary: Serving the Transgender Student, Improving the College Experience*. ProQuest LLC. – **NOT YET OBTAINED**
- Floyd, M., Gruber, K.J. (2011) Baccalaureate Student Perceptions of Challenging Family Problems: Building Bridges to Acceptance, *Journal of Teaching in Social Work*, 31:1, 65-78.
- Hart, J., Lester, J. (2011) Starring Students: Gender Performance at a Women's College *NASPA Journal About Women in Higher Education* 4.2: 193-217. doi:10.2202/1940-7890.1081.
- Krum, T.E., Davis, K.S. Galupo, M.P., (2013) Gender-Inclusive Housing Preferences: A Survey of College-Aged Transgender Students, *Journal of LGBT Youth*, 10:1-2, 64-82, DOI: 10.1080/19361653.2012.718523
- Marine, S.B., Nicolazzo, Z. (2014) Names That Matter: Exploring the Tensions of Campus LGBTQ Centers and TransInclusion *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 7, 4, 265–281.
- McKinney, J.S., (2005) On the Margins: A Study of the Experiences of Transgender College Students, *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Issues in Education*, 3:1, 63-76, DOI:10.1300/J367v03n01_07
- Mintz, L.M. (2011) *Gender variance on campus : a critical analysis of transgender voices UC San Diego Electronic Theses and Dissertations* <http://escholarship.org/uc/item/90h4f5rx> Local identifier b7177964.
- Parker, B., Back, J. (2009) Gender Variant and Transgender Issues in a Professional Development Book Group. *The English Journal*, 98, 4 :96-101.
- Pusch, R.S. (2005) Objects of Curiosity: Transgender College Students' Perceptions of the Reactions of Others, *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Issues in Education*, 3:1, 45-61, DOI: 10.1300/J367v03n01_06.
- Rankin, S., Beemyn, J. (2012) *Beyond a Binary: The Lives of Gender-Nonconforming Youth. About Campus (Sept-Oct) American College Personnel Association and Wiley Periodicals, Inc.* DOI: 10.1002/abc.21086 **BOOK**
- Seelman, K.L. (2014) Recommendations of transgender students, staff, and faculty in the USA for improving college campuses, *Gender and Education*, 26:6, 618-635, DOI: 10.1080/09540253.2014.935300

Overview of trans studies included

- 8 peer reviewed papers identified + 2 theses + 1 book
- All based on research conducted in USA (2005-15)
- 2 studies based on quantitative design using survey instruments and descriptive statistics, 2 used mixed methods, 7 studies were qualitative
- Researchers have had difficulties in engaging trans students in research because of lack of trust or clear direction
- Language/terminology a really big barrier
- Universities and colleges haven't got a clue!!!
- Need to decouple research from LGB for many issues is evident.
- Research rarely led by trans population
- Small samples except in using secondary data analysis
- Common and consistent themes

Differences and complexities for Trans students

- Remains difficult to assess experiences and support needs
- Differences between groups (intersectionality) e.g in mentoring experiences and counselling referrals
- Significant lower attainment particularly associated with engagement and learning (Duggen et al, 2012).
- Perception of safety and belonging needs direct attention (Duggan et al, 2012)
- Objects of curiosity (Pusch, 2005) few tailored resources
- Increased harassment and discrimination including sexual harassment / racism (Efrigg et al,2011)
- Higher rates of suicide ideation but no utilising student counselling services

Theoretical orientations

- Positioning experience and needs of students within a model of transgender identity development (Rankin, 2012; Bilodeau, 2005) (see D'Augelli)
- Gender performativity – how gender structures power relations and discourses around gender and complexities for trans students challenging these (Hart and Leicester, 2011)

Institutional policies, processes, engagement with Trans issues

- Identifying spaces for dialogue and critical engagement with trans* issues in post-compulsory education (Efrigg et al, 2011)
- Leadership potential of trans students in HE
- Significance of safe spaces within LGBTQ networks and alliances
- Faculty/staff and peer training
- Use of language for inclusiveness (Jeffrey & McKinney, 2005; Maine & Nicola, 2014)
- Design of housing support (Krum et al, 2014)

Innovations and priorities for future research

- Research should not be reductionist but include national and cross disciplinary design (Seelman, 2005)
- Very limited measurement/monitoring or visibility of Trans in survey research – finding the appropriate language/terminology – offering appropriate response options
- Life story, narratives, capturing differences between populations in relation to different experiences and needs

References

- Dilley, P (2004) LGBTQ Research in Higher Education: A Review of Journal Articles, 2000–2003, *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Issues in Education*, 2:2, 105-115
- Garvey, J.C., Taylor, J.L., Rankin, S. (2015) An Examination of Campus Climate for LGBTQ Community College Students, *Community College Journal of Research and Practice*, 39:6,
- Joanna Briggs Institute (2011) *System for the Unified Management, Assessment and Review of Information, Reviewers' Manual*. University of Adelaide, Joanna Briggs Institute.