The Third Eye of Musical Performance

A thesis submitted to Middlesex University in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts

Kristina Alice Ammattil

M00634466

Arts and Creative Industries

Middlesex University London

December 2021

Abstract

The study of Western Classical musical performance within institutions is focused on the pillars of technique and interpretation, overshadowing aspects that cannot be rationally proven. The metaphor of the third eye presupposes the transcendent in music and identifies subjective aspects that might be developed in the practice of a performer. Although this is a linguistically underdeveloped area of performance, interdisciplinary research and discussions with performers and teachers reveal that there is a shared understanding of this phenomenon. Through the lens of a performer, this study attempts to discuss subjective elements that can be developed in practice and experienced in performance such as: intention, the embodiment of music and a cathartic communication that takes place within the transcendental dimension of music. The framework that has been developed around the third eye of musical performance aims to further enrich the current pedagogy and enhance the knowledge of young performers.

Contents

Chapter 1

Introduction

One of the consequences of the national institutionalisation of musical education at the turn of the 19th century in the United Kingdom (UK) and the Republic of Ireland (ROI), has been an increasing professionalisation in the pedagogy of musical performance. In his book, *Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain*, Paul Rodmell identifies that the practice of music education prior to the establishment of the Royal Academy of Music in 1822 was: "a private occupation, with no significant institutions devoted to it either wholly or in part."[1] The tertiary level of music education has since been transformed, giving rise to taught degrees at several institutions in major cities such as Cambridge, Dublin, Birmingham, London, Durham and Edinburgh –and the establishment of conservatories such as Trinity College, London (1872), Guildhall School, London (1880), Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, Glasgow (1847), and the Royal College of Music, London (1882).[2] This has resulted in a nationalised standard of education aimed at professionalising the structure of pedagogy offering qualifications that are recognised worldwide. In the UK, this standard is known as the National Qualification Frameworks (NQF) while in the Republic of Ireland, it is the National Framework of Qualification (NFQ) and it is backed by the department of Quality and Qualification Ireland (QQI). This systemisation of pedagogy, following nationalised standards aiming to professionalise its structure, has led to a predominantly objective approach towards the study of musical performance focusing largely on the pillars of technique and interpretation.

[1] Rodmell, Paul. (2012) 'Introduction', *Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain*. United Kingdom, Ashgate Publishing Limited, p. 7.
[2] In his footnote to this paragraph, Rodmell expresses that these institutions inadvertently created "national curriculums" for music performance well before this concept was undertaken by the British school system.

The objectivity inherent in the structure of music courses, as I have observed, is exemplified within the performance syllabus of the undergraduate programme at the Royal Academy of Music. The opening statement reads, "The programme delivers an integrated Honours-level education that centres on your development of high technical and musical standards in performance".[3] The syllabus further details abilities that are expected from performers upon completion of the course; one of which states that the performer must be able to, "perform or compose with technical and interpretative surety to a standard commensurate with entry to the music profession". While technique and interpretation are vital in the development of a young performer, the current pedagogy seems to reduce performance and the experience of music to simply its objectifiable elements. Music theorist and phenomenologist Thomas Clifton in his book, *Music as Heard*, questions the objective approach of musical study offering an alternative that proposes the study of music as it is experienced. This is how he highlights the flaw in a predominantly objective approach:

> If phenomenology criticises those who make the study of technique an end in itself, and who therefore attempt to take the measure of music with an empirical eye, it is not because it denies the value of empirical methods, but because the non-empirical status of music is covered up with research on the empirical sounds which are its medium, the empirical techniques which are its means, and the empirical marks (the notation) which are its signs. The sounds, the techniques, and the notation are all vastly important aspects of music, but *they are not music itself* [author's italics].[4]

Music is a form of art that is delivered through the medium of sound, concerned with emotional expression, aesthetics and communication, one that requires both an object

[3] Royal Academy of Music (2020-2021). *BMus (Hons) Programme Specification*. Available at: https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/piano-bmus, https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/voice-all-bmus, https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/violin-bmus (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
Same syllabus available for each principal instrument under the course title: Bachelor of Music.

[4] Clifton, Thomas. (1983). *Music as Heard: A Study in Applied Phenomenology*. New Haven: Yale University Press, pp. 36-37.

to perceive and a subject that can perceive it. The objectivity, as I have observed it, refers to a pedagogic structure where the primary focus is not this sonic experience of music, but the empirical techniques and signs through which it is made up. Initial research on the current pedagogical approach of musical performance also revealed that the undergraduate performance syllabus at the Royal Irish Academy of Music also presents a similar objective approach within the BMus programme. A key learning outcome expected from the performers upon completion of the programme is to "describe in detail the major developments of music through study of the musical score and secondary sources"[5] establishing the act of performance itself as a source of knowledge that is secondary to the object of a score. There is plenty to learn from the score and historical events that may have influenced the development of music, but this continues to be the predominant focus within institutions today overshadowing the subjective and experiential nature of musical performance. Furthering Clifton's argument, while these aims and learning outcomes promote empirical aspects of music that are important in the pedagogy of performance, it does not consider the experience of music or include subjective aspects that surround the *music itself*.

This predominantly objective approach is seen to be widely followed within institutions around the UK and ROI, as will be evidenced further along this study. In *Musical Practice: A Guide to Understanding* (2002)[5], a book co-written by a number of authors including performers, musicologists and music educators, Stefan Reid outlines the primary objectives that a performer must take on in order to prepare for a performance. "First, the formulation of an interpretation of a musical work, and second, the development of sufficient technical expertise in order to realise this

[5] Royal Irish Academy of Music. (2020-2021) *Bachelor in Music Performance: Vocal Handbook*. Available at: https://www.riam.ie/degrees-programmes/full-time/bmus-vocal (Accessed: 10th October 2020)
Royal Irish Academy of Music. (2020-2021) *Bachelor in Music Performance: Instrumental Handbook*. Available at: https://www.riam.ie/degrees-programmes/full-time/bmus-keyboard (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
"Programme Learning Outcomes" in vocal and instrumental syllabi are the same, minor differences in other areas of the course structure.

interpretation."[6] Reid stresses the importance of a balanced relationship between these elements, and condenses them into three points: developing an initial interpretative idea, overcoming technical demands, and the combination of the first two steps. This approach towards the practice of performance underscores an applied method that is inherently objective, and is not limited to the practice within institutions. Even in the private education sector, it is widely regarded as the "correct" approach towards performance owing to its relative success in educating young performers.[7]

The aforementioned musical institutions, without doubt, are some of the leading schools for performance studies today.[8] They present a high level of education that promotes the growth of each individual student, and this training has resulted in the rise of highly skilled performers. However, the elements that performers are encouraged to develop are objective in its focus on the acquisition of interpretative knowledge and technical mastery. Rather than portraying this pedagogical structure in a negative light, I wish to redress the void in knowledge between the inherently objective elements of musical performance and its subjective and experiential aspects, such as the transcendental dimension of music.[9] While acknowledging the importance of the methodological approach of developing empirical and objective knowledge, I wish to explore an area of study, that might be included within the current structure, which will focus on the subjective elements and the perceived experience of musical performance through the lens of a performer.

---

[6] Reid, Stefan. (2002) 'Preparing for performance', in Rink, John (ed.). *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 108-109.
[7] Ibid., p. 110.
[8] The QS World University Rankings lists the Royal College of Music as the 2nd best institution for the performing arts; Royal Academy of Music as the 4th best, Guildhall School of Music and Drama in 6th and the Royal Conservatory of Scotland in 9th place. These institutions are renowned for their courses and the standard of performers that they produce each year. Available at: https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/university-subject-rankings/2020/performing-arts (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
[9] The experience of the transcendental in music is a prime focus in this study and will be further elaborated in the following chapters.

The void in knowledge, as I have mentioned earlier, is not simply a result of the national systemisation of higher educational structures. There are further reasons as to why the experiential and subjective aspects of musical performance remain underdeveloped as an area of study; these stem from a wide range of cultural, political and ideological developments within Western societies. The primary problem we face is that the subjective aspects of music cannot be rationally proven and are, most importantly, beyond the grasp of language. As George Steiner (1929–2020), literary critic and philosopher, famously writes in his autobiography, "It [Language] is handcuffed to the avarice of logic".[10] He also shares the affirmation of Arthur Schopenhauer (1788–1860) that even if the universe ceases to exist, music would still endure. Steiner calls this "a proposal incomprehensible on any rational, evidential level."[11] The phenomenon of a musical performance works on a plane of consciousness concerned with the metaphysical, spiritual and philosophical. And since we are unable to empirically prove it, there is insufficient discourse surrounding this aspect resulting in a language and study incommensurate with the experienced transcendence of music. Rather than attempting to prove the existence of this phenomenon, a mammoth task beyond the scope of this research, I aim to create a framework surrounding a few subjective elements of musical performance so that they may be incorporated within pedagogical practices as a means to gain further insight into the phenomenon of a musical performance. These subjective elements include intention, the embodiment of music and its transcendental dimension where the performer and listener are cathartically affected; concepts that will be introduced further along this chapter.

I have found this aspect to be missing during my study as a performer and have been fascinated by the more subjective aspects of music, especially the communication of music during performance, an area that I wished to explore further. This has, in part, stemmed from feedback that I have received in assessments that use superlatives such as: "charming", "engaging", or "remarkable stage presence" to suggest that the

[10] Steiner, George. (1997) *Errata*. Great Britain: Weidenfeld & Nicholson, p. 73.
[11] Ibid.

performance had elicited an experience that somehow affected these listeners; qualities that mark a successful performance. Yet, I had not consciously practiced or learned to convey stage presence, to be charming or engaging. If these are desirable qualities, why is it that these ideas are not discussed during a musician's undergraduate study? I do not believe that these are innate qualities that rely solely on the bounty of nature, but I do believe that they cannot be empirically taught. Instead, discussing these subjective experiences offers performers insight into how they might develop their own practice, and grow as conscientious performers. As a performer, I have chosen to explore this subjective area because the act of performance has always been a thrilling experience for me. I have noticed that, in performance, sometimes there is a transformation that takes place in the environment of a performance where the transcendental dimension is revealed and you are able to cathartically transmit the music to an audience. This experience remains at the foothills of what I wish to conquer, and will continue to do so through the lens of a young performer in this research.

The reason why I wish to present a framework rooted in metaphor and philosophy is to address this phenomenon highlighted by Roland Barthes (1915–1980) in his essay '*The Grain of the Voice*'. Barthes acknowledges the lack of literature surrounding the topic of an affective musical performance. He believes that our reliance on language in order to interpret the semiotic system of music has created an inability to articulate the affective capacity of music.[12] Just as Steiner believed the limits of language in the perception of concepts that cannot be logically explained. Assigning music as the subject, Barthes believes, results in a statement that relies heavily on adjectives and predicates, and he believes that this discourse is insufficient. The alternative he proposes is that we change the musical object "to displace the fringe of contact between music and language." [13] There are several interesting concepts that he addresses in order to support the idea of the 'grain' as *genosong*, an adapted theory formulated by Julia Kristeva, and *jouissance*, as framed by Jacques Lacan (1902–1981)

[12] Barthes, Roland. (1977) 'The Grain of the Voice', in Stephen Heath (trans. and ed.) *Image, Music, Text*. London: Fontana Press.
[13] Ibid., pp. 179-180

as enjoyment beyond our perceived pleasure principle. The *genosong* is what encompasses everything that lies outside the field of *phenosong* (everything from technique and interpretation, to communication and expression), "a space where significations germinate 'from within language and its very materiality'."[14]

A concept similar to the *genosong* is presented by poet Federico Garcia Lorca (1898–1936) in his lecture, '*The Theory and Play of the Duende*', where he also attempts to poetically describe the affective element in vocal performance. Lorca utilises the Spanish concept of the *duende* that alludes to a "mysterious force that everyone feels and no philosopher has explained."[15] Akin to this theory, within the arts, in his book *Real Presences,* George Steiner proposes that within art that affects us, there is a metaphysical presence which cannot be rationally proven. He writes: "*How* music possesses us is a question to which we know no credible, let alone materially examinable answer. All we have are further images. And the defiant self-evidence of human experience [author's italics]."[16] The proof of this subjective aspect of musical performance exists within these texts. However, such concepts are far removed from mainstream pedagogical discourse on musical performance. Hence, I wish to bridge this gap in the literature and broaden the language surrounding the subjective elements of music. My interpretation of these perspectives has led me to contextualise the experience of the transcendental dimension of music through the metaphor of the 'third eye'.

Once again stressing the importance of developing musical and instrumental skills and technical abilities in the primary study of a performer and its efficiency and success in certain methods of pedagogy, I believe that in exceptional performances, preparation of the subjective elements elicits a transcendental dimension where the music is communicated cathartically forging an affective connection between the

[14] Ibid., p. 182
[15] Lorca, Federico Garcia. (2007) Translated by A.S. Kline. *Theory and Play of the Duende*. Available at: https://www.poetryintranslation.com/PITBR/Spanish/LorcaDuende.php (Accessed: 8th September 2020).
[16] Steiner, George. (1989) *Real Presences*. London: Faber and Faber Limited, p. 246.

performer and the listener. Following in Steiner's footsteps, in order to discuss this aspect of music, I am compelled to use metaphors and philosophies in order to build a framework that will enrich the language surrounding the subjective elements. Therefore, I will contextualise these elements through the metaphor of the 'third eye'.

The Third Eye of Musical Performance

The concept of the 'third eye' has previously been interpreted in several contexts within fields such as philosophy and science.[17] Broadly, these perspectives allude to an enigmatic ability of an individual's perception beyond physical sight. My knowledge of this concept lies within the Indian tradition of Ayurveda, where it has been explored extensively in relation to health and well-being. The Ayurvedic tradition posits, there are 7 *chakras* in the body that are points of energy arranged vertically from the base of the spine to the top of the head, and are each associated with a particular function.[18] These *chakras* bearing different levels of energy can be stimulated and harnessed through meditation, in order to provide balance and stability to one's life. Of the 7 *chakras*, the third eye, or the *ajna chakra*, is known to be the centre of intuition and understanding.[19]

Rather than promoting religious spirituality or examining Ayurvedic practices, I am using the metaphor of the third eye in order to discuss an element of musical performance that centres around inner, intuitive knowledge. Acknowledging that this is not a particularly academic approach, it is a deliberate decision that I have chosen

---

[17] See: Eken, A.N. (2002) 'The Third Eye', *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, Vol. 46 (No. 3), pp. 220-230. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/40017129.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3A5d8c10e9078c1a3a412e69881224de5e (Accessed: 25th August 2021).
McKenna, Alex. (2016) *Third Eye: Third Eye, Mind Power, Intuition & Psychic Awareness: Spiritual Enlightenment*. 3rd Edition. N.p.: Lulu Press.
Fourcade, A and Khonsari, R.H. (2019) 'Deep learning in medical image analysis: A third eye for doctors', *Journal of Stomatology, Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery*. Vol. 120 (issue 4), pp. 279-288. Available at: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2468785519301582
[18] Kirkman, Caroline. (2020) *Chakras for Beginners: Healing Yourself With Chakras and Meditatio:. A Complete Guide to Third Eye and Chakra Healing for Starters With Practical Exercises to Balance Your Chakras.* N.p.: Success & Power Management Limited.
[19] Sagan, Samuel. (1997) *Awakening the Third Eye*. 3rd Edition. N.p.: Clairvision, p. 31.

this theory to address the intuitive aspect of the brain that perceives the metaphysical, because we must invariably indulge in the poetic, metaphorical and philosophical to further discuss this subjective aspect of music. Steiner understood this and thus hints at a metaphysical "presence" in arts using metaphors and philosophical means.[20] While it is not my intention to dwell on this aspect, there is the need to approach this thesis through a more intuitive lens, rather than a logical one. There is an aspect of musical performance that can be developed through understanding these elements, and owing to the underdeveloped language surrounding the phenomenon, I will create a framework around the metaphor of the third eye in order to discuss the subjective elements that in the phenomenon of a musical performance. In approaching this study through the lens of young performer, my intention is that fellow students and performers might gain further understanding on this area of performance and how it might be incorporated in their practice.

As previously mentioned, the theory of the third eye has a long history within medical and spiritual practices. I will be discussing this theory through the interpretation of Rishi Nityabodhananda, a *Yogacharya* (master of Yoga) and author of *Ajna Chakra*.[21] In his book, the purpose of the third eye is discussed as a source of knowledge beyond physical perception.

> Knowledge of the external world is gained through the senses; however, it is through our sixth sense, namely *ajna chakra*, that other knowledge is gained. There are so many things we know to be true, yet there is no evidence for it, we just know it.[22]

Nityabodhananda creates a distinction between knowledge gained through the bodily senses and intuitive knowledge that is seemingly without a discernible source. It is this "other knowledge" that further enriches our understanding of the world. The

[20] Steiner, George. (1989) *Real Presences*. London: Faber and Faber Limited.
[21] Nityabodhananda, Rishi, (2009). *Ajna Chakra*. Bihar: Bihar School of Yoga.
[22] Ibid., p. 2.

notion that music is intertwined with the metaphysical is a widely experienced phenomenon, yet it remains an aspect that is scarcely discussed due to a lack of empirical evidence. This "other knowledge" of musical performance, as often experienced by performers, shines a light on the more subjective elements that students might be able to incorporate in their practice. Therefore, extracting this tacit, intuitive knowledge from professional performers through a series of interviews will be most important to my study in articulating this widely experienced phenomenon.

Understanding that we are in search of "other knowledge", Nityabodhananda goes on to discuss the role of the third eye. This is the theory that will form the framework of my study surrounding the subjective elements during a performance:

> According to the vedantic theory of yoga and the experience of people who have perfected it, ajna chakra is the place where the greater mind manifests in the form of a desire. That desire, which is the first manifestation of the greater mind is known as *ichcha shakti*. The greater mind nest manifests in the form of willpower known as *sankalpa shakti*. Then it manifests as a creative process known as *kriya shakti*…It is here [in the process of *kriya*] that we have to focus our creativity, willpower and desire to either be a receiver of, or a receptacle for, the manifest or unmanifest experiences [author's italics].[23]

The 'greater mind' that Nityabodhananda refers to is a higher plane of consciousness where we might experience the metaphysical. The process outlined here suggests this part of our consciousness creates an initial desire which then engulfs our mind in the will to act on this desire. The advice extended here is to focus our creativity, will and desire to take part in a resultant phenomenon as a receptive audience or a vessel through which "other knowledge" may be presented. To be a vessel is to take part in the process of *kriya*, Sanskrit for completed action intending a specific result.

[23] Ibid., p. 37.

The quest for "other knowledge" can also be found in Hungarian-American psychologist, Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi's theory on 'flow state' which presents a similar process towards achieving higher levels of consciousness. Broadly, in his book *Flow*, Csikszentmihalyi theorises the nature of happiness and how we might be able to achieve it. In hypothesising that happiness is a condition that requires control over our consciousness, he suggests that 'flow' is the optimal experience that increases our quality of life.

> This simple truth—that the control of consciousness determines the quality of life—has been known for a long time…Control over consciousness is not simply a cognitive skill. At least as much as intelligence, it requires the commitment of emotions and will. It is not enough to know how to do it; one must do it, consistently, in the same way as athletes or musicians who must keep practicing what they know in theory.[24]

The key to controlling the consciousness is creating a state of optimal experience and this is, according to Csikszentmihalyi, "something we *make* happen."[25] It requires a "commitment of emotions and will" and continuous "practice". Nityabodhananda's interpretation of *ichcha* and *sankalpa shakti*, of desire and will power, is the commitment that Csikszentmihalyi calls for through continued practice, the process of *kriya*. These approaches in achieving a higher state of consciousness promote the development of personal commitment or *intention* to carry out a task. This then influences the continued practice of the chosen activity. This aspect of Csikszentmihalyi's theory on "flow" complements the metaphor that I have chosen as the foundation of my framework. It is to be acknowledged that his work is far more extensive and explores various states of "flow". For the scope of this research, I will be focusing on his philosophical approach towards "flow" and his overarching theory how it might be achieved. I will elaborate on this aspect further along this essay.

---

[24] Csikszentmihalyi, Mihaly. (2002) *Flow: The Classic Work on How to Achieve Happiness*. US: Harper & Row, p. 71.
[25] Ibid., p. 3.

To transcribe the concept of the third eye within the context of musical performance, it is the personal desire that drives the will to perform. A performer might experience this desire through developing an intention to be a vessel in the communication of music. This intention guides the physical learning in the process of *embodiment,* to become the physical manifestation of, the music resulting in a performance that is able to transmit its transcendental dimension. Intention, I believe, is the primary force that paves the way not only for the embodiment or cathartic communication, but also in experiencing the transcendental dimension in music.

This conceptualisation of the third eye is a fitting metaphor for the subjective elements that I wish to address as it provides a unique perspective into their function in musical performance. The concept of creating through the third eye, led by "other knowledge", offers performers further understanding on subjective elements such as intention, embodiment, catharsis and the transcendental dimension of music. These concepts will form the foundations of the framework that I wish to develop around musical performance. I believe the study of these topics, of "other knowledge", will further enrich the current pedagogy resulting in more knowledgeable and conscious performers.

The reception of such exceptional performances offers further evidence and context to the perception of the transcendental dimension experienced in musical performance. I would like to address the reception of famed performers, Maria Callas and Maud Powell. The career of Maria Callas (1923–1977), as René Leibowitz (1913–1972) describes it, exemplifies the presence of the metaphysical in music. Leibowitz believes that Callas was sometimes criticised for her inconsistent tone, strident high notes, and occasional intonational flaws, "and yet, I confess that her art has entirely convinced me."[26] He praises her performative ability in evoking strong emotions that, although

[26] Leibowitz, Rene. (n.d.) 'The Secret of Maria Callas'. Available at: https://www.rodoni.ch/busoni/callasleibowitz.html (Accessed: 30th October 2020).

are unquantifiable, has defined her career as an exceptional performer. Referring back to Nityabodhananda, this aspect of performance can be realised through the third eye as "other knowledge". It is an experience that is widely known, but for which we have no evidence.

Maud Powell (1867–1920), American virtuoso violinist, was known for her affective communicative abilities during a performance. Karen Shaffer writes in her article, 'Maud Powell, A Pioneer's Legacy', "The direct communicative force of Powell's playing, evident in her recordings, stemmed partly from her experience of taking music to people on and off the beaten track." Shaffer goes on to quote Powell explaining her approach towards performance, "I do not play to them as an artist to the public, but as one human being to another."[27] This approach towards performance is one that amounts to a personal desire and intention to communicate the music. Through the lens of Nityabodhananda's frame, Powell's practice follows an approach that is not based on the presentation of empirical skills and techniques alone. She conveys a primary intention to convey the music in a manner that forges a connection with her audience. And yet, these qualities are not developed in the primary study of a performer. Callas' ability to transmit the transcendental dimension of music to her audience, and Powell's intention to communicate music affectively to her audience are both valuable qualities that performers must develop in their practice. The only way we can achieve this, I believe, is through creating a philosophical framework that discusses the subjective elements in musical performance.

Introducing the subjective elements

The subjective elements I have identified in my initial research include intention, embodiment, and catharsis. Here I will briefly introduce my framing of these elements around which my study has been conducted. This elements will be discussed in further detail, in chapter 6, once all the evidence has been presented.

[27] Shaffer, K.A. (n.d.) 'Maud Powell: A Pioneer's Legacy'. Available at: http://www.musicweb-international.com/classrev/2002/jun02/Maud_Powell.htm (Accessed: 30th October 2020).

Intention: The etymology of the word 'intention' dates back to the 13th-century French word *entent* which was used to describe a 'purpose' or 'goal'.[28] In musical practice, the mental process of intention establishes the purpose of the performer and the desired outcome of their performance. This is the momentum that drives the practice as well as the final performance. In a book considered to be revolutionary in the discourse on intention, Elizabeth Anscombe discusses the mental process of intention as a part of the intended act itself.[29] The understanding of intention is thoroughly explored under various circumstances and in identifying different kinds of intention, resulting in voluntary and (in some cases) involuntary action. Within the context of this study, the concept of intention will be studied as a foundational process that establishes an overarching purpose of performance. So musical practice would begin with the intention which then drives the physique into acting according to the intended purpose.

Embodiment: The topic of embodiment has previously been discussed in fields such as psychology, philosophy, and sports. Influential works on this topic include Raymond W. Gibbs' *Metaphor Interpretation as Embodied Simulation* (2006)[30], and Andy Clark's book *Supersizing the Mind: Embodiment, Action, and Cognitive Extension* (2008)[31]. The study of embodiment has become a significant field within music research, led by the theory that bodily movement is important in our interaction with, and perception of, music. Professor Mark Reybrouck, having studied musicology physical education and physical therapy, is widely known for his research in the field of musical embodiment. He shares his belief that music is an art that is heard and *enacted* rather than imagined and presented.[32] To embody the music, is not only to explore the

[28] Harper, Douglas. (n.d.) *Intent,* Online Etymology Dictionary. Available at: https://www.etymonline.com/word/intent (Accessed: 3rd November 2020).
[29] Anscombe, G. E. M. (2000) *Intention*. United Kingdom: Harvard University Press.
[30] Gibbs, R.W. (2006) 'Metaphor Interpretation as Embodied Simulation', *Mind and Language*, Vol. 21 (issue 3), pp. 434-458. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0017.2006.00285.x (Accessed: 12th January 2021).
[31] Clark, Andy. (2008) *Supersizing the Mind: Embodiment, Action, and Cognitive Extension*. United States: Oxford University Press.
[32] Reybrouck M. (2005) 'Body, Mind and Music: Musical Semantics Between Experiential Cognition and Cognitive Economy', *Transcultural Music Review 9*. Available at: http://www.sibetrans.com/trans/a180/ body-mind-and-music-musical-semantics- between-experiential-cognition-and-cogni-tive-economy (Accessed: 3rd February 2021).

relationship between gesture and sound or presenting the music, but to become the physical representation of the music itself. This embedded knowledge is important in achieving physical autonomy and experiencing freedom to better transmit the music in performance.

Catharsis: Aristotle's use of the term catharsis has most popularly been contextualised in the literary study of tragedy as a form of "tragic pleasure".[33] This "pleasure" is drawn through eliciting emotions such as fear or pity. This experience of catharsis is known to be a deeply personal one that can also be shared communally through performance. Kenneth Burke uses the analogy of guests at a banquet hall partaking in the same food and receiving a similar gratification, but the consumption is through each individual alone. He writes in an article on catharsis:

> The centrality of the nervous system is a *principium individuationis* [italicised by author] whereby, no matter how collective the nature of our symbol-systems and of the socio-political structures that go with them, our pleasures and pains are our own naturally inalienable private property.[34]

Burke suggests that the participation of the body is vital in producing the experience of catharsis. Another interesting take is presented by visual artist, Kieran Milne, in his paper, 'The embodiment of experience: Art as catharsis'. He discusses catharsis through the lens of an artist, and refers to embodiment itself as a cathartic practice.[35] That is to say, that the desire to embody the music manifests through the pursuit of learning more about the individual self. The use of this concept in this research is a result of the communication of music, not only the emotional content, but also the metaphysical presence it contains. This experience occurs within a transcendental

[33] Shahzad, Farrukh. (2018) 'Aristotle's Catharsis: Some Theories', *Journal of Emerging Technologies and Innovative Research*, Vol. 5 (Issue. 6), pp. 277-279.
[34] Burke, Kenneth. (1961) 'Catharsis – Second View', *The Centennial Review*, Vol. 5 (no. 2), pp. 107-132. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/23737483 (Accessed: 12th January 2021).
[35] Milne, (2016) p. 19.

dimension of the music that is sometimes elicited through developing subjective elements such as intention and musical embodiment. The experience of this dimension occurs in the mind of the performer as they, through embodying and immersing themselves in the music, enter a higher level of consciousness affecting "the perception of time and space, of the body, of sensation, and of personal and social experience."[36] As presented with the metaphor of the third eye, it is within this dimension that "other knowledge", or intuitive knowledge is obtained. This transcendental dimension is a step closer to the metaphysical presence in music that Steiner alludes to in his work.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the role of the audience in a musical performance. There is an almost symbiotic relationship between the performer and listener in the environment of a performance. Without the presence of an audience, the role of the performance is meaningless and without a performer the audience serves no function. As the performer takes on the role of the physical representation of the music communicated to an audience, the audience plays the role of receiving the knowledge shared through this symbiotic relationship. Delving into the process and meaning of interaction, Karen Barad's theory of 'agential realism' is useful in understanding such relationships. She believes that individuals do not preexist, "but rather materialise in intra-action."[37] As such, it can be interpreted that through the agency of intra-acting bodies they are assigned meaning. The relationship between performer and listener is forged wherein both sides are affected by the agency of the other. Due to the scope of this research, I will not be able to explore this relationship in further detail. The study will continue to follow the performer and their experience of a musical performance.

[36] Berlant, Arnold. (1999) 'Notes for a Phenomenology of Musical Performance', *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, Vol. 7 (no. 2), pp. 73-79. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/40327138 (Accessed: 13th July 2021).
[37] Barad, Karen. (2007) *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*. United Kingdom, Duke University Press.

Going forward, I will focus on observing the current pedagogical practice and the studying the subjective elements in performance. These have been identified as: intention, musical embodiment and its cathartic communication that occurs within the transcendental dimension of music. I will then present a philosophical framework on this phenomenon of a musical performance using interdisciplinary concepts, in order to broaden the current pedagogical approach and enrich its language.

Chapter 2

Methodology and Rationale

Through this research I will be presenting a philosophical perspective on the transcendental dimension of musical performance and its communication, through varying interdisciplinary concepts. While the current pedagogy of performance seems to focus on skills and techniques necessary to master one's instrument, I wish to redress the underdeveloped knowledge surrounding this, enigmatic yet widely experienced, aspect of music in order to broaden the current pedagogical approach and enrich the language around musical performance. In order to conduct this research, I posed two overarching questions:

1. What are the current approaches towards the performance pedagogy of Western Classical music within institutions around the UK and The Republic of Ireland?

2a. What are the subjective elements within the transcendental dimension during a musical performance?

2b. How can these elements be articulated?

I chose to conduct my investigations in parallel devising two methodologies that reflect the multi-faceted nature of this study. The first part focused on empirical evidence surrounding the current pedagogy of musical performance within renowned institutions in the UK and ROI. The second part was directed based on the anecdotal information that I collected in both the first and second sections. While the overall goal is to create a framework surrounding the subjective elements during a performance, its personal and experiential nature suggested that the data collected could alter the framing and its understanding in this study. The use of interdisciplinary concepts was important as it was evident that while data collected was not always directly related to one another, when cross-referenced, it aided in moulding the understanding of the subjective elements that remain rationally unproven.

1. Current approach towards Western Classical performance

I have employed the use of a mixed-mode methodology in order to answer this question, acknowledging that empirical data alone will not be sufficient in assessing the current pedagogical approach. The practice of music educators may differ significantly, and not be reflected by the syllabi. Hence, I have collected both quantitative and qualitative data. As part of my quantitative research, I have gathered evidence from 5 music institutions on the current pedagogical practice of the undergraduate performance course in the form of syllabi. The institutions I chose were the Royal Birmingham Conservatoire, Royal Academy of Music, Royal College of Music, Royal Irish Academy of Music and Trinity Laban. This approach allowed me to observe the current structure and language used in relation to learning outcomes and key objectives, and laid the grounds for my empirical evidence. I obtained the syllabi through the institutions' official websites on the page for the undergraduate performance course. The aims and objectives were observed to find whether they addressed elements beyond those that mentioned technical mastery and interpretative development of the performer; such as intention, embodiment, the transcendental dimension of music and the experience of catharsis.

In order to corroborate data from the syllabi, I have also created a short questionnaire on Google Forms targeted at undergraduate music students and recent graduates.[38] This is the format of the questionnaire:

1. At which institution did/will you complete your undergraduate studies in music?
2. What was/is the primary focus of your study?
    a. Performance
    b. Composition
    c. Performance and Composition
    d. Musicology
3. During your study, have any of these topics been discussed with teachers or among peers? Select any and all that broadly apply.

[38] Full results available here: Appendix 5. (2021) *Students' Experience Questionnaire.*

a. Embodying the music [the act of being the music and communicating it directly to the audience rather than simply presenting it]
b. Intention with which one might prepare for a musical performance [personal deliberation on the role of the performer]
c. A transcendental dimension of music [a dimension elicited during a performance that one might say "moves" the listener]
d. Experience of intangible elements during the act of performance [things that are felt but cannot be described]
e. An affective performance [a conjunction of intangible elements that elicits a transcendental dimension of the music]
f. None of the above

4. If so, please give a short description of how they were discussed (topics the class/conversation encompassed, and your thoughts on it).

As part of my qualitative research for this section, I have interviewed 4 performers who are also teachers within leading musical institutions, to learn of their experience with the current pedagogical practice. The interviewee's experience and beliefs offered anecdotal insight that to be used in conjunction to the empirical data to answer this question. The questions that I have broadly prepared in order to carry out a semi-structured interview are:

1. In your practice, how do you approach the pedagogy of musical performance?

- What role does the syllabus play in your lesson plans?
- How do you approach the conundrum of the solitary act of practice versus the communal experience of performance?

2. According to the syllabi for this course, the focus of performance pedagogy focuses on the mastery of technique and interpretation. Do you find yourself following what is outlined in the syllabus <u>in</u> your practice?

- Are there elements that you have brought in that are not reflected in the syllabus, if so, what are they and how do you discuss them?

3. I am exploring four concepts in my research, and I would like to know whether these are discussed in your practice, and how you might approach them: intention, embodiment and transcendence of music, and a communicative performance

- Do you think these are worth addressing within the pedagogy of musical performance?

2a. Creating a philosophical framework

This first part of the second section was addressed through semi-structured interviews with the same 4 professional performers as the previous section. I wished to interview professional performers well into their careers (having developed their own personal practice and approach towards the art of musical performance) who have trained and practiced primarily within the United Kingdom and the Republic of Ireland. I chose a semi-structured format for the interview as I intended to facilitate a discussion on the pedagogical practice of the interviewee while addressing the phenomenon of the transcendental dimension of performance. Through collecting experiential data during these interviews, I was also able to identify and compare their accounts on subjective elements.

Initially introducing the topic and concepts on which I hoped hear their perspective (that of intention, embodiment, cathartic communication, and the transcendental dimension of music), I refrained from leading questions and allowed the conversation to unravel organically. Similar to the interviews with music educators, I also wanted to hear the performers' perspective on their mindset during practice and while on stage. The questions I framed in order to facilitate a discussion on the experience of an affective performance are:

1a. What is your approach in preparing for a performance?

- What are the initial aims when picking up a piece of music, and what are the aims that follow once these objectives have been met?
- The change in mindset from practice as a solitary act towards the communal experience of performance?

1b. How would you describe the experience of performance?

- This moment that the preparation has led to, what is in the foreground of thought during the act of performance?

2. I am exploring four concepts in my research, and I would like to know what your thoughts:

- The first is intention; what role do you think it plays in preparing for a performance
- The next is the embodiment of music, what are your thoughts on this concept and how do you think one can approach such an idea
- Now I would like to discuss this idea of a transcendental aspect in music; are there any lived experiences that you might be able to share
- Finally, I want to address the communicative capability of a musical performance; one that transmits not only the sounds, but also the previously discussed transcendental dimension of the music

3. Are these ideas that you have discussed in relation to performance, either during your studies or your professional career? If so, how were they addressed and do you find these worth pondering in your practice?

This information collected was transcribed and studied with regard to commonalities in experience and language that the participants used in order to articulate this phenomenon. Initially assessing whether the performers had indeed experienced such a phenomenon, and then further understanding their practice and how they have discussed their experiences. The reason why this is an important step in my research is because I am attempting to develop a philosophical framework that may be a useful pedagogic tool addressing a phenomenon that is personally experienced.

2b. Discussing the subjective elements

This second part of this section worked towards creating a framework through various texts and resources. Since the phenomenon that I am attempting to address is a highly subjective experience, I used interdisciplinary theories that will allow me to

convey and further support the understanding of the transcendental dimension of musical performance. While the literature surrounding the topic of performance and its pedagogy is extensive, there are few works that attempt to address this particular area of a musical performance. Therefore, this final step presents a philosophical framework using these concepts commensurate with the experience of the transcendental dimension during a musical performance, encompassing the subjective elements experienced during this phenomenon through extrapolating information from the interviewees' experiences juxtaposed with interdisciplinary theories collected throughout the study.

Chapter 3

Current Pedagogical Approach

The development of instrumental and vocal technique has been the primary focus in the study of a performer for centuries. Empirical knowledge of one's own instrument and the development of technical skill is considered a vital foundation in learning the art of performance, and it remains the dominant pedagogical approach. From the 17th and 18th century onwards, throughout the West, treatises emerged on the art of playing various instruments, focusing primarily on the theoretical and practical knowledge of instruments.[39] The dominance of this empirical approach, owed to various social, cultural, economic and political factors, has influenced our current knowledge and study of musical performance.[40]

Returning to John Rink's influential book, *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding,* Janet Ritterman (1941–) writes a chapter on the history and influence of current performance pedagogy -with a focus on piano and violin literature.[41] In the opening of the chapter Ritterman quotes C.P.E. Bach from his treatise on keyboard playing which reads, "Play from the soul, not like a trained bird."[42] We see this distinction highlighted throughout the chapter between a performance that is

[39] See Bassini, Carlo. (2008) *Bassini's Art of Singing: An Analytical, Physiological and Practical System for the Cultivation of the Voice.* United States: Plural Pub.
Bassini first published the treatise in 1857 paving the way for the bel canto style.
Gunn, John, Haydn, J., and Handel, G.F. (1789) *The Theory and Practice of Fingering the Violoncello: Containing Rules and Progressive Lessons for attaining the Knowledge and Compass of the While compass of the Instrument.* United Kingdom: Author.
Quantz, J.J. trans. E. Reilly. (1966) *On Playing the Flute*. London: Faber & Faber.
[40] Rink, John (ed.). (2002) *Musical Performance: A Guide to* Understanding. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
Golby, David J. (2004) *Instrumental Teaching in Nineteenth-Century Britain.* England: Ashgate Publishing Limited.
[41] Dame Janet Elizabeth Ritterman is a renowned pedagogue of performance studies having worked at Middlesex University, Goldsmiths (University of London), and Darington College of Arts. She was then the Director of the Royal of College of Music and Professor at the University of Plymouth. Between 1993 and 2005, Ritterman established and is first chair of Conservatories UK, that leads higher education in arts.
[42] Bach, C.P.E. (1753). Trans. and ed. Mitchell, W.J. (1949) *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments [Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen].* London: Eulenberg. p. 150

technically sound and one that is communicated through the embodiment of music. Yet, she believes that this widely experienced phenomenon seems to be largely overlooked for centuries within influential treatises and performance courses. Ritterman highlights the insufficiencies in earlier treatises which, she believes, were quite brief, and focused "mainly on rudiments of theory and basic technique."[43] While some treatises made passing remarks regarding the importance of expression and musical communication, she believes that it did not elaborate on how such skills might be developed and incorporated in a performer's study. She also states that the study of style and interpretation was developed as a means to produce more expressive performances as a reaction to a practice that focused solely on technical development.[44] She also presents the concept of "*Fine style* [italicised by author]", as advanced by Louis Spohr (1784-1859), as a subjective element that emerged in the 19th century as a reaction to a largely objective practice. It is to be acknowledged that some treatises discuss subjective aspects of performance, incorporating it in their practice, not just as a reaction to the approach of the time.

Contrary to Ritterman's assertion, Spohr's practice significantly contributed towards the study of subjective elements in musical performance. He believed that a performer must be "capable of intellectually animating the subjective so that the hearer may discover and participate in the intentions of the composer".[45] Rather than being an alternative to the dominant approach of time, Spohr presented this subjective aspect of performance as a vital addition in approaching a performance. He designed a violin treatise that followed both the objective and subjective aspects of performance, a work that was influential in the development of nineteenth-century approach towards performance and in pioneering a new approach towards performance. Spohr himself believed in, and adopted the practice of, penetrating "into the spirit of the

[43] Ritterman, Janet. (2002) 'On Teaching Performance', in John Rink (ed.) *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 75.
[44] Ibid., p. 81.
[45] Spohr, Louis. (n.d.) *Grand Violin School.* Trans. Rodolphus, C. London: Wessel and Co., p. 179.

composition".[46] Martin Wulfhorst, in his article on Spohr's novel performance style writes about the difference between the existing style and the approach presented by Spohr. He observes that the "first" music style, which was predominant at the time, saw virtuosity as a goal in public performances while the second style, as Spohr developed it, used virtuosity as a means presenting the "spirit" of the music and the composer's intention. A similar style that emerged towards the end of the 19th century is the ideal of *werktreue*, put forth by E.T.A. Hoffmann, that every musical work has a "real meaning" that must be realised through performance.[47] Spohr's work was revolutionary for his time as he encouraged discourse around the practice of bringing a composition "to life".[48] He also believed in certain objective aspects such as the value of "correct" performances, where the performer was prescribed an interpretation and had to carefully prepare the articulation and fingerings as presented by the composer and through historical study. Unfortunately, this is the aspect that seems to have been inherited by modern institutions. Although the practice of realising the composer's intentions, embodying the essence of the music and realising the "spirit" of the work are all ideas that emerged in early treatises, they are not as widely recognised as the objective elements in current institutions. Today, as Ritterman has observed it, the predominance of the objective elements, of "correct" ways of interpreting and realising the music, has overshadowed the subjective elements. While her view on early treatises does not reveal the whole picture, there are certain similarities that can be observed in conjunction with the current pedagogy of musical performance.

Upon a brief examination of another influential treatise written by Manuel Garcia (1805—1906), a Spanish singer and vocal pedagogue, this predominantly empirical approach is further exemplified. This vocal treatise titled, *Treatise on the Art of Singing* is predominantly a scientific study on the production of the voice, and how a student

[46] Wulfhorst, Martin. (1998) 'Louis Spohr and the Modern Concept of Performance', *Das Orchester*, 46/7-8, pp. 2-9, Available at: http://www.spohr-society.org.uk/Spohr_Journal_25_1998_p2_Wulfhorst_Spohr_Modern_concept%20_of_Performance-2.pdf (Accessed 5th November 2021).
[47] Goehr, Lydia. (1992) *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*. New York: Oxford University Press, p. 232.
[48] Wulfhorst, (1998).

might develop their technique in the *bel canto* style. An interesting sight on the illustrated front page is a note that reads, "As used at the Royal Academy of Music, Royal College of Music, Guildhall School of Music and all the principal colleges in the United Kingdom".[49] As a professor of vocal studies in the Royal Academy of Music himself, Manuel Garcia was a major influence in the development of vocal pedagogy in institutions around the United Kingdom. An early chapter titled 'Qualifications of the Pupil' is the first consideration of a more intellectual involvement from the student. The initial requirements are a love of music, an ability to sing in tune and to memorise melodies and harmonies, along with the possession of a good voice and healthy constitution. Garcia then strongly rejects the misconception that simply because these requirements are met, a singer might be successful. Instead, he says:

> A singer who has no knowledge of the means by which vocal effects are produced, and of the intricacies of the art he professes, is merely the slave of routine, and will never become great and distinguished in his profession.[50]

Although Garcia alludes to a subjective aspect of performance, since it has not been further developed, once again, the objective aspects have dominated the field of performance.

Within the treatise, we once again come close to discussing the subjective under the chapter, 'On Expression Added to Melody'. Garcia opens with the statement that "Expression is the great law of all art"[51], and that attempts to affect the audience are in vain if the performer lacked expressive abilities. He calls on the performer to fulfil their role in realising the emotional content of the music and convey it to the audience as naturally as possible. The route he takes in doing this is, of course, an empirical study of the score and musical elements such as "*timbre* [italicised by author], accent,

[49] Garcia, Manuel, trans. by Garcia, Albert. (1924) *Garcia's Treatise on the Art of Singing*. London: Leonard & Co.
[50] Ibid, p. 4.
[51] Ibid, p. 63.

modulation of the voice [and so on...]".[52] I do not wish to criticise Garcia's approach here. On the contrary, I believe that this is a necessary step in preparing for a performance. But as with the development of technique, I believe empirical modes of enquiry lay a strong foundation for the performer to then explore the subjective topics that surround musical performance. In the same way Spohr presented the subjective elements in addition to the existing approach, one that utilises both the objective and subjective elements, I believe, further enriches the performer's knowledge and encourages personal growth. Based on my experience as a performer and in my research into the subjective elements, I aim to go beyond the reach of scientific knowledge in the study of musical performance. Integrating subjective aspects of performance is precisely the discussion I aim to facilitate in this research, and this sentiment continues to echo through the writings of many within the field of music. Its subjective and experiential nature is a challenge to this day, and the popularity of evidence-based research also presents a challenge when in discussions of the transcendental in music.

Returning to Janet Ritterman's research on the current pedagogy of performance, she observes the rise of conservatories in the 19th century as an important influence in promoting a nationalised system of higher education which led to a predominantly objective approach to musical performance. The increased demand among the middle class to pursue a higher education meant that these institutions needed a more efficient system in the education and certification of musicians and teachers. Ritterman writes that, "it was the new conservatories that exerted most influence on the gradual systemisation of performance teaching at an advanced level...The need to establish systems and standards of performance teaching led in Paris to the publication of a series of method books."[53] As seen in the treatise written during this period on the voice, these instrumental "method books" were of a similar composition. The trends of scientific study in music was also on the rise during this period, and David Golby presents a theory that is rooted in existing gender disparity

[52] Ibid, p. 63.
[53] Ritterman, (2002) p. 78.

of the time. These perspectives offer insight into the socio-cultural aspects that might have affected the rise of institutionalisation and scientific methods of studying music, such as the gradations of occupation according to gender and class.

> The practical, 'mechanical' [manual performing skills of artisans] aspects of the art usefully occupied the time of ladies who could then 'cash in' these skills when seeking a husband, whereas the gentleman, perceiving such skills to be below them and of little material worth, sought a self-consciously erudite, 'scientific' approach...
>
> ...Gentlemen of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries...could buy in to the pioneering scientific spirit of the times and develop their musical interests through the study of harmony and counterpoint...Naturally the art of performance, with its human and subjective bias, and the performer himself were considered of a much lower status in comparison.[54]

Through this account we begin to see the complexity that surrounds the rise of a more objective approach in the pedagogy of musical performance. The enigmatic nature of the subjective elements in music, the focus of early teachings on the objective study of instruments, the increased demand for higher education and the establishment of nationalised schools in the 18th and 19th centuries and social and cultural factors such the disparity in gender and class have all contributed to the current pedagogical approach towards performance. This is not to say that there has not been an attempt in discussing the subjective elements, but this has not been developed to the same extent as the objective study of music; for example, musical interpretation.

Over time, the subjective aspect of interpretation has developed within institutions to prescribe "correct" performances. Janet Ritterman addresses this as a challenge faced in seizing the performer's "creative freedom" when interpreting musical works:

[54] Golby, David J. (2004). *Instrumental Teaching in Nineteenth-Century Britain.* England: Ashgate Publishing Limited. p. 50-52.

> All too often it has tended to encourage the belief that the score should be interpreted literally...The obligation to be individually responsive to the spirit of the work...has all too readily...been overtaken by a misplaced belief that conformity to the letter of the score offers security against critical challenge.[55]

This means that performers themselves prefer the mastery of instrumental technique and skill, and produce performances where creativity is perceived to be stifled. Examination systems and performance assessment criteria also contribute to the normalisation of this trend.[56] The constructive outcome of this practice is highlighted by Ralf Krampe and K. Anders Ericsson in their chapter on 'Deliberate Practice and Elite Music Performance' in *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation* (1995). They present the case of Tchaikovsky's Violin Concerto, which is now standard repertoire among performers but was, at the time of its publication, deemed unplayable. "As musical technique and training methods have become increasingly refined, the standards required for elite performance have risen commensurately."[57] The "refinement" in this context is towards the development of impeccable technique. This has influenced the standards for professional performances creating expectations for young students to fulfil.

Addressing this misplaced belief of a "correct" interpretation and the dominance of technical mastery, Ritterman turns to the critique of violinist Duncan Druce (1939–2015) who presents a rather dogmatic view on the matter. In the *Companion to Contemporary Musical Thought Volume 2* (1992), Druce shares that while modern performances are far clearer and more accurate, they tend to lack in personality.[58]

---

[55] Ritterman, (2002) p. 83.
[56] Ibid, p. 83.
[57] Ericsson, K.A. and R.T. Krampe. (1995) 'Deliberate Practice and Elite Music Performance' in John Rink (ed.) *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation*. London: Yale University Press.
[58] Druce, Duncan, John Paynter, Tim Howell, Richard Orton and Peter Seymour (eds.). (1992) 'Historical Approaches to Violin Playing', *Companion to Contemporary Musical Thought*. London and New York: Routledge. p. 1013.

Looking back at famed violinists, Druce laments the fate of musical performance within the current tradition:

> The move towards performances that are accurate, rather than unpredictable, sumptuous, rather than individual and communicative, is part of a general and gradual decline in the creative role of the performer.[59]

According to Druce, the rise of recording technology and its permanence is a significant factor in the quest for technically and stylistically "correct" performances. Although this remains a dogmatic view on the matter, aside from the fact that we still see performers of high calibre all around the world, the perception that there is a missing element in musical performance seems to be clear in the writings of these individuals. While the development of skills and technical abilities has been a priority throughout the history of performance practice, the increased institutionalisation aimed at professionalising its pedagogy might have led to a more objective understanding of performance. In today's time, Mine Doğantan-Dack writes that live-performance itself is an under-researched area of study in contemporary music studies, as recorded materials are being prioritised as primary sources.[60] She sees the study of live-performance, the objective and subjective aspects, to be an area of study that has only begun to emerge through the rise of fields such as Practice as Research.

These views further the idea that while musical training and technical development are the undisputed foundation of performance studies, there is more to the art of performance which has been widely ignored due to its subjective experiential nature. The reason why I chose to conduct an observation into the pedagogy of musical performance is because it informs and directs the practice of the performer themselves. In the undergraduate study of the modern performer, without doubt, the

[59] Ibid.
[60] Doğantan -Dack, M. (2012) ' The art of research in live music performance', *Music Performance Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 34-48. Available at: http://mpronline.net/Issues/Dogantan-Dack%20FINAL%20120311.pdf (Accessed: 15th July 2021).

technical refinement and musical knowledge is the foundation upon which musical works may be interpreted and presented. However, a predominantly objective practice might not allow the performer to fully realise their creative role while receiving a well-rounded study.

As mentioned before, the act of performance has been a thrilling experience for me throughout my years as a student. A battle between nervousness, to present a technically precise performance, and excitement, to communicate the music that I had worked on intimately for months. In the end, I have noticed for myself, that the extent of my preparation usually determines the quality of the final performance. While continuing to hope that nervousness does not win out, I want to address what happens in performances where I let myself be absorbed by the music that I am presenting. When I am able to fuel the adrenaline to further engage in the music and deliver my technical and interpretative preparation, it is almost like breaking down the walls of technical and external expectations that I have built for myself. Then the music is able to flow through and be shared affectively with my audience. The experience of such a performance, where the music is communicated affectively and how I might achieve this as a performer are topics that have unfortunately, not been discussed in my undergraduate study. This is my intention in gathering and observing the undergraduate performance syllabi, to highlight its predominantly objective approach.

Today performance pedagogy has certainly widened its scope. It has developed and reformed its practice incorporating expression and interpretation as vital tools often taught in conjunction with technique. Yet, based on my findings, it appears that within the current syllabi there are still levels of rigidity with some of the pedagogical practices following the national systemisation of its instruction in the UK and the ROI. The prevalence of an objective pedagogical approach that might not address the more experiential and subjective elements is what I am referring to as rigidity, and I have observed this in varying levels within the syllabi.

A Closer Look at the Syllabi

For the purposes of this research, I have collected the undergraduate performance syllabi from 5 institutions: Royal Academy of Music (London), Birmingham Conservatoire, Trinity College London, Guildhall School of Music (London), and Royal Irish Academy of Music (Dublin). Here I would like to acknowledge that the syllabi does not reflect the course entirely, and that teachers develop their own style of teaching that may vary from the broad overview of the course structure presented in the syllabi. Hence I have also drafted up questionnaires for students in these institutions to gauge the extent to which the topic of an affective performance was discussed in their undergraduate education. This is to gain insight into whether their personal experience, working closely with their teacher on a performance course, reflects the data gathered from the syllabi. These two sets of data will provide well rounded empirical evidence on the current approach to the pedagogy of performance within institutions in the UK and ROI.

As I have mentioned before, the development of technical skill and musical knowledge are the foundations in the primary study of a performer, and this is reflected in the syllabi that I have collected. Most of the institutions chosen as part of this research describe their course as one that aims to develop technique and musical knowledge.[61] This data reflects the structure of higher education in the UK and ROI under the National Qualification Frameworks and Irish National Framework of Qualifications. These guides define the broad learning outcomes for different levels of education in the form of a tiered system from high school diploma to PhD/DPhil. This systemisation of music education across the UK and ROI is also reflected in the syllabi. The institutions within the UK offers one a Level 6 qualification for the undergraduate study, while in the ROI offers a Level 8 qualification upon completion of a BA/BMus programme.

[61] See Table 1.

Institution	Aim
Birmingham Conservatoire	"At the heart of our programme's philosophy is the ideal of the informed musician, someone who is able to combine both advanced skills and musical knowledge in the advancement of their musical career."[62]
Royal Academy of Music	"Development of high technical and musical standards in performance"[63]
Royal Irish Academy of Music	"To train and develop students to the highest professional performance level"[64]
Trinity Laban	"Aims to equip students with necessary musical skills and knowledge required by the contemporary profession"[65]
Guildhall School of Music	"Develop to professional standard each student's abilities as a practical musician"[66]

Table 1

It may be due to this formal structure that I have observed a predominantly objective approach towards the practice of performance in the syllabi. By objective approach I am referring to the prominence of rational and tangibly observed elements. An example is presented under the 'Intended Learning Outcomes' in the syllabi from the Royal Academy of Music. The knowledge they encourage their students to acquire upon completion of the course according to the NQF benchmark includes: technical

[62] Birmingham Conservatoire (2020-2021). 'BMus Hons' *Course Specifications*. Available at: https://www.birmingham.ac.uk/undergraduate/courses/music/music.aspx#TeachingAndAssessmentTab (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
[63] Royal Academy of Music, (2020-2021).
[64] Royal Irish Academy of Music, (2020-2021).
[65] Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance (2020-2021). *Programme Specification.* Available at: https://www.trinitylaban.ac.uk/study/music/ (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
[66] Guildhall School of Music (2020-2021). *BMus Programme & module specifications & assessment criteria for 2020/21*. Available at: https://www.gsmd.ac.uk/music/courses/undergraduate/bachelor_of_music_honours_degree.html (Accessed: 10th October 2020).

and musical skills, performance traditions, styles and interpretative strategies, traditions of historical contexts and current developments, the relationship between historical, theoretical and critical study, and principles of musical pedagogy. Whilst acknowledging these to be important skills and valuable knowledge that must continue to be taught to performance students, the matter in contention is not what has been mentioned, rather what is missing.

Let us consider the more subjective topics mentioned by the musicologists, teachers and performers earlier such as: expression and musical communication (Ritterman), emotional communication (Lang), creative role of the performer (Druce). And to this I would like to add the following emerging terms within the field of music that I have collected through researching the subjective elements of performance: the embodiment of music,[67] and the transcendental dimension of music.[68] These terms have been used in the context of recognising a gap in the approach towards performance pedagogy and the delivery of musical performance. Following my observation of topics that have not been mentioned in the syllabi, I have used these 5 topics as a lens through which I conducted my analysis. I went through each institution's 'Learning Outcomes' looking for these terms, or similar phrases that might allude to the same.

For the purpose of presenting data in a more clear and concise manner, I have accumulated all the 'Learning Outcomes' from the 5 syllabi that I collected to a tally of 73 in total. Out of the 73 collective learning aims that I have assessed, not one of the points have used the terms: 'embodiment', 'transcendental dimension', and 'creative role'.[69] The term 'communicate' is used most often in contexts relating to musical communication 3 times out of the 73, while 'musical expression' is discussed 2 times and emotional expression is mentioned 1 time. As for points that allude to the topics

[67] Matyja, JR (2010). 'Embodied Music Cognition', University of Edinburgh. https://era.ed.ac.uk/bitstream/handle/1842/5325/PRACA.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y (Accessed: 30th May 2021).
[68] Steiner, (1989).
[69] See Table 2.

I have chosen, the transcendental dimension does not appear to be discussed at all, while the embodiment of music has been loosely referred to 1 time.

Communicate	• "Communicate a strong artistic vision, supported by a sound technique and effective rehearsal strategies"[70] • "the ability to apply skills of communication and presentation appropriate for a wide range of professional demands"[71] • "The ability to devise, sustain and communicate ideas and concepts"[72]
Musical Expression	• "Individual musical personality and artistry in a variety of musical domains supported by a secure level of skill"[73] • "Demonstrate the technical and creative skills required by the performer, composer or music technologist to convey personal expression and imagination in their professional practice"[74]
Emotional expression	• "Progress each student's personal and artistic development through the integration of the physical, emotional and intellectual aspects of music making."[75]
Creative Role	• "Demonstrate intellectual and creative curiosity in the development of a professional career pathway"[76]
Embodiment of music	• "Progress each student's personal and artistic development through the integration of the physical, emotional and intellectual aspects of music making."[77]
Transcendental dimension of music	

Table 2

[70] Royal Irish Academy of Music, (2020-2021).
[71] Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance, (2020-2021).
[72] Ibid.
[73] Ibid.
[74] Birmingham Conservatoire, (2020-2021).
[75] Guildhall School of Music, (2020-2021).
[76] Birmingham Conservatoire, (2020-2021).
[77] Guildhall School of Music, (2020-2021).

These are 8 out of the 73 'Learning Outcomes' that broadly relate to musical performance and its less objective elements. The study of historic styles of music within the Western Classical tradition can be categorised as predominantly objective reflecting its manner of research. On such topics, what one looks for is data that is factual and reliable based on tangible evidence. Questions such as how, what and when are also deemed reliable when they have been widely discussed and these are accessible to students in the form of textbooks, musical hand-guides, and research papers. Unfortunately, discussions on the topics of demonstrating intellectual and creative curiosity, emotional expression, and the transcendental dimension are not as prevalent, and so the answers are not as readily available. These areas of study are less objective in the sense that they are not easily quantified or assessed through the collection of tangible evidence. Although they are widely experienced, the language in the syllabi pertaining to these topics remain underdeveloped. The current approach towards undergraduate performance study has, without doubt, resulted in the rise of highly skilled performers; many of whom, intentionally or unintentionally, go beyond the elements of technique and interpretation.

This is what I believe to be the result of an aspect of music that is highly subjective and experiential. These elements lay outside the objective approach prevalent in the current pedagogy. As briefly introduced earlier, topics such as the development of intention, the embodiment of music that aids in its cathartic communication and the transcendental dimension of music that may be elicited during a performance. Aside from the commonality of being subjective topics, they also share the difficulty and possible inability of articulation. Addressing these elements of musical performance within institutions, the emotional in conjunction with the physical and intellectual, is a starting point in accepting them as vital tools with which one might enrich their musical knowledge.

Students and teachers on the current pedagogical approach

As mentioned before, the syllabi has presented only one part of the evidence. This evidence cannot suggest that these topics are not at all being discussed in the study of a performer, but from what has been observed, one does not come across such areas of study in classes that follow the formal structure of the syllabi. The practice that different teachers adopt is not reflected in the syllabi either, but students might experience discussions that take place in private lessons, or more informal settings. In order to corroborate this data, I sent out questionnaires to undergraduate music students and recent graduates. This is the information I hoped to achieve through an open-ended questionnaire.[78]

The data from 6 responses shows that 50% of students were first study performers. Going through the list of topics posed in Q3, the most commonly discussed topic was the embodiment of music with a count of 4 checks. The topic of intention also received 4 checks, the transcendental dimension of music was next with 2 checks, and finally the last two received 1 check each. None of the individuals checked the option "None of the above". While it is interesting to see that students have been exposed to these more experiential subjective areas of study, the written responses present the context within which these discussions took place.

Most of the responses to the final question, to provide a short description of how those topics they had selected were discussed, state directly or indirectly that these discussions took place in a more intimate settings between teacher and student/small group of students. One student shared that she had come across the topics of embodiment, the transcendental dimension of music and the intangibles that are felt during a performance: "They were discussed one on one with my cello tutor. We practised and discussed a lot of the emotions the composer would want to convey and how we could show that to the audience." This is an interesting piece of evidence that

[78] Appendix 5. (2021) *Students' Experiences Questionnaire.*

shows us that although these topics have not been mentioned in the syllabi, individual teachers have attempted to share this knowledge with their students. However these are as brief conversations during a more personalised class. So, the teachers themselves possibly believe that the current outline presented in the syllabi is limited, and that there are elements worth discussing that have not been previously considered within the structure of performance courses. Unfortunately, the desire for change, to further enrich the predominantly objective approach, is not yet widespread in institutions and thus we do not discuss these elements as part of the integral structure of performance courses.

The final part of my methodology in this section was to interview performance teachers in order to achieve a comprehensive view of the current approach towards performance pedagogy. The 4 performance teachers that I have interviewed are saxophonist Kenneth Edge, guitarist Smaro Gregoriadou, soprano Sylvia O'Brien and soprano Patricia Rozario.[79] The experiences of these interviewees are invaluable to my research as they are professional performers as well as performance teachers who have trained and/or are teachers at institutions within the UK and ROI. Rozario teaches at the Royal College of Music (RCM) and Trinity Laban, O'Brien and Edge teach at the Royal Irish Academy of Music (ROI), and Gregoriadou studied at a few institutions in the UK and now teaches privately having developed a unique pedagogic framework she calls 'Inclusive Interpretation and Functional Technique'. Following the quantitative evidence presented above, in this section I will present the interviewees' insights into the current pedagogical approach in order to further my assertion regarding a structural rigidity within the current performance courses.

Within the syllabi, the absence of more subjective experiential elements of performance has been highlighted. The courses that did include topics of emotional expression and communication were still dominated by the development of

[79] Full interview transcript in appendix, no. 1-4 in the following order: Edge, Gregoriadou, O'Brien and Rozario.

technique, objective musical studies and interpretation. Yet, according to the students, there are some topics that have been discussed informally or privately in individual lessons. All the interviewees have said that they do engage in formal and informal discussions on subjective topics, outside the syllabi, in their pedagogy. They all possess a drive to explore the effects of music going beyond the objective study of performance, which is what they experienced during their study as young performers.

Gregoriadou shares her thoughts on the current practice of performance pedagogy as the experience that inspired her to develop her own practice. Her approach is unique in that it is rooted in the embodiment of the music and musical expression in the communication of music to the listener. During her musical education in various institutions around Europe, Gregoriadou shares that she experienced a "void" in her playing; a yearning beyond the traditional practice for further physical and emotional involvement in her performance. I believe this is a result of the objectivity evidenced in the syllabi that technique and interpretation are the dominant elements that students are encouraged to develop and on which they are assessed. This is the that "void" that Gregoriadou alludes to in her account. It is this experience that led her to develop a unique practice built on the foundations of embodiment:

> I started to observe things in the education programmes, I mean, universal educational programmes. I saw that most of the music schools and universities, they see the student as a machine to play fast and loud —and I could see that in myself as well, and my fellow musicians… We created a good surface: our technical abilities, with temperament, we used style, but [there] was a void [behind this approach towards performance]. So, gradually, I realised the importance of embodiment.[80]

What Gregoriadou's account offers here is anecdotal evidence of the pedagogic elements developed in performance courses during her study. They are, as she recounts, technical ability (instrumental skill), temperament (development of aural

[80] Appendix 2. (2021) *Interview with Smaro Gregoriadou*, p. 116.

skill) and style (historical knowledge surrounding the music's composition and performance) —elements that fall within the pillars of technique and interpretation.[81]

Needless to say, Gregoriadou is not the only one who has experienced this physical and emotional void in performance. Kenneth Edge, leading Irish saxophonist and performance teacher at the Royal Irish Academy of Music, shares a similar experience when asked whether these more subjective experiential areas of performance were discussed throughout his study. "Yeah, none of this. The early years of learning were very much geared towards things like… 'there's an exam coming up, this is the repertoire, do this and try and pass.' You know, everything is kind of goal focused."[82] This goal-oriented objective practice, he believes, seems to be relatively unchanged within today's institutions. As we have seen from the syllabi, although courses are more focused on the individual development of each student, the study is examination-led which follows more objective methods of assessment.

Following the discussion on the structural objectivity within the syllabi, in our interview, Edge describes a contrast between the objective and subjective elements, as he observes it, in the study of a performer:

> I mean, the pedagogy, just physically teaching an instrument is pretty straightforward. All of those correct things, correct technique, I mean, it's not straightforward, but it's something that can be quantified. And they are the things that are easy to teach. The more subjective things, I would imagine they come through offering some sort of inspiration, for want of a better word, inspiration or insight of thinking about the music.[83]

[81] The details of her pedagogical practice, of embodiment and other topic areas as described by the interviewees will be discussed in the following chapter.
[82] Appendix 1. (2021) *Interview with Kenneth Edge,* p. 109.
[83] Ibid., p. 107.

The teaching of technique can be taught following the "correct" approach following the rise of objective knowledge. It is a task that is deemed simplistic due to its quantifiable approach. Since the elements that remain part of the subjective experience of performance are not quantifiable, it remains a largely underdeveloped field in performance pedagogy.

Sylvia O'Brien recognises this "void" in the pedagogical structure, but extends the responsibility to students who must demonstrate the drive to express themselves through their instrument. She believes that if a student is only concerned with technical skill, then "maybe it's not the vessel for you. Maybe something else is the vessel for you to express what you want to express, maybe this isn't it."[84] Albeit a strong judgement, O'Brien is encouraging students to make more conscious decisions based on their own subjective reality in their study. To focus only on the tangible elements during practice is more straightforward than dealing with the more intangible elements. Even for teachers, Edge says, teaching technique and interpretation is a more straightforward task. As for the more subjective elements, "thinking about why you are playing the music you're playing, why you've chosen this piece, what do you think of this piece? Some of my students, they would just play a piece because it is part of the canon…they just learn it."[85]

O'Brien's approach does not seem too strong when the context is that she is simply attempting to build more conscious performers. Not just performers who are technically able to perform standard repertoire, but performers who make decisions during their practice that demonstrate an awareness of the intangibles, and not work on performing a piece of music, but also on how to deliver it with purpose and intention.

[84] Appendix 3. (2021) *Interview with Sylvia O'Brien*, p. 138.
[85] Appendix 1, (2021) p. 107.

An interesting aspect the interviews highlighted is that the participants all believe that the scope of research within academic circles is far wider today. In many ways their participation in this research and practice itself is proof that topics relating to personal experience during a performance are being brought to light. For example, Edge having completed his PhD recently believes that the research undertaken today allows for more auto-ethnographic methodologies. He says, "I think performers were the subject of research previously and now performers are actually doing the research. And it's far more relevant to actual performance… it's been maybe only 20 years now that performers have been really doing research."[86] Implementing a Practice as Research mode of inquiry for his thesis, Edge believes that with the rise of such methods of study, more performers are getting involved in exploring previously enigmatic topics —one example is the recent rise in the study of 'embodiment' in the field of music.

The fields of practice-based and practice-led research are fairly recent fields of study within the Creative Arts.[87] This information is important to acknowledge as a significant contributor to the underdeveloped language that surrounds these experiential topics. The data that has been collected on topics, such as intention, embodiment, or the transcendental dimension of music, and the language that surrounds them may not be sufficient enough for institutions to adopt in their pedagogical structure. My scope with this research is also quite narrow in many ways, but it aims to be a step in the direction of further understanding and articulating the more experiential and subjective elements of musical performance.

[86] Ibid., p. 112.
[87] Candy, L. and Edmonds, E.A. (2018) 'Practice-Based Research in the Creative Arts: Foundations and Futures from the Front Line', *Leonardo*, Volume 51, Issue 1, February, pp 63-69. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Linda-Candy/publication/323006917_Practice-Based_Research_in_the_Creative_Arts_Foundations_and_Futures_from_the_Front_Line/links/5a7c3322a6fdcc77cd271ab4/Practice-Based-Research-in-the-Creative-Arts-Foundations-and-Futures-from-the-Front-Line.pdf (Accessed: 10th October 2021).

Another aspect to acknowledge is that one might believe these topics to be part of an inner experience, of a personal nature, that cannot be shared with another individual. This is the experience that Rozario shares:

> You know...it is something you discover as you progress and as you gain experience you get little illuminations. I don't think, you know, talking about it isn't doing it. Now, here when I say something you connect with it, because you have experienced it. If you haven't experienced it, you wouldn't be able to comprehend it. It would be like something odd…I have never really sat down and talked about it because I feel it is quite intangible. It's something that you connect with and these sparks occur in performance that illuminate your mind as you perform and allows you to go that bit further to connect with the audience… And I think that is the exciting thing about being a performer. One can't talk about it too much because you can't teach it to anybody.[88]

The intangible nature that surrounds the phenomenon of an affective performance is challenging, and it is understandably so. The magic that Rozario has described, the sparks that offer illumination to the mind that allows for a significant connection with the audience, is a thrilling yet complex experience. There is a level of curiosity that the performer must display, as is implied by Rozario, that is vital in order to experience the intangible elements during the phenomenon of musical performance. She also mentions that, "as a performer one is really open to things that suggest themselves to you",[89] implying that while we might attempt to articulate this phenomenon, the most significant knowledge is gained through the act of performance itself.

While I agree that this experience might be one that cannot be discussed directly, I also share Edge's belief that, "all those subjective things, they can't be discussed but aspects of it can."[90] Based on my experience, knowledge of this phenomenon is surely

[88] Appendix 4. (2021) *Interview with Patricia Rozario*, p. 147.
[89] Ibid., p. 146.
[90] Appendix 1, (2021) p. 107.

gained through experiencing it first-hand, but without being able to share and discuss these elements of performance, we will not be able to further develop our understanding on the phenomenon of an affective performance. Yet, as a result of the various factors discussed in this chapter, the more subjective elements are observed to be missing within the syllabi in current institutions. Although there is a will among teachers and students to go beyond the technical requirements, this drive is often faced with the difficulty in finding the language that can facilitate a discussion into the subjective. This is a significant hurdle as we delve further in to the study. Therefore, it remains imperative to my research to redress the linguistic insufficiency surrounding the more subjective topics and create a framework through which this phenomenon might be articulated.

Chapter 4

The Barrier of Language

Oh word, thou word that I lack.[91]

The primary barrier in this research is the insufficient language that surrounds the more experiential aspects of musical performance. As George Steiner argues, discourses fall short attempting to address the metaphysical, the "other" as he addresses it in his books *Real Presences* and *Errata*. Steiner reaches the conclusion that language is bound by human logic that rejects the existence of the "other". Music, he believes, "would stand at the alpha and omega...of being itself"[92] The meaning that we have assigned to music through language does not comprehend its omnipresence. And yet, Steiner posits that there is no culture or community where music does not exist, there is a universality to music that draws people to its performance.

As evidenced in the previous chapter, we have attempted to rationalise performative aspects of music. We are able to create a detailed analysis of every musical work to understand how it unfolds, and develop impeccable technique to deliver an accurate performance of the score. However, Steiner asks, "What explanation have we for an experience at once familiar, banal, quotidian and 'beyond words' -which is to say beyond adequate logical-rational explication?"[93] The end to which music is created and perceived is being called into question. As acknowledged throughout this study, in the study of a performer, the development of vocal and instrumental technique is a priority. It lays the foundation upon which they can fully understand, and achieve technical mastery over, their instrument. The study of interpretation is also important as it explores a number of relevant facts such as the musical style, the context within

[91] Schoenberg, Arnold (1928). *Moses und Aron*, Act 2, Scene 5. Available at: https://www.chandos.net/chanimages/Booklets/HA3314.pdf (Accessed: 20th September 2021).
[92] Steiner, (1997) p. 73.
[93] Ibid, p. 82.

which it was composed, and the emotion that underpins the music. While the continued study and practice of these elements can produce performances of high standard, the simple question of *why?* often remains unanswered. Why do we create music; why do we spend years trying to develop technique and develop our interpretative knowledge?

There is no straightforward answer to these questions. The phenomenon of a musical performance itself is a personal experience, however, it should not avoid explanation. For Steiner, music is the "*sine qua non*" in his existence, proof of the transcendental. In *Real Presences*, while acknowledging that we cannot fully understand the impact of music, he succinctly answers the question of, *why* he enjoys the experience of music:

> But we have no defining, systemic grasp of its [music's] constant, enormous impact. We can say that music is time organised...We can say that this act of organisation is one of essential freedom, that it liberates us from the enforcing beat of biological and physical-mathematical clocks. The time which music 'takes', and which it gives as we perform or experience it, is the only *free time* granted to us prior to death.[94]

Steiner's experience of "free time" is likely considered relatable to many, as it offers insight into our own understanding of the experience of a musical performance. Acknowledging the barrier that language poses in articulating the experienced phenomenon of a musical performance, in discussing the experience of performers, we can further understand the subjective elements that exist in performance. This will also allow students to develop their practice beyond a predominantly rational approach, broadening their knowledge of the phenomenon of musical performance. This research presupposes the existence of a transcendental dimension accessed through music. Although this is not an academically-sound approach in an age of rational thought, music transcends a physical, logically-bound reality. Identifying elements that exist within this dimension through comparing experiences of performers will provide insight into this unexplored area of performance. The interviews allowed me to record experiences by professional performers and teachers

[94] Steiner, (1989) p. 196-197.

on subjective topics such as the intention with which one might approach a piece of music, embodiment, catharsis, and the moment of performance itself. Aside from this, I was given detailed accounts of the interviewees' approach to musical practice and pedagogy.

I will be presenting their approach to performance and its pedagogy while comparing the experiential and linguistic similarities. Key details and terms from these accounts will be taken on to the next chapter and will form the foundations of my own philosophical framing on of the phenomenon of an affective performance.

Smaro Gregoriadou

Completing higher musical education in the UK, Smaro Gregoriadou followed an interesting route in the development of her own pedagogical practice. She says her approach towards teaching and performance is intertwined and led by the embodiment of music. I will begin by sharing her philosophy and then detailing her pedagogical and practical approach towards musical performance.[95]

The concept of embodiment is most important to Gregoriadou as it filled the "void" she felt as a student following the more empirical approach towards performance. Commenting on Ignaz Friedman's rendition of Chopin's *mazurkas*, "you could dance" she exclaims because the music is not simply performed as a dance, but Friedman represented the dance itself in his playing. The importance of the body in transmitting or receiving music is vital, according to Gregoriadou, in experiencing an "awakening of a collective memory, like they [the performer] evoked the ancient shaman and remind all of us of our common destiny."[96] She describes a transcendental experience here in perceiving music that is embodied rather than presented and has developed a pedagogy that strives to achieve this experience.

[95] Appendix 2, (2021).
[96] Ibid., p. 117.

Shifting the focus from instrumental and vocal technique to the body and its function, Gregoriadou believes the key is to uncover the "inner motion, the undercurrent of emotion and energies that are masterfully woven inside the musical fabric by each composer."[97] She alludes to a hidden element in music which must be drawn out by the performer through the process of embodiment. This process is underscored by the concept of movement; this can be in the music, in its rhythm or metre, in the feel or character of the piece, and also in our bodies and instruments. It is through the knowledge and understanding of these movements that we are able to embody, and become a physical representation of, the music.

> So, embodiment, this is the secret of embodiment and I started to encourage my students to be able to physically embody or incarnate if you will, or animate every single aspect of the form, of the plot, of the texture, of the fabric of the flow of the piece. And of course, in order to do that relatively, you have to activate all your available human universal resources of expression which is: breathing, singing, which is moving and gesturing...trying to awake this embodiment business, we try to create a line of action which is a living script that can reflect the inner motion of the music, what has been going on underneath.[98]

Gregoriadou, having developed her own pedagogy, approaches the overarching process of embodiment through a "line of action". Broadly, the first step in embodying the music, she says, is to negotiate with one's own breathing. Especially in the beginning, "breathing gives the initial momentum to breathe movement from a dead matter, the score —some black signs there." This is the start of her "line of action". In doing so, the underlaying energy that drives the music is revealed. An example she provides is the "logic of hold and release"[99], where one phrase creates tension which is released with the following phrase. She relates this underlaying energy to our breathing because they are both directly involved in fuelling the music and musical gestures. For these underlying elements to be in sync, is the foundation upon which the different elements of music are layered in the process of embodiment. Gestural

[97] Ibid.
[98] Ibid., p. 118.
[99] Ibid., p. 119.

movement is the next step that follows the movement of breath, directed towards melody, phrasing, accents and emotion. It is through repetition that these layers are made physically autonomous.

While teaching, Gregoriadou goes into further detail for her students in order to make them independent learners. The manner in which she puts this into practice is through highly effective analogy offered by Vincent Van Gogh: "I dream of painting and then I paint my dream."[100] Step 1, the movement of breath, is the period of dreaming an ideal performance of the piece. Removing all technical and gestural difficulties and striping the music back to bare symbols, this first step focuses on envisioning the outcome while layering each musical element.

> So creating an ideal of the sound, dream the sound that you want. And, for me, I try to do as much exact and accurate mental image and choreography of the piece in play and if this mental image can be strictly repeated in my head (if I can repeat it over and over again and be the same like the actors), then it is for me a sign that it is time to go to the technique; it is time to go to the 'hands'.[101]

Step 2, the gestural movement is where the dream is acted upon physically. Here technical and motor skills are the dominant elements being developed that will reflect the vision created in the first step. Musical elements are physically realised in this step and skills are implemented and developed as the student learns the music. Practical elements, such as warm ups, use of a metronome, playing style, interpretation of rhythm and style, are also developed during this stage.

> So, we talk about things like how you use your metronome: is it always there? In what proportion, or how do you distribute the beat? Do you use the metronome for bigger beats, slower beats? The pulse, how do you subdivide the pulse, how do you feel the pulse? How do you experience the down beat, the up-beat and things like that? Or things like synchronicity. How do you synchronise your two sides of your body? What

[100] Ibid., p. 121.
[101] Ibid.

> does slow practice mean? You understand all these things that are important in order to make your dream real.

The third and final step, the embodiment of music, is the communication of musical understanding physically represented during a performance. In order to prepare for this, Gregoriadou suggests simulations of performances presented to teachers and peers.

> What I am interested in, is to be able to have an interpretation that is able to transmit in real time to the listener all the power of music, which can be healing, can be transcendental, all the spiritual things it has, and having a cathartic experience for both the performer and the audience... So, this third strategy of performance practice includes playing to other people, or playing in front of microphones in order to see...I put my student to observe.[102]

The observations here include the physical and mental responses of each student in a simulated performance environment. She shares a few examples that her students experienced such as tense muscles, shallow breathing, and stress-related responses. This allows for students to prepare for and work on bodily responses that might adversely affect them during a performance. On the topic of embodiment, she concludes saying, "If you have done this line of actions, as I call them, and if you are very clear on what is your impulse and what is your intention, then you don't have many things to fear... If you know, of course, how to proceed with them."[103] To have completed these stages following the "line of actions", the performer has a better understanding of the music and can be ready for a performance.

Impulse and intention, according to Gregoriadou, are part of an initial interaction. It is "what happens to the body of the musician or the singer or the actor, before the action."[104] She refers to impulse as an "esoteric motivation" which creates a need for intentional action. She suggests that breathing with the music presents an impulse that

[102] Ibid., p. 122.
[103] Ibid., p. 123.
[104] Ibid., p. 120.

inspires an intention. The intention is important because it "creates the right muscular activation and not vice versa".[105] Gregoriadou stresses the importance of intention in guiding the process of embodiment. She believes that if the exhibition of technical abilities is the prime motivation in preparing for a performance, then the knowledge gained will only include the physical, and largely empirical, skills of the performer, not the music and its communication.

There is a role that the performer plays in the realisation of a musical work and in its communication to the audience. For Gregoriadou, the role of the performer is that of a vessel, understanding all aspects of the music and embodying it to be shared with an audience. She says, "You are a vessel, and if possible, an empty vessel in order to allow the reality of the piece, and the composer to come through."[106] In becoming a vessel for the music, during a performance, Gregoriadou believes that the manner in which a performer transmits their knowledge is through catharsis; she calls this a "vital burning". This purification is an ancient tradition where the performer had to enter into a "zone of transformation in order to provide for the audience new symbolic contents"[107]; the social significance of musical performance.

Gregoriadou also shares a profound belief that "music is abstract and concrete at the same time...it [performance] is a living process".[108] This process does not simply involve the reproduction of notes and symbols, as a performer, we must live, breathe and become those notes in order to carry out the role of the performer. She further shares that, "this opens up a whole new world of transformation... I mean, you have to deconstruct yourself in order to present the truth."[109] While during practice one works on fully understanding the music and embodying the knowledge as an empty vessel, the act of performance is a "living process" where a performer represents the music itself, transmitting the musical "truth".

[105] Ibid.
[106] Ibid., p. 123.
[107] Ibid.
[108] Ibid., p. 124.
[109] Ibid., p. 125.

In conclusion to this discussion, this is how Gregoriadou summarises her overarching pedagogy and practice:

> You start your interpretation with just breathing, allow yourself to breathe as simply and modestly and possible. And then you just follow the line of actions that you have prepared in your practice room. You try to remember this has become your body, and you have to remember them and treat the performance as a natural extension of what you did in the embodiment stages. And all of a sudden you see that the musical spirituality starts to react and the people, as you said, start to interact. This is an amazing thing.[110]

Her research and views on embodiment are extensive as it is the foundation to her approach towards performance and its pedagogy. Most importantly, the knowledge she shared during the interview reflected her personal experience that is embedded in her perception of musical performance. I found her account of intention, embodiment and the cathartic role of the performer most interesting and will take it forward to the next chapter for further study. I will now present Sylvia O'Brien's experience and pedagogical approach.

Sylvia O'Brien

Completing her higher education and musical training in Ireland, Sylvia O'Brien is a vocal performance teacher at the Royal Irish Academy of Music (RIAM) known to be a versatile contemporary vocalist. While following the syllabi and its empirical elements at the RIAM, O'Brien has developed a pedagogy rooted in nurturing more conscious performers. Her experiences with the moment of performance are equally illuminating and offers insight into further understanding the subjective elements during a performance.[111]

[110] Ibid., p. 124.
[111] Appendix 3, (2021).

O'Brien first shares her approach towards preparing for a performance; that is by preparing the "controllable environment". She later establishes that the elements within this environment are "tangibles" and further discusses the role of tangible and intangible elements during, and in preparation for, a performance:

> I am very specific about my controllable environment...the music (the three elements of music, melody, text and rhythm), the *music*, by that I mean the environment (it could be Mozart or it could be Stockhausen, the music), then the other element which is the space that I am in, the actual auditorium...I look at it very strict from layers, I strip it down to black and white dots, I strip it down to codes (decoding, structuring), and I layer it up… So my objectivity is within that controlled environment.[112]

According to O'Brien, the "controllable environment" is made up of three key elements. These are: the fundamental aspects of musical composition, the musical style, and the physical environment or context within which the performance will take place. The order in which she discusses the objective elements is also how she "layers" her practice in order to fully understand the controllable environment. Two-thirds of this "objective" preparation focuses on preparing the music itself, trying to extract as much information as possible. As for the "environment", she takes into consideration her outfit, the size of her audience and the physical space. She envisions these elements beforehand in order to consciously prepare for the performance. So, the manner in which she approaches a performance is by fully understanding elements of the music, and consciously preparing for the social environment within which the performance will take place. Upon an initial reading this is a straightforward objective approach, similar to the ones observed in the syllabi. As O'Brien continues to discuss the tangibles, the intangibles and their role in the study of a performer, this similarity soon fades.

[112] Ibid., p. 129.

While sharing how she conveys this approach to a student, she establishes the role of these tangible elements stressing the importance of "layering" the tangible elements because "all of these elements feed into the technique."[113]

> So here is the thing: I can't tell you how to perform. I can't tell you what to dip in to, that's your soul and I can't touch that. What I can do, is exactly what I do for myself, is layer the controllable environment, they're tangibles... I would call them all the foundations to get there, but I can't get there for them.[114]

Most obviously, further understanding the various elements that surround a performance allows for the performer to develop the required instrumental skills and technique. What piqued my interest here is the outright admission that she cannot say how one should perform. What she means is that, recognising the importance of subjective elements during a performance, she does not wish to dictate a pre-determined manner in which one must perform, but to lay a strong foundation of tangible elements upon which the intangibles may be experienced and realised. This is how she describes the intangible elements:

> The intangibles. Speaking of intangibles is a very… open space. You're diving into the ocean. Or actually you're going to space, because you're talking about so many variants of what we're experiencing… So, when I talk about the trough, I am bringing people as far to the stage and producing what they should produce. I am more an enabler, a facilitator is what I would suggest I am —after a point of being a teacher… I think when we have this person singing in front of us, and we want to teach them, I want to set them free.[115]

The role that O'Brien takes on, is that of an educational "enabler", playing a vital role in offering insight into the world of the intangibles by building on the foundations of technical refinement and interpretative surety. It is the student who must then experience for themselves the journey through the expansive ocean of performance.

[113] Ibid., p. 130.
[114] Ibid., p. 132.
[115] Ibid., p. 137.

She also alludes to the highly experiential nature of the intangible elements and the expansive range of insights it might offer to each individual. It is also to be noted that in O'Brien's experience, the intangible subjective elements offers the "other knowledge" that might be intuitively obtained through performance. Therefore, the teacher is only able to fully teach the tangible elements that will lead them to the stage, after which they must learn from their own experience. An example of this, she presents, is how she shares the concept of "intention" with her students.

> My whole lessons are about intention...Me speaking to you and how I phrase it is about my intention. So without my intention, how am I supposed to deliver a piece? And the only way I get that intention is by understanding. I cannot put onto someone an intention...But I can get them to find intention and how they find their own intention.[116]

Akin to Smaro Gregoriadou's approach, O'Brien describes the concept of intention as a fuel that drives a performance. She recognises the subjective nature of such a topic and concludes that such ideas can only be discussed, not directed. Her role as an "enabler" or "facilitator" is how she nurtures her students in becoming more independent and conscious performers. They are able to learn from their experiences because they are aware of elements that are revealed only through performance.

As O'Brien further elaborates, the intangible elements seem akin to energies that offer the ability to experience a transcendental dimension of music where the performer is able to communicate more *affectively.* This is where we see a significant break from the topics discussed in the syllabi. So, teachers and students can work together in layering the controllable environment and understanding the tangible and intangible elements required to experience an affective performance. It is then a personal journey that takes the performer through the vast expanse of the intangible elements during a performance. This is the experience and pedagogic approach of a vocal teacher at the Royal Irish Academy of Music, and yet, the learning outcomes of RIAM appear to

[116] Ibid., p. 137.

discuss only part of the tangibles, and does not require the knowledge or experience of the intangibles at all.[117]

Learning about O'Brien's practice however, I do wonder why one of these Learning Outcomes does not require that students should be able to:

- Develop an intellectual curiosity to recognise and discuss intangible elements experienced during performance relating to their practice

Since within institutions this would require a form of assessment, students may be asked to share a reflective report, through their chosen media, based on their practice and experience in order to demonstrate curiosity and knowledge surrounding the intangible elements. Yet in the syllabi, the importance of the intangible elements seems to be overshadowed by the wide range of tangibles that are required in the primary study of a performer. As important as it is to refine instrumental and vocal technique and layer the tangible elements to prepare the controllable environment, during a performance, the performer might be able to experience the vast ocean of the intangibles experiencing the metaphysical in music and communicating it more affectively to the listener.

She briefly address the possibility of a performer being unable to transcend due to uncontrollable factors that might disrupt this experience. While we might work towards preparing the "controllable environment", factors such as an unexpected interruption, chatty children, cold fingers or stiff muscles for instrumentalists or a dry throat for singers. These distractions may affect a performance adversely. Now, as a performer, in layering the tangible elements, this is what O'Brien experiences during a performance: "I'm free, the time I am most free in my whole day, being, life, ever…Freedom happens when all of the controllable environment has been dealt with and you are now suspended."[118]

[117] Royal Irish Academy of Music, (2020-2021).
[118] Appendix 3, (2021) p. 131.

"Being suspended", as O'Brien describes it, is a transcendental experience where the body functions autonomously and the performer is able to operate within another dimension of the music. What I have found most interesting is O'Brien's account of what a performer might achieve in this space of absolute freedom. She talks of being connected to an energy to which all beings are bound, where the performer harnesses the energy and transmits it to the listener; both communicating within a unified space:

> You don't let go within this dimension, you elevate to another dimension where everything, if you're talking about physics, everything is bound, and you've connected to that energy. And now that energy energises you, and you are now suspended. You are now 360 in a room with everybody and everything in the space is unified —there's no friction anymore.

Whilst acknowledging the audience as an integral part of this environment, I am continuing to focus on the performer and their role in communicating the music. The physical reality between practice and performance is significantly different in many ways. Most importantly, practice remains a solitary task where the music is studied and technique is developed, while performance is a public event with an inherently social aspect where the musical experience is shared. And so the control over parts of the physical environment enables the performer to achieve "absolute freedom" during a performance in transcending with the music.

O'Brien's pedagogical approach is interesting considering the approach outlined in the syllabi. Her role as an "enabler" in educating and nurturing young performers making them aware of the subjective elements in order for them to make more conscious decisions trusting their experiences is an admirable approach. In order to develop my framework, I will be taking forward her account of the moment of performance, the feeling of absolute freedom, and transcendence, being bound by energies in a unified space.

Kenneth Edge

Kenneth Edge is an Irish saxophonist who has travelled around Europe to complete his higher education and work as a professional performer. He currently teaches at the Royal Irish Academy of Music (RIAM) and performs around Ireland. Many of his experiences are similar to Smaro Gregoriadou and Sylvia O'Brien's accounts.[119] One such similarity is in our first discussion on preparing for a performance. Similar to O'Brien's practice, Edge's approach involves "absolute technical preparation and then releasing it into the wild in a performance."[120] He learns the music methodically in order to physically absorb its various elements such as melody, metre and rhythm. Echoing Gregoriadou's approach towards embodiment, Edge prioritises the development of technical and gestural skills achieving physically "innate" or "embedded" knowledge. This knowledge is developed by means of repetition and bodily interaction with the music allowing the performer to embody the music during a performance. The release "into the wild" he refers to is akin to O'Brien's feeling of absolute freedom. This process of approaching the music that he has developed allows freedom from the physical constraints. Without having to think about musical technique or accuracy, Edge is able to experience the transcendental dimension of music and communicate that with his audience.

As a teacher, Edge shares that his approach is rooted in the practice of embodiment and learning to achieve physically embedded knowledge.

> Where something goes beneath the conscious level and becomes innate, it becomes a skill that is inside. That would be a big part of learning… You're sort of using the body to learn music, like the body is learning it physically. It's both basically through repetition and I think mimetics. Miming what you're hearing and seeing physically… how our bodies learn and then it becomes, you know, it's not conscious learning. It's not from the top-down, it's from the bottom up basically. So I do, I talk about that all the time with the students. Generally because I mean, a lot of the gesture and a lot of the physicality training with the saxophone, it's difficult to do naturally, it's difficult

[119] Appendix 1, (2021).
[120] Ibid., p. 104.

> to actually do it. So a lot of my teaching would be about the body, the body doing and being under little pressure as possible or strain or stress as opposed to the brain being the main focus. The embodiment in this is very important…everybody's body is central to what they do.[121]

Edge refers to Arnie Cox's *Embodying Music: Principles of Mimetic Hypothesis* to further elaborate on the role of motor imagery in the understanding of embodiment. The premise of Cox's hypothesis surrounds human proclivity to "understand one another via imitation." We attempt to imagine the physical gestures of resultant sounds in order to further understand and connect with it, through the mode of tacit learning. Principle 8 in this hypothesis is most relevant to this section: "Imitation is more strongly activated in observation of goal-directed actions". [122] This principle presents the benefit of learning through intentional imitation. As Edge has suggested, absorbing the physicality of the music through imitation and repetition results is a form of learning that is led by the body and results in embedded knowledge. In his teaching he focuses on the gestures of the body in order to produce the desired sound and encourages repetition to achieve technical autonomy during a performance. This approach allows Edge to experience a sense of freedom that allows him to interact with the music on a higher plane of consciousness. This is the experience he describes:

> My own personal feeling of a performance that goes well is when you can step outside the performance as it is happening...and you are just watching from outside as you feel everything is under control...it's what would be called a kind of "flow state". That kind of a flow state would be my ideal of a performance... You have a feeling of control. And that's affected, not just by being technically on top of things, it's affected by the environment you're performing in. If you're not aware of the environment, if you've been distracted…sometimes going into a hall and suddenly into a performance, it's kind of dangerous...That is important as well.[123]

---

[121] Ibid., p. 111.
[122] Cox, Arnie. (2011) *Embodying Music: Principles of the Mimetic Hypothesis*. Society for Music Theory. Vol. 17 (no. 2), July 2011.
[123] Appendix 1, (2021) p. 105.

It is interesting to follow Edge's line of thinking while sharing his experience during a performance. He begins with his ideal of a performance, absolute freedom experienced through a higher level of consciousness. The theory of "flow" as theorised by Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi describes a state of mind where individuals are fully immersed while engaging with an activity.[124] Edge believes that through complete technical autonomy, during a performance, as this embodied music is communicated to the audience, he is able to transcend to a plane of consciousness where he is immersed in the act and experiences a sense of absolute freedom.

Edge also mentions the "feeling of control" during a performance, which is another result of the complete preparation of technical skills. This control is experienced in a transcendental dimension but is exerted over the physical environment of "tangibles". While elements within an uncontrollable environment might distract the performer, experiencing the state of "flow" and the feeling of control in that state of mind, the performer is not affected. The performer is in control when the tangible elements have been prepared, the "controllable environment" (the music, the musical context and the environment within which the performance will take place), and the embodiment of music allows the performer to transcend in a state of "flow" while affectively communicating it to the audience.

Finally, akin to O'Brien's theory of the controllable environment, Edge addresses the performance environment as a key factor in preparing for a performance. He stresses the importance of the controllable environment and warns against the uncontrollable environment. As I have observed, Edge believes that going into a performance with no knowledge of the environment will create a sense of doubt and uneasiness in the performer preventing them from being fully immersed in the music. In such instances, the performer lacks confidence in their preparation allowing for distractions, that may arise in the physical environment, to affect the performance adversely. During practice, Edge says, "I try and get everything done in practice. As that gives me a sort of confidence in performance as well... Going into a performance thinking 'if only I

[124] Csikszentmihalyi, (2002).

had another week...' you're probably in trouble."[125] Therefore, confidence is also a factor that promotes or affects our ability to be fully immersed in the act of performance.

The key to Edge's ideal performance boils down to embedded technical skill and understanding of the tangible elements in the controllable environment. Once these elements have been prepared, the performer must release it "into the wild" during a performance allowing the intangibles (embodiment of music, catharsis, transcendental dimension of the music) to take over. It is during practice that most knowledge is acquired and technical skill is physically embedded. Yet, to Edge, there is a "continuum between practice and performance...that you're still learning."[126] The learning during a performance, he believes, is facilitated through the music and is understood through our own intuition.

> I feel a lot of learning. I think intuitively we know a lot about the piece that we're playing through performance like there is an element or aspect of it that we don't learn in practice... Things become really clear... I am aware and I generally learn a lot through performance.[127]

The theory of "flow" can be extended to the task of learning itself. Being fully immersed in learning about the music, one achieves a conscious state of "flow" where knowledge is not only gained through our surroundings, but also from within ourselves. This is an experience that Edge refers to as "intuition" offering insight into the music being performed.

In the interview, Edge acknowledges that these topics are not easy to discuss. As a teacher, attempting to convey such ideas, he believes, are challenging but introducing to students. The "tangible" elements are easy to teach in that they are quantifiable and are approached in a straightforward manner. It is the subjective, he says, and its various aspects that can be discussed. He says, "I try and have a dialogue where I

[125] Appendix 1, p. 106.
[126] Ibid.
[127] Ibid., p. 105-106.

would try and put in the words", but since words only go so far, he also plays music through recordings and on his instrument. "It's completely subjective. But I try and inspire students to engage with why they're doing what they're doing."[128] The reason why he continues to further his understanding and share, with his students, knowledge of the subjective elements is: "'The opium in music'. That's the thing that everyone is looking for. In every art...that's the purpose of it."[129] The transcendental dimension of music, the opium that draws us, is the ultimate experience for which we indulge in the arts. An experience that transcends our physical world, and allows us a glimpse into the metaphysical. Musical performance is a unique experience because performers can not only experience it for themselves, but also transmit it to their audience. In order to do so, the performer must take on the responsibility of preparing the "tangible" elements, developing embedded knowledge, entering into a confident state of mind during a performance to communicate the music, immersing themselves in the music and allowing the "intangibles" to take over.

Patricia Rozario

Completing her musical education at the Guildhall School of Music, Patricia Rozario OBE has had a rich performance career around the world. She is currently a member of the vocal faculty at the Royal College of Music and Trinity Laban Conservatory, and mentors students privately. She also conducts masterclasses with a non-profit organisation in India, that she helped establish, called Giving Voice Society which aims to offer young Indian singers performance opportunities to further their career. Once again, although the interviewees have varying background of performance and education many similarities have been observed in their experiences and approach towards performance.[130]

As a performer, Rozario's preparation for a performance begins through "learning the music, the text, understanding the text, dwelling on the text, absorbing the ideas, and

[128] Ibid., p. 108.
[129] Ibid., p. 113.
[130] Appendix 4, (2021).

also thinking of it from different angles."[131] This is similar to Sylvia O'Brien and Kenneth Edge's approach, prioritising the complete understanding and absorption of the musical elements. Rozario also highlights the importance of musical style since vocal music is intertwined with literature and poetry, and so understanding the style of music and the language that frames it is key to her preparation. The examples she provides are the spiritual texts within an oratorio, the story that governs an opera, and the poetry that paints art songs.

Once this style has been identified, "I make sure that technically I can access the notes that are difficult, working on breath —the flow of breath... Then as one gets familiar with the piece, you start to let it flow."[132] The understanding of musical elements and development of technical skill has been the primary approach for all the interviewees. For Rozario, control over one's breathing is key in internalising technique and akin to Edge's practice, she also speaks of embedded knowledge:

> I believe that people should master a technique that is so natural, you know, it's like breathing… That must become second nature so that when it comes to getting on stage to perform, you're not worried about it or preoccupied with that. You are then focused on communicating this very special music in a spontaneous way.[133]

While prioritising absolute technical and physical preparation, Rozario believes that this knowledge must become "second nature" to the performer, just like breathing. This embedded knowledge is something that all the interviewees work towards because it allows the performer to embody the music and experience a sense of freedom during a performance. The motivation for Rozario is to genuinely communicate the music to the audience and to "inter-weave" with the music during a performance.

> In performance sometimes new things suggest themselves, and I'll go with it because it makes it much more spontaneous and that I am inter-weaving with the music not

[131] Ibid., p. 139.
[132] Ibid.
[133] Ibid., p. 148.

> just singing notes and words and rhythms exactly as the composer has written it, but I am adding something.[134]

Rozario finds purpose in interacting with the music during a performance that allows her to communication with her audience. She shares her experience of elements that "suggest themselves" in performance. I believe this is a result of the state of "flow" that she alludes to in her account: "When you really are so focused [in performance], and you immerse yourself and you take that leap...that is when the best performances happen."[135] The insights that she receives are through experiencing the metaphysical in music where knowledge is gained intuitively through interacting with, and being immersed in, the music. This interaction is the experience she describes as "inter-weaving"; to be involved in the process of creating a transcendental musical experience. In order to be immersed in the music the performer must trust that all the tangible elements within an controllable environment have been fully prepared and can focus on being immersed in the music and communicating it to an audience.

Furthering this idea, on the topic of embodying the music in performance, Rozario believes that every piece of vocal music demands the embodiment of the character that resides within the work. And, she says, "as a performer you have the duty to bring it alive, to tell the story."[136] In the same way Gregoriadou shared her thoughts on the performer becoming an empty vessel in order to become a representation of the music, Rozario suggests that the performer has a "great responsibility" in embodying the character of the music and communicate that to an audience.

While the practice itself is slightly varied, the two overarching components in the process of embodiment are the absolute objective understanding and technical development of the musical material. All of the interviewees have shared the view that only through understanding and physically absorbing the music can one embody it during a performance. Learning about its technical demands and achieving autonomy of the bodily gestures allows the performer to physically embody the music

[134] Ibid., p. 143.
[135] Ibid., p. 142.
[136] Ibid., p. 143.

in a manner that represents the musical work. As a teacher, Rozario follows the same methodical approach as her own practice. She asks her students to "go back to the score, to look at it, observe every aspect of it, learn it out of heart, look at the dynamics of it; in a way those are clues"[137]. What is prioritised is the understanding of musical character and the language used in the piece, and the absorption of technical skills. Then with the intention to physically embody and consciously interact with the music, during a performance the performer is able to inter-weave with the music and communicate for affectively with the listener.

While discussing the subjective elements, Rozario describes them as "something you discover as you progress and as you gain experience, you get little illuminations."[138] These "illuminations", as Rozario describes them, usually occur during performance, and she believes that it cannot be directly taught as they are quite "intangible". What she means by this is that students will not fully understand these topics unless they experience it for themselves. Without such experiences, the discussion of "intangible" elements and their role will be meaningless to a student, and without knowledge about the subjective elements, students would not be able to fully understand their role through their experiences alone. Therefore, she says, in performance the performer must be "open to things that suggest themselves." [139] Rather than suggesting that these topics cannot be discussed at all, akin to Edge's view, she believes that through personal experiences aspects of these experiences can be meaningfully discussed. As for her personal experience, this is how she describes it:

> It's something that you connect with, and these sparks occur in performance that illuminate your mind as you perform and allows you to go that bit further to connect with the audience. When one performs at the highest level, one is...casting a spell on the audience. And I think that is the exciting thing about being a performer.[140]

[137] Ibid.
[138] Ibid., p. 146.
[139] Ibid.
[140] Ibid., p. 147.

The sparks that illuminate the mind through interacting with the music allows further connection with the audience. The mystical analogy of "casting a spell on the audience" aptly follows Rozario's view on the role of the performer. According to her, the performer has the duty to bring the music to life and tell the story through embodying the character it presents. To cast a "spell" is to thoroughly convince the audience through communicating the music with conviction. The performer must take on this "great responsibility" of not only embodying, but also conveying the insights they receive to the audience. For Rozario, the experience of such performances are exciting and fulfil the performer's role.

Although language is a significant barrier for Rozario, this is how she describes her experience of the transcendental dimension of music:

> I find that sometimes when I have done those kinds of performances, I come off and I am on a high! And I think when things work, and you've absorbed the music in your practice and you really know exactly where it is going and what you want to do with it. When you perform it, it goes onto another level. You actually don't even know the impact of the way you are doing things.[141]

Edge used a similar analogy as he compared this aspect of music to "the opium in music", the aspect that draws people to indulge in music as creators and perceivers of the art. Rozario shares this experience, and reiterates the importance of physically absorbing the tangible musical elements in order to experience the transcendental dimension of music. The "impact", of which we are unaware, refers to the process of "inter-weaving" with the music forging a stronger connection with the audience allowing a more affective communication of the music.

So far, all interviewees, seem to share a similar overarching view of the moment of performance while sharing their own subjective experience. From Gregoriadou's cathartic communication, to the freedom within which O'Brien communicates and Rozario inter-weaves, the importance of absolute technical preparation and the goal

[141] Ibid, p. 145.

of musical communication seems to dominate their experiences. During these interviews, I have also noticed many similarities in thought and language amongst Rozario, Edge, Gregoriadou and O'Brien's experiences. I would like to address a few of these similarities and the language that they use to communicate these ideas. We can see that the preparation for performance is comparable in many respects. While Rozario prioritises the development of technique to become "second nature", Edge works towards "innate" knowledge, and Gregoriadou calls on embodying the music. On the topic of the role and experience of the intangible elements during a performance, Rozario describes them as "illuminations" in the mind. An experience that Edge says "offers inspiration", Gregoriadou calls a cathartic "transformation" and O'Brien poetically describes as being "absolutely free" allowing the performer to gain further understanding of the music. These accounts all provide evidence that the experiences, although subjective, all present a similar account.

This similitude, not only in thought but also in the language used by the interviewees is valuable evidence that the language surrounding these topics can be developed and implemented within performance courses. For examples, singers O'Brien and Rozario, use the term "intangibles" in the interviews. O'Brien describes the "tangibles" as elements that must be prepared in our controllable physical environment and the "intangibles" as elements that exist within the transcendental dimension where the performer experiences absolute freedom. Without using the term "tangibles", Rozario presents similar elements that are prepared in a controllable physical environment. Interestingly, she describes the "intangibles" as subjective elements that illuminate the mind that allow the performer to connect with the audience and better communicate the music. Their use of the term makes a distinction between performative elements that are present in our physical world and those that exist within another dimension during the act of performance. They allude not simply to what one might be able to physically grasp, but to the dimensions of the physical and metaphysical. This is the evidence that fuels my work; although the experiences are subjective and avoid any logical explanation or definition, there are aspects of their experiences that are similar amongst performers. It is these aspects that remain unexplored within institutions and resist further explanation in the wider field of musical performance.

From these accounts, I will be taking the following ideas forward to form the linguistic framework of the third eye of musical performance: "intention" as the will to carry out the role of a performer, the embodiment of music, and the transcendental dimension of music where performers might experience a "vital burning" through catharsis, "flow" and "freedom" within a "unified space" allowing for better communication with the audience where there are "illuminations" that offer insight into the music.

Chapter 5

Creating a Framework

The purpose of this research is to view musical performance in a new light and explore an area that has previously been underrepresented. Since the phenomenon of musical performance is a largely subjective experience, we resort to metaphors in identifying and addressing the elements that create this phenomenon. The theory of the third eye proposes that the subjective nature of phenomena highlights the presence of "other knowledge" that is gained through looking within ourselves. Lloyd Alexander (1924-2007), American author of children's books, presents an interesting perspective in his article for The English Journal titled, 'Seeing with the Third Eye'.[142] While addressing the role of teaching in shaping young minds, he suggests that knowledge that is being passed down is insufficient as it does not encompass knowledge of ourselves.

> Without this kind of [self] discovery, I doubt that we can be genuinely complete human beings. Without a vision that encompasses internal as well as external, we remain one-dimensional personalities. What we need...is a third eye.

Alexander believes that the third eye presents insights that allows us to better understand ourselves as people and connect with each other. As social beings, he also suggests that the knowledge we gain internally or externally must be shared so that we are constantly learning and evolving in our lives. Without the communication of knowledge, the truths we learn, he believes, are meaningless.

The decision to use this concept as a metaphor in this study was an intuitive decision that, upon further research, offered insight into an area of performance that remains largely unexplored. The third eye is the means to gaining "other knowledge", of the metaphysical, through entering a higher plane of consciousness. Knowledge that

[142] Alexander, Lloyd. (1974) 'Seeing with the Third Eye', *The English Journal*. May, 1974, Vol. 63, No. 5, pp. 35-40. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/813738.pdf?ab_segments=0%2Fbasic_search_gsv2%2Fcontrol&refreqid=fastly-default%3Ae8bfa6da9a35a4fa144d4c92f2a79bc8 (Accessed: 4th September 2021).

extends beyond our external world of empirical truths. For Alexander, this is vital for individual growth through sharing this knowledge. Nityabodhananda believes that one must be fully absorbed in their search for knowledge, "a sustained continuous effort to complete a task, opens the channels for intuitional knowledge to flow."[143] He provides the analogy of Albert Einstein obtaining a "flash of information" regarding the theory of relativity. Einstein believed this to be the truth, and thus spent the next decade of his life proving it through empirical means to share it with the world. The intuitive insight he gained is through being completely absorbed in his work in a quest for knowledge. "When the energy level is raised through total absorption", he says, "the rational and logical mind tires of understanding and its influence recedes."[144] This experience occurs in our everyday lives, what we call a "gut feeling", or an "intuitive guess". The absorption of the mind in search of an answer gives way for inner knowledge to be accessed.

Arnold Berlant also discusses the topics of internal and external knowledge through the work of Henri Bergson's *An Introduction to Metaphysics*. Alexander posits that Bergson makes a vital distinction between knowledge and intuition. He writes, "Knowledge, works by distancing oneself; intuition by entering into and joining with the object, and this, Bergson holds, provides metaphysical understanding."[145] In order to access intuitive knowledge, it is important to enter into the object itself to, as stated above by Nityabodhananda, let "intuitional knowledge to flow". The role of the body is also of importance within the concept of the third eye. According to practitioners of y*oga*, training the body is vital in "awakening" the third eye. Meditation is one practice that creates a heightened state of awareness while also being relaxed.[146] Austerity over the physical body is required in order to allow the mind to gain "knowledge of the universe".[147] These interpretations that surround the concept of the third eye further enriches my metaphor and forms the basis of my framework.

[143] Nityabodhana, (2009) p. 9.
[144] Ibid.
[145] Berlant, (1999) p. 74-75.
[146] Ibid., p. 67.
[147] Ibid., p. 55.

To transcribe the concept of the third eye within the context of musical performance, it is the personal desire that drives the will to perform. A performer might experience this desire through developing an intention to be a vessel in the communication of music. This intention guides the physical learning in the process of *embodiment,* to become the physical manifestation of the music resulting in a performance that is able to transmit its transcendental dimension. Intention, I believe, is the primary force that paves the way not only for the embodiment or cathartic communication, but also in experiencing the transcendental dimension in music.

To reiterate, the metaphor of the third eye refers to a metaphysical presence in music that can be accessed through its transcendental dimension by developing subjective elements in preparation for, and during, a performance. In order to create a philosophical framework around the subjective elements, I have selected interdisciplinary sources that have attempted to discuss aspects of this phenomenon that will support the discussion on the third eye of musical performance.

Federico Garcia Lorca, Theory and Play of the Duende (2007)

My primary inspiration with this thesis has been the theory of the *duende* by Federico Garcia Lorca presented during a lecture in Argentina, titled 'Theory and Play of the Duende'. The Spanish word *duende* refers to a supernatural being and is often theorised as a spirit in the context of flamenco music.[148] While many may have experienced this "mysterious force", Lorca himself admits that it has not been explained by philosophers and that it cannot be wholly articulated. It is a "spirit" or a "force" that emerges from within the performer and sometimes referred to as an inner being that is part of the performer.[149] This idea is a reoccurring theme in my study, and has been consistent with the intuitive knowledge that stems from a higher plane of consciousness.

[148] Merriam Webster Dictionary, (n.d.). *Duende*. Available at: https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/duende (Accessed: 8th September 2020).
[149] Lorca, (2007).

Lorca insists that the *duende* does not come from an external source such as the angel or the Muse. The angel is said to guide the performer, while the Muse dictates and prompts. If we consider these entities to be the knowledge gained through empirical study of technique, historical context and interpretation aimed at guiding the performer in performance, Lorca firmly believes that this knowledge is insufficient in driving home "the nail of artistic truth". He quotes Manuel Torre, who is commenting on a signer who has performed for him saying, "You have a voice, you understand style, but you'll never ever succeed because you have no *duende*."[150] Rather than an external source, this suggests that the *duende* comes from within. So the manifestation of the *duende* is not induced through the labour of technique or the historical and performative knowledge that guides interpretation. Lorca highlights that the root of art that inspires the *duende* lies in their "dark sounds". Within the performer is the desire to walk around the edge of the well, accepting the nearness of death and being committed to the risk.

Roland Barthes, The Grain of the Voice (1977)

Roland Barthes' philosophical attempt at describing the phenomenon of an affective performance has also been an inspiration in creating a framework in my research.[151] As stated before, he shines light on the insufficiency of language in interpreting music. The premise is that music is only translated into the linguistic category of the adjective.[152] He says, "the adjective is inevitable: this music is *this* [italicised by author], this execution is *that* [italicised by author]."[153] Its fate then, Barthes suggests, is only saved through changing the perception of the musical object itself. We are drawn back to the idea that there are musical experiences that cannot be articulated through language alone, yet there are aspects that surround it which may be discussed.

[150] Ibid., p. 5.
[151] Barthes, (1977) p. 179.
[152] Ibid.
[153] Ibid., p. 180.

There are two ideas here that pertain to my research. One is most obviously the "grain" that is the *geno-song*. In an attempt to present an example of the displacement he purports, Barthes presents the theory of the "grain" in relation to vocal art music. He describes his attempt as "the impossible account of an individual thrill that I constantly experience in listening to singing."[154] As with Lorca and his attempt to describe this deeply personal experience, we once again face the situation where the "thrill" is widely felt but never described. Recognising that it can not be described, Barthes attempts to address an aspect that he believes is directly linked to the phenomenon he experiences during a vocal performance. Here he utilises Kristeva's literary theory on *pheno-text* and *geno-text* within the context of vocal performance referring to them as *pheno-song* and *geno-song*. The *pheno-song*, according to Barthes, encompasses all elements relating to "the structure of the language being sung", including the musical style, the composer's idiolect, historical context, phrasing, technique, and "everything in the performance which is in the service of communication, representation, expression, everything which is customary to talk about".[155] The *geno-song* on the other hand, he describes almost poetically as "that apex of production where the melody really works at the language — not at what it says, but the voluptuousness of its sounds-signifiers…where melody explores how the language works and identifies with that work."[156] He goes on to describe it as the *diction* of the language, which requires the complete support of the body. While the song is delivered through the soul, the body is required to "accompany musical diction with a 'gesture support'."[157] Following a discussion on the performances of Charles Panzéra and Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, Barthes concludes that the 'grain' is perceived to be the body in the singing voice.

[154] Ibid., p. 181.
[155] Ibid., p. 182.
[156] Ibid.
[157] Ibid., p. 183.

George Steiner, Real Presences (1989)

Furthering his theory on the indescribable "presence" in the arts, Steiner writes, "Literature and the arts are the perceptible witness to the freedom of coming into being of which history can give us no account."[158] Although his work is described by Graham Ward as a "creative defence, not a logically propounded argument"[159], rather than criticising, he highlights Steiner's hypothesis that this aspect of music is beyond the grasp of logic, to which language is bound[160]. Steiner firmly believes that "music and the metaphysical…have been virtually inseparable" and uses imagery and metaphors in his attempt to convey the nature and existence of such a "presence".[161] He takes into consideration the condition of the human soul, one that he believes has been lost in the trend of deconstruction within academic research. Instead of discussing the breadth of this work, I will be focusing on a few philosophical ideas that pertains to my study.

Throughout the book, Steiner discusses the limits of language in addressing the metaphysical presence within the arts:

> The embarrassment we feel in bearing witness to the poetic, to the entrance into our lives of the mystery of the otherness in art and in music, is of a metaphysical-religious kind. What I need to state plainly here is both the prevailing convention of avoidance, and my personal incapacity, both intellectual and expressive, to overcome it adequately...they are very difficult to put into words.[162]

Although it is evident that this "presence" within music has widely been avoided and it evades empirical evidence and linguistic articulation, Steiner still believes that it is worth attempting to convey this experience. He metaphorically addresses music and

---

[158] Ibid., p. 182.
[159] Ward, Graham. (1990). 'George Steiner's *Real Presences*', *Journal of Literature and Theology*, Vol. 4 (no. 2), pp. 237. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/23924508?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents (Accessed: 16th September 2021).
[160] Again, this is a recurring idea that Steiner postulates while addressing the largely overlooked concept of a metaphysical presence that exists within the arts.
[161] Steiner, (1989) p. 216.
[162] Ibid., p. 178-179.

art as the only witnesses to, and means of understanding of, our coming into being, a sense of freedom that is only experienced through performance. Music, in particular, allows for this freedom to be experienced through engaging in its performance or reception:

> We know of music as we know the spark and pressure at the centre of our own selves...we have no defining, systematic grasp of its constant, enormous impact... The time that music 'takes', and which it gives as we perform or experience it, is the only *free time* granted us prior to death [author's italics][163].

Steiner is absorbed by the idea of freedom in this chapter, and describes the arts as a "compelling licence of imagining and thought"[164]. He celebrates its ability to represent the abyssal, and in leading us as close to the metaphysical as we can get. Steiner presents a compelling case for the existence of a "presence" in the arts, and it is the experience of this presence that I take away from this work. Within musical performance, the knowledge of its transcendental dimension and the exhilarating feeling of freedom is worth addressing as is a part of the subjective elements.

Karen Barad, Meeting the Universe Halfway (2007)

Karen Barad's theory on 'intra-action' is another insightful perspective in discussing the moment of performance.[165] According to Barad, our world is a dynamic web of intra-action through which we experience different phenomena. In a journal article titled, 'Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter', Barad describes phenomena as follows:

> Phenomena are the ontological inseparability of "agentially intra-acting components." That is, phenomena are ontologically primitive relations—relations without preexisting relata… It is through specific agential intra-actions that the boundaries and

[163] Ibid., p. 196-197.
[164] Ibid., p. 164.
[165] Barad, (2007).

> properties of the "components" of phenomena become determinate and that particular embodied concepts become meaningful.[166]

This theory aims to provide an alternate approach towards how we consider ontological relationships. While *inter*-action describes a relationship between two or more bodies existing and interacting independently, *intra*-action suggests that relationships between bodies form through agency and exist co-dependently in a symbiotic relationship. Therefore, as presented in Chapter 1 of this thesis, she posits that relationships between "individuals" or "components" do not pre-exist, rather they materialise through agential intra-action; a phenomenon that, according to Barad, encompasses a web of intra-acting bodies within which these relationships become meaningful. My interpretation is that musical performance is a web of relationships where entities "intra-act" within a unified space. These relationships are of a symbiotic nature between the performer(s) and the audience, the performance space, the composer and the musical work, and the objective and subjective elements Combined, these entities obtain meaning through "agential intra-action". If there is no audience, the purpose of the performance is lost affecting all other entities within that environment. In the same way, the purpose of the audience is lost where there is no performer, or music to perceive. Through the lens of a performer, this symbiotic nature highlights the dependence between these entities and further recognises the performer's role of fully understanding the music and embodying it in order to transmit that knowledge during a performance.

Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi, Flow (2002)

As previously introduced, Csikszentmihalyi's theory on achieving a "flow state" involves a "commitment of emotions and will" and immersing oneself in a task elevating to a higher plane of consciousness, the result of which are moments that bring us immeasurable joy, a feeling of complete control over our actions, an exhilarating thrill, enjoyment and pleasure beyond definition.[167] These experiences

[166] Barad, Karen. (2003) ' Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, Vol. 28 (no. 3), p. 815.
[167] Csikszentmihalyi, (2002).

are not necessarily ones that bring "happiness". Instead, they offer a rare sense of control over life and our destiny. Csikszentmihalyi uses the example of a swimmer in the final leg of a race experiencing intense fatigue and pain and who might have an optimal experience. He says, "optimal experiences add up to a sense of mastery...that comes as close to what is usually meant by happiness as anything else we can conceivably imagine."[168] Individuals are able to experience this through achieving 'flow', the process of obtaining "control over one's inner life."[169]

In order to fully understand this process, he takes a look at the role of consciousness and the conditions that make up the experience of 'flow'.

> The function of consciousness is to represent information about what is happening outside and inside the organism in such a way that it can be evaluated and acted upon by the body.[170]

Within consciousness, Csikszentmihalyi says, we can make deliberate, rather than impulsive or reflexive, decisions based on sensory input. It is also the reason why we are able to "daydream, make up lies, and write beautiful poems and scientific theories."[171] Although there is no branch of science that is able to outline the exact manner in which consciousness works, the consensus is that a person can convince themselves that they are happy or sad, regardless of external stimulus, because of their consciousness. Therefore, according to Csikszentmihalyi, control over the conscious mind is required in experiencing 'flow'. The experience must be an end in itself, an "autotelic experience", a self-contained activity that is carried out because the act itself is rewarding. In his study, the commonality in activities that promoted the experience of 'flow' "provided a sense of discovery, a creative feeling of transporting the person to higher levels of performance, and led to previously undreamed-of states of consciousness."[172]

---

[168] Ibid., p. 4.
[169] Ibid., p. 6.
[170] Ibid., p. 24.
[171] Ibid.
[172] Ibid., p. 74.

Therefore, Csikszentmihalyi theorises that in order to achieve a state of 'flow', one must take on an activity that is personally rewarding and be fully immersed in carrying it out. This allows the individual to experience the phenomenon of 'flow'. In short, "When we choose a goal and invest ourselves in it to the limits of our concentration, whatever we do will be enjoyable...This is the way the self grows."[173] Csikszentmihalyi explores the experience in much more depth than I have discussed here, but these are the key constituents that make up the experience of flow. During this phenomenon, one experiences what Csikszentmihalyi calls, "the transformation of time", where time and its relativity is seemingly fluid. Most "flow activities", he says, "do not depend on clock time." Although the feeling of losing track of time might not be the primary element we seek, "freedom from the tyranny of time does add to the exhilaration we feel during a state of complete involvement."[174] The theory of flow is an insightful resource that offers a guide to inducing the optimal experience. Although we may not always be successful, it is something that we must strive for within our practices in order to experience growth of our inner self.

These theories and concepts have been deliberately chosen to support my framework. The existence of a metaphysical "presence" or a "spirit" in music, as Steiner and Lorca describe it, ties in with Barthes' perception of the "grain". Their interpretation of this aspect of music and its performance shines light on a subjective, experiential area of study that I have contextualised through the metaphor of the third eye. The subjective elements, as identified previously, that are developed in practice are intention and the embodiment of music which, in performance, elicits its transcendental dimension giving way to experiences such as catharsis, absolute freedom and perception of the metaphysical. Further supporting the process of preparation and the transcendental experience in performance are theories such as "flow state" and "intra-action" as proposed by Csikszentmihalyi and Barad respectively. In the following chapter, these elements extracted from the interviews is further developed in conjunction with the literature above to present a framework surrounding the third eye of musical performance.

[173] Ibid., p. 42.
[174] Ibid., p. 67.

Chapter 6

Discussing the Third Eye

Intention

While there are many branches to the topic of intention, in this study, its role within musical performance is guided by the well-developed account of Smaro Gregoriadou. So far, intention has been theorised as the first step in the process of preparing for a performance. Gregoriadou suggests that musical practice does not begin with an objective study of the score or technical skills, and nor does it encompass just the tangible elements. Intention is the first step which is tied to an impulse which guides the process of practice. Elizabeth Anscombe also speaks of this phenomenon in her book, *Intention*, where she states that the mental process of intending to carry out an activity is the beginning of the physical act itself.[175] Within the field of physics, Newton's second law, the impulse-momentum relationship, states that the momentum observed on an object is proportional to the impulse exerted on it. The theory suggests that impulse is not an instantaneous reaction, but is "the effect of force acting over time."[176] In conjunction with Anscombe's theory, in preparing for a performance, impulse is an "esoteric motivation" that occurs in the mind which is then consciously developed through the process of intention that, together, create the momentum to carry out the act of performance. To better understand this initial impulse, I will present an example:

Let's say a violin student is preparing for their recital at the end of the year and has been working with their teacher on developing technique and broadening repertoire and knowledge of interpretation. The recital must be themed and showcase a range of skills and repertoire. Upon pondering what the student might want to showcase, an impulse shoots through the mind in the form of an idea, that they are urged to act

[175] Anscombe, (2000).
[176] Barnard Health Care, (n.d.). *Impulsemomentum Relationship*. Available at: https://www.barnardhealth.us/qualitative-analysis/impulsemomentum-relationship.html (Accessed: 20th October 2021).

upon. This impulse sets the ball rolling as there is a drive to further this idea, still within the mind.

The development of intention then takes over as the process of practice begins. Here, Gregoriadou adds in another element to the equation: the role of the performer. Since 'intention' is used to refer to a purpose or goal achieved through carrying out an action, the purpose of the performer must be established before delving into the physical aspects of practice. Although impulse fuels momentum, if the object is immovable, the impulse is affected adversely. Gregoriadou theorises the importance of impulse along with intention as a joined process that fuels practice and performance. I believe this is because we may experience many impulses throughout our lives, but if these are not seized and developed through intention, its potential may not be realised. Individuals must establish their role in acting on the impulse and the purpose of their actions. This is the process of intention that is required for the momentum to carry them through to the stage.

Going back to the example of the violin student, broadly, there are two ways that the student can act on the impulse: with or without the development of intention. If they are unaware of their role and proceeds with the latter, they would still act on the impulse, but its potential will not be realised. They might base their practice solely on the recital assessment criteria and focus on refining technique and interpretation with guidance from their teacher. This performance may tick boxes on an assessment checklist, but it will not elicit the more subjective experiences of musical performance because the mind is focused on musical accuracy rather than communication. Now, if the student follows the impulse through with the development of intention, the primary purpose they might establish is the representation of the music. This reveals their role as the physical representation of the music through its embodiment. In conjunction with knowledge of the assessment criteria, they can now choose music that they believe conveys their intention and begin their physical practice focusing on embodying the music and fully understanding the musical styles that they will represent with the guidance of their teacher. If all these elements come together during

a performance, the student will be able to better communicate the music and experience its transcendental dimension.

Acknowledging that the topic of intention is far more complex and can easily fill the pages of a doctoral dissertation, this surface level view of impulse and intention is used to reveal a significant step in the growth of a performer, the importance of making conscious decisions. The difference in the two approaches mentioned above is the level of conscious decisions made by the student. The theory of flow can also be applied in this process of intention. Csikszentmihalyi suggests that in order to experience the state of flow and grow as individuals, we must be fully involved in our chosen task.[177] The *process* of intention draws performers into being consciously involved in establishing the purpose of their actions and their role within the chosen activity. Impulse and intention themselves are mental states that sets in motion events that lead to a goal. In first establishing these events in the mind, the performer then has a clear path towards their intended purpose and grow as an individual.

Therefore, practice begins when the conscious mind acts on an impulse forming one's intention where a purpose is established along with the role of the performer. The result of this initial process in the mind creates momentum that leads to the physical routine of practice, developing the required technical skills, and objective studies to further understand the music, style and historical significance. In Gregoriadou's pedagogy, this is where the performer begins to create a 'line of action' towards embodying the music. As presented in her teaching, a significant part of practice occurs within the mind. Embracing this and teaching performers to make conscious decisions in their practice is the first step to experiencing the intangibles during a performance. Before that, we will explore the second step in practice, that allows the performer to achieve complete control over their physical environment and become a vessel for the music itself.

[177] Csikszentmihalyi, (2002).

Embodiment

Musical embodiment, as an area of study has more recently become an established field with several theories put forth over the years.[178] Broadly, the research conveys the importance of our physical interaction with music. It also directs us towards a physical study of the music —the gestures and techniques that require specific bodily movements to emit sounds. Roland Bathers' theory on the "grain" speaks of the materiality of the "body" that can be heard in the voice. Acknowledging that he is unable to articulate the experience itself, he shifts the object in question to an element he experiences as the "grain", in vocal performance, that leads the listener to transcendental experiences such as *jouissance*. Through the lens of a performer, this experienced physicality is a result of the embodiment of music. All the interviewees discuss the importance of the body in the approach to performance.

Gregoriadou believes that to embody the music is to internalise the "inner motion" of the piece, suggesting that there is an element embedded within the music that must be physically embedded within us. The 2-stage "line of action" towards embodying the "inner motion" is a well-articulated approach for young performers to adopt in their own practice. In breathing with the music, the performer will be able to identify the undercurrent of energies that make up the musical work; where the phrases are pushed further, where they must be relaxed, and most importantly, what they are attempting to achieve. Edge and Rozario also prioritise breathing with the music in order to achieve physically embedded knowledge. Only through understanding the inner motion of the music can technique be developed and embedded. O'Brien's preparation of the "controllable environment" further iterates the importance of exploring the music and understanding the physical requirements. In the same way that intention directs the performer's purpose, here O'Brien believes that along with intention, comprehensive objective knowledge is required to bring the right emotion and expression to a performance. For Gregoriadou, in order to physically represent

[178] For example: Godoy, R.I., Leman (Eds.), 2010. *Musical Gestures: Sound Movement, and Meaning*. Routledge: Abingdon.
Kronland- Martinet et al. (Eds.) *Music, Mind, and Embodiment*. 11th International Symposium, CMMR June 16-19, 2015. Plymouth, UK.

the music, the performer must be a vessel that transmits the embodied knowledge in performance.

To refer back to Barthes' *"pheno-song"* and *"geno-song"*, these concepts are evidently similar to O'Brien's "tangible" and "intangible". The *pheno-song* and the "tangibles" are everything that is in relation to our controllable physical environment while the "geno-song" and the "intangibles" are more esoteric in that they encompass an aspect of performance that is subjective and experiential. Barthes further believes that the music may be accompanied by the soul, but if it is not accompanied by the body, it cannot lead to *jouissance*.[179] The *duende,* as theorised by Federico Lorca, "surges up, inside, from the soles of the feet."[180] This "mysterious force" still requires the physicality of the body (a vessel for Gregoriadou) in order to be realised. The mystery of the "grain" that Barthes has experienced and the "mysterious force" that Lorca describes both perceive the materiality of the body and highlight its importance in experiencing the transcendental dimension of music. Once again, these theories allude to experience of the metaphysical during a performance that highlights the importance of the body. Through the lens of a performer, this experience is achieved through embodying the music.

Gregoriadou and O'Brien's pedagogical approach on embodiment are similar to Edge and Rozario's, all highlighting the importance of embedded knowledge. While O'Brien speaks of preparing the "controllable environment" and Edge works towards knowledge that is physically embedded, they focus on the complete absorption of music in order to allow the physical representation of the music during a performance. For Rozario, the technique must become second nature in order to "inter-weave" with the music, the performer must be a vessel according to Gregoriadou, must release the embedded knowledge "into the wild" for Edge, and dive into the ocean of "intangibles" according to O'Brien. All of their accounts allude to a transcendental experience during the performance itself. Therefore, embodiment is the physical representation of the music that is achieved through absolute preparation of the

[179] Ibid. pp.182-183
[180] Lorca, (2007).

"controllable environment", through understanding the "inner motion" of the music and physically absorbing the gestures required to transmit the embedded knowledge. To embody the music is to fully understand the music and be a vessel that transmits this knowledge to an audience; this physical autonomy is a means to accessing the metaphysical during a performance. While intention and embodiment are subjective elements that can be developed in preparation for a performance, their end is to experience the transcendental dimension of music.

Transcendental dimension of music

The subjective and uncontrollable nature of the transcendental dimension of music makes this a challenging aspect to articulate. The interviewees all believe that they have experienced this aspect of music, but unlike the similitude in thought on embodiment, their accounts on this experience were quite varied. Gregoriadou experienced a cathartic "vital burning", while Edge experienced a state of "flow" relating to O'Brien's feeling of "freedom". She experiences this freedom by being connected to an energy within a "unified space" as Rozario "inter-weaves" with the music that offer insight through "illuminations". Just like Burke and his analogy of guests at a banquet, while the overarching experience of the transcendental dimension may be similar, each individual's experience is unique. Gregoriadou says, "transcendentalism is the tool a performer has in order to reveal sides of this unknown." [181] Through discussing the various experiences of a transcendental dimension of music, I can further elaborate on this "unknown" and its role in musical performance. This will first be done under the title of catharsis; then I will discuss 2 different experiences of freedom that Edge and O'Brien perceive of absolute freedom and finally, Rozario's experience on "inter-weaving" with the music in performance.

[181] Appendix 2, (2021) p. 128.

Catharsis

According to Gregoriadou, in order to live and breathe the music through its embodiment in performance, the performer must become an empty vessel. Within Buddhist spirituality, to empty oneself is to put aside things that one identifies with such as their personality, desires and ego. While being "empty" might be associated with negative connotations of missing something, here it is essential in embodying the music and allowing a transformation to take place.[182] This transformation is the "vital burning" described by Gregoriadou which is similar to Lorca's description of the arrival of the *duende*. The experience of catharsis is a deeply personal one, affecting individuals based on their perceived realities.

The result of Gregoriadou's "line of action" is the communication of music and being its physical representation in performance. She believes that there is a healing power and a metaphysical energy in music that could have a cathartic experience for performer and listener. In order to experience this phenomenon, the role of the performer as a vessel is highlighted. Performance is a living process where the music is transmitted through its embodiment. In doing so, the performer lives and breathes the music itself, allowing for an inner transformation to take place that Gregoriadou calls, a "vital burning". Lorca says that the arrival of the *duende* is not from an external source, but from within ourselves, and akin to Gregoriadou's belief, it is "a style that's truly alive".[183] The *duende* fills the performer from head to toe and the experience is shared by the listener, but it is not something that can be beckoned or induced during a performance. As a concept rooted in Spanish culture, to experience the *duende*, the performer must commit to the risk that is involved in exposing themselves and be accepting of death.

The performer's intention also plays a part in this transformation, as willing the *duende* to appear or catharsis to elicit a transformation is not the right approach. The intention must be focused on the role of embodying and transmitting the music to an audience.

[182] Rosenblit, Einav. 2012. 'Forgetting the Self as a Means for Spiritual Growth' in *Spirituality: New Reflections on Theory, Praxis and Pedagogy*. Ed: Martic C Fowler *et al.* Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press, pp, 138-139.
[183] Lorca, (2007).

As an uncontrollable element of performance, the occurrence of this transformation is a transcendental experience that is shared between performer and audience. During such a phenomenon, the performer undergoes a "vital burning", that Gregoriadou describes a "purification", entering a "zone of transformation" transmitting this dimension to their audience. This is also a practice that Kieran Milne calls this a "cathartic practice", a phenomenon that serves a self-developmental function.[184] He believes that the artist is able to learn more about themselves through an embodied performance and the experience of catharsis. So, this experience might, through embodying the music and approaching performance as a means of sharing a transcendental dimension of music, offer us insight into developing our practice further. This idea of growth and self-development is also echoed through the accounts of Edge, O'Brien and Rozario.

Experience of absolute freedom

Kenneth Edge and Sylvia O'Brien both talk of experiencing absolute freedom during a performance achieved through the complete preparation of elements within a controllable physical environment. While Edge discusses this experience through the concept of "flow", O'Brien shares a perceived energy within a dimension where the performer and listener are bound. The theory they present is that, through the absolute preparation of the tangible elements, its embodiment, the performer is immersed, allowing for the experience of freedom in performance. Their accounts evoke Steiner's view on musical performance as a form of art that offers us freedom from the constraints of time. I will discuss both Edge and O'Brien's accounts in conjunction with Steiner's view on the metaphysical "presence" in music and Karen Barad's theory on "intra-action" respectively.

Freedom through "flow"

The key to experiencing "flow" as proposed by Csikszentmihalyi and adopted by Edge, is through technical autonomy and an embodied performance. This allows the performer to feel a sense of control over their tangible environment and be consciously

[184] Milne, (2016).

immersed in the music. Csikszentmihalyi believes that this state is achieved by controlling the conscious mind through the commitment of "emotions and will" and continuous practice. The feeling they describe is not only of control, but also of being transported to another plane of consciousness in the mind. The level of focus directed towards an activity during such a state results in losing track of time and being oblivious to occurrences within the physical world. For Edge, embodied performance is the activity that allows the performer such experiences. Steiner, exploring various aspects of freedom, considers music to be an art form that allows the greatest freedom, one from physical time. The time of musical performance, he believes, is when we are most free; when we can push the boundaries of our imagination.

While Steiner shares his perspective of a metaphysical presence that exists within the arts, Edge and Csikszentmihalyi perceive this freedom as a result of physical preparation and control over the consciousness. These theories complement each other creating a complete picture of the transcendental dimension within the context of musical performance. What Steiner has not discussed, the question of *how* an artist uses their ability to access the metaphysical, is being theorised by Edge and Csikszentmihalyi in the form of fundamental approaches towards such an experience. And the question of *what* exists in this transcendental dimension of music is wagered by Steiner as a metaphysical "presence" or "being" that is revealed through such an experience. Their theories converge on the premise that such an experience is accessible through music and is a means to coming as close as humanly possible to the metaphysical.

Freedom within a "unified space"

The freedom experienced through "flow" is similar to the freedom that O'Brien experiences through entering a "unified space". Giving significant importance to the preparation of the controllable physical environment, she suggests that one can only access a transcendental dimension through this space which encompasses the tangible elements of a designated space, a performer immersed in the music, and a receptive audience. If these aspects all align during performance, the performer might be able to "elevate" to a dimension where everything is connected by an energy in a "unified

space". The energy is vital in fuelling the performance and allowing a better line of communication with the audience. O'Brien describes the experience as being connected with all aspects of the space, experiencing a sense of control over, and unified with, everyone and everything. It is a musically charged environment where only in connecting to that energy can one experience the transcendental aspects of the music.

In the case that a performer does not fully develop the controllable tangible elements, is unaware of the intangible elements, or does not prioritise the communication of the music to an audience, this transcendental experience cannot be experienced. In a similar manner, if a listener is not receptive to the music transmitted by the performer, they will not be able to experience this phenomenon. The responsibility within this space is shared equally amongst all individuals with a shared goal of experiencing the ritual of a musical performance. As stated earlier, there is an almost symbiotic relationship that takes place within this charged environment where ties are formed, sharing in the energy within that space, such as the performer-listener, performer-music, and music-listener. These ties, through the lens of Barad's theory, are a result of agential *intra*-action between entities that exist within that space. Without the presence of the audience the purpose of the performer ceases to exist and vice versa. The approach Barad presents on ontological relationships suggests that individuals materialise and become meaningful through "intra-action". Once again, *intra*-action gives us a new way of observing relationships as individuals gain meaning and the ability to act through their encounter with other entities. This suggests that we have a particular function and meaning with certain relationships creating a symbiotic environment. It is within this dimension that we intra-act with various entities creating a vast web of relationships.

Within this context, the environment of a musical performance offers meaning through a symbiotic relationship, intra-acting with each other. In performance, according to O'Brien, this relationship is experienced more as being bound to a metaphysical energy where the actions of each individual directly affect everything and everyone within that space. Here, the performer's role of communicating the

music through prior preparation of the controllable physical environment might result in the experience of absolute control over the physical world and enter a transcendental dimension, connected more affectively to the listener and music.

Inter-weaving with the music

Rozario has also experienced a sense of freedom while performing. Where Edge describes a state of consciousness in which the performer is completely immersed and O'Brien experiences being connected to an energy within which she can communicate more directly, Rozario's account is a combination of these accounts. Prioritising the absolute physical and technical preparation, Rozario suggests that knowledge gained externally must become second nature during practice. In performance, she describes being completely focused and immersed in the music which allows her to experience the transcendental dimension of the music. This is because her intention is to ascertain as much knowledge as she can from within the music itself, through conscious "inter-weaving". She accesses the state of "flow" through complete focus in order to delve deeper into the music and gain certain "illuminations". She does not simply want to experience a transcendental dimension; her intention is fixed on gaining new insight (intuitive knowledge) through "intra-acting" with the music.

The concept of the third eye as described in chapter 5 is also useful in interpreting Rozario's account. The third eye is vital in gaining inner knowledge, and Nityabodhananda believes that individuals must be fully absorbed in a quest of knowledge. The end to Rozario's practice is to gain knowledge, not through external sources, but knowledge obtained only through an intuitive exploration of the music in performance. The phenomenon of "inter-weaving" with the music also suggests that both the performer and the music form a deeper relationship, allowing the performer to gain intuitive knowledge from the music. While inter-weaning, the performer makes spontaneous decisions that elevate the performance and make it more affective. Therefore, the performer becomes the physical embodiment of the music, a vessel in search for further knowledge. In performance, experiencing the metaphysical, gaining "illuminations" and channelling them to an audience at the same time is Rozario's experience as a performer.

This, Rozario believes, cannot be taught to students due to its subjective experiential nature. Yet, the evidence highlighted in this section is the reason why students must be introduced to such topics of study. Just as author, Lloyd Alexander suggests, every individual must go through self-discovery in order to be "genuinely complete human beings"[185]. Through just the preparation of external empirical knowledge, we do not grow as performers and our practice remains one-dimensional.

Moving forward...

While a significant amount of the empirical data collected during this study showed that the experiential area of musical performance is not addressed in higher educational institutions, anecdotal evidence has proved that it has not been entirely overlooked. However, the language surrounding this area of music is still largely underdeveloped. This is the primary reason why it has not been included within the course structures of leading musical institutions around the UK and ROI. The discourse is kept alive by teachers who have experienced this phenomenon, and believe they are useful in the study of a performer, as they share their knowledge on the subjective elements in private lessons or as anecdotes in their lectures. The evidence gathered in this study has also shown that there is a shared understanding of the phenomenon of musical performance amongst those who have experienced it personally. So, in continuing to discuss these topics with performers and teachers, we might be able to further develop our understanding around this area of performance.

The aim of this research was primarily to shine a light on this subjective area of musical performance from the perspective of a young performer. What has been uncovered is that there is an area of performance that deals with the metaphysical in music. The similitude in preparation towards such a performance and description of the phenomenon itself evidenced the ability to discuss and incorporate the subjective elements in musical courses within higher education institutions. However, the first

[185] Alexander, (1974).

step is to acknowledge the existence of such a phenomenon. Since it is not something that can be rationally proven, it has not been adopted by institutions further leading to a linguistically underdeveloped area of performance. The transcendental dimension of music, according to the interviewees, must be experienced individually and cannot be easily taught due to its subjective nature. However, to discuss aspects of this phenomenon in the study of a young performer further enriches their knowledge and broadens their skillset in their preparation for a performance. Another reason why this aspect cannot simply be taught is the personal responsibility and curiosity that a student must possess. Discussions on the subjective aspects of musical performance need to be accompanied by personal deliberation in practice and experience in performance. Sylvia O'Brien's pedagogical approach of being an "enabler" is important in creating more conscious performers; conscious of their intention in preparing for, and of their subjective experiences during, performance.

The concepts of the "third eye", backed by the state of "flow", prioritises achieving a higher state of consciousness. The "third eye" is the "switch" that activates higher frequencies of energy, leading to a higher state of consciousness where individuals can access "inner worlds".[186] This is the metaphor I found fitting embarking on this journey towards unravelling the mystery that is the transcendental dimension of music. There are still many questions to be answered and many still to be discovered. Within the scope of this research, the intention to discuss the subjective elements in performance has been satisfied and its importance in practice and performance has been highlighted. Once again, the purpose of this thesis is not to promote religious or spiritual beliefs, nor is it attempting to prove the existence of a supernatural entity. Instead, it promotes the quest for intuitive knowledge, beyond the empirical.

The subjective elements that can be consciously developed during the period of practice include intention and embodiment. While intention is to establish the overarching purpose of the performance within the mind, it also fuels subsequent decisions in the physical preparation and representation of the music. To physically

[186] Sagan, (2007) p. 31.

embody the music is to fulfil the role of the performer as a vessel for its communication. The method of learning at this stage can be gestural imitation, following Edge's approach through *mimetics*, or visual learning, according to Gregoriadou's theory of "dreaming the painting and then painting the dream". Complete autonomy over the physical body during a performance allows the performer to communicate the music being fully immersed in the activity and achieving a higher state of consciousness. This is the ideal performance to which the interviewees allude when discussing the transcendental dimension of music.

Such rich and diverse knowledge was obtained through individual interviews with 4 professional performers and teachers. Further research, discussions and knowledge shared on this phenomenon of musical performance can only further enrich our understanding into the transcendental dimension of music. As Edge suggests, the academic field of Practice as Research is becoming more popular amongst performers who are able to document their work and present autoethnographic knowledge as part of their doctoral contributions. The continued rise of such modes of study will be vital in further broadening the more subjective and experiential areas of musical performance and will continue to encourage musical institutions to adopt such thinking. While some might still believe that the experiential aspects of performance cannot, or should not be discussed as it must remain a personal discovery, I believe this stems further growth.

The predominance of an objective study is the reason why Gregoriadou experienced a "void" in her studies, and as his career matured, Edge discovered the importance of intention and of performance being an end in itself, rather than the vain elements that surround it.[187] Within the current approach of musical pedagogy, technical skill and rationally compiled elements in the performance of music aimed at satisfying an assessment criteria is insufficient in the long-term growth of the performer. It is to be stressed that although these are subjective elements, it is possible to include such topics in the undergraduate study of a performer and it could be assessed through

[187] Appendix 1, (2021) p. 109.

means of a reflective report on the student's practice. On an individual level, discussing the transcendental aspects in music offers students and performers the ability to explore this aspect, be more introspective in their own practice in developing the subjective elements and enhance their consciousness surrounding this experiential aspect of musical performance. Therefore, I hope that this study might make a contribution to the pedagogy of music where this area of performance has been overshadowed.

Moving forward, as a performer, I will develop my practice incorporating the philosophical framework presented within this study. Although the scope of this research was fairly limited, I believe that the foundational framework developed opens doors for further discussion highlighting the missing aspect within current institutions and the benefit of adopting the subjective elements in musical practice. While my primary focus will be on the technical mastery and the objective knowledge on the historical and stylistic contexts, I will continue my quest for intuitive knowledge, exploring the transcendental dimension of music.

Bibliography

Books and Treatises

- Anscombe, G. E. M. (1957) *Intention*. United Kingdom: Harvard University Press.
- Bach, C.P.E. (1753). Trans. and ed. Mitchell, W.J. (1949). *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments [Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen]*. London: Eulenberg.
- Barad, Karen. (2007) *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*. United Kingdom, Duke University Press.
- Barthes, Roland. (1977) 'The Grain of the Voice', in Stephen Heath (trans. and ed.) *Image, Music, Text*. London: Fontana Press.
- Bergson, Henri. (1903) Translated by T.E. Hulme. *An Introduction to Metaphysics*. London: G.P. Putnam's Sons.
- Bassini, Carlo. (2008) Bassini's *Art of Singing: An Analytical, Physiological and Practical System for the Cultivation of the Voice.* United States: Plural Pub.
- Clark, Andy. (2008) *Supersizing the Mind: Embodiment, Action, and Cognitive Extension.* United States: Oxford University Press.
- Clifton, Thomas. (1983). *Music as Heard: A Study in Applied Phenomenology*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Csikszentmihalyi, Mihaly. (2002) *Flow: The Classic Work on How to Achieve Happiness*. US: Harper & Row.
- Doğantan-Dack, M. (2014) 'Philosophical Reflection on Expressive Music Performance', in Dorottya Fabian, Renee Timmers and Emery Schubert (Eds.) *Expressiveness in Music Performance: Empirical Approaches Across Styles and Cultures*. UK: Oxford University Press, pp. 3-21.
- Druce, Duncan. John Paynter, Tim Howell, Richard Orton and Peter Seymour (eds.) (1992). 'Historical Approaches to Violin Playing', *Companion to Contemporary Musical Thought*. London and New York: Routledge.

- Ericsson, K.A. and R.Th. Krampe, (1995) 'Deliberate Practice and Elite Music Performance' in John Rink (ed.) *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation*. London: Yale University Press.
- Garcia, Manuel, trans. by Garcia, Albert. (1924) *Garcia's Treatise on the Art of Singing*. London: Leonard & Co.
- Godlovitch, Stan. (1998) *Musical Performance: A Philosophical Study*. London: Routledge.
- Godoy, R.I., Leman (Eds.). (2010) *Musical Gestures: Sound Movement, and Meaning*. Routledge: Abingdon.
- Goehr, Lydia. (1992) *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Golby, David J. (2004) *Instrumental Teaching in Nineteenth-Century Britain.* England: Ashgate Publishing Limited.
- Gunn, John. (1812) *An Essay with Copious Examples Towards a More Easy and Scientific Method of Commencing and Pursuing the Study of the Piano Forte*. United Kingdom: Printed and sold for the author by Preston.
- Gunn, John, Haydn, J., and Handel, G.F. (1789) *The Theory and Practice of Fingering the Violoncello: Containing Rules and Progressive Lessons for attaining the Knowledge and Compass of the While compass of the Instrument.* United Kingdom: Author.
- Kirkman, Caroline. (2020) *Chakras for Beginners: Healing Yourself With Chakras and Meditatio:. A Complete Guide to Third Eye and Chakra Healing for Starters With Practical Exercises to Balance Your Chakras*. N.p.: Success & Power Management Limited.
- McKenna, Alex. (2016) *Third Eye: Third Eye, Mind Power, Intuition & Psychic Awareness: Spiritual Enlightenment*. 3rd Edition. N.p.: Lulu Press.
- Nityabodhananda, Rishi, (2009). *Ajna Chakra*. Bihar: Bihar School of Yoga.
- Reid, Stefan. (2002) 'Preparing for performance', in Rink, John (ed.). *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Reimer, Bennett and J.E. Wright (Eds.). (1992) *On the Nature of Musical Experience*. Colorado: University Press of Colorado.
- Rink, John (ed.) (2002). *Musical Performance: A Guide to* Understanding. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Ritterman, Janet. (2002) 'On Teaching Performance', in John Rink (ed.) *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rodmell, Paul. (2012) 'Introduction', *Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain*. United Kingdom, Ashgate Publishing Limited.
- Rosenblit, Einav. 2012. 'Forgetting the Self as a Means for Spiritual Growth' in *Spirituality: New Reflections on Theory, Praxis and Pedagogy*. Ed: Martic C Fowler *et al.* Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press.
- Sagan, Samuel. (1997) *Awakening the Third Eye*. 3rd Edition. N.p.: Clairvision.
- Spohr, Louis. (n.d.) *Grand Violin School.* Trans. Rodolphus, C. London: Wessel.
- Steiner, George. (1997) *Errata*. Great Britain: Weidenfeld & Nicholson.
- Steiner, George. (1989) *Real Presences*. London: Faber and Faber Limited.
- Quantz, J.J. trans. E. Reilly. (1966) *On Playing the Flute*. London: Faber & Faber.

Journal articles, research papers and lectures

- Alexander, Lloyd. (1974) 'Seeing with the Third Eye', *The English Journal*. May, 1974, Vol. 63, No. 5, pp. 35-40. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/813738.pdf?ab_segments=0%2Fbasic_search_gsv2%2Fcontrol&refreqid=fastly-default%3Ae8bfa6da9a35a4fa144d4c92f2a79bc8 (Accessed: 4th September 2021).
- Barad, Karen. (2003) ' Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, Vol. 28 (no. 3), pp. 815.
- Berlant, Arnold. (1999) 'Notes for a Phenomenology of Musical Performance', *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, Vol. 7 (no. 2), pp. 73-79. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/40327138 (Accessed: 13th July 2021).

- Burke, Kenneth (1961). 'Catharsis – Second View', *The Centennial Review*, Vol. 5 (no. 2), pp. 107-132. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/23737483 (Accessed: 12th January 2021).
- Candy, L. and Edmonds, E.A. (2018) 'Practice-Based Research in the Creative Arts: Foundations and Futures from the Front Line', *Leonardo*, Volume 51, Issue 1, February, pp 63-69.
- Cox, Arnie. 2011. *Embodying Music: Principles of the Mimetic Hypothesis*. Society for Music Theory. Vol. 17 (no. 2), July 2011.
- Doğantan-Dack, M. (2012) ' The art of research in live music performance', *Music Performance Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 34-48. Available at: http://mpronline.net/Issues/Dogantan-Dack%20FINAL%20120311.pdf (Accessed: 15th September 2021).
- Eken, A.N. (2002) 'The Third Eye', *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, Vol. 46 (No. 3), pp. 220-230. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/40017129.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3A5d8c10e9078c1a3a412e69881224de5e (Accessed: 25th August 2021).
- Ericsson, K.A., R.T. Krampe and C. Tesch-Römer. (1993) 'The Role of Deliberate Practice in the Acquisition of Expert Performance', *Psychological Review*, Vol. 100 (no. 3), pp. 363-406. Available at: https://www.gwern.net/docs/psychology/writing/1993-ericsson.pdf (Accessed: 4th November 2020).
- Fourcade, A and Khonsari, R.H. (2019) 'Deep learning in medical image analysis: A third eye for doctors', *Journal of Stomatology, Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery*. Vol. 120 (issue 4), pp. 279-288. Available at: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2468785519301582 (Accessed 24th November 2020).
- Gibbs, R.W. (2006) 'Metaphor Interpretation as Embodied Simulation', *Mind and Language*, Vol. 21 (issue 3), pp. 434-458. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0017.2006.00285.x (Accessed: 12th January 2021).
- Golden, Leon. (1962) 'Catharsis', *Transaction and Proceedings of the American Philological Association*, Vol. 93, pp. 51-60. Availanle at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/283751 (Accessed: 30th September 2021).

- Kronland- Martinet et al. (Eds.) *Music, Mind, and Embodiment*. 11th International Symposium, CMMR June 16-19, 2015. Plymouth, UK.
- Leman, Marc and Pieter-Jan Maes. (2014) 'The Role of Embodiment in the Perception of Music', *Empirical Musicology Review*, Vol. 9 (No. 3-4), pp. 236-246. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/293213841_The_Role_of_Embodiment_in_the_Perception_of_Music/fulltext/577e738508aed39f59949037/The-Role-of-Embodiment-in-the-Perception-of-Music.pdf (Accessed: 20th June 2021).
- Lorca, Federico Garcia. (2007) Translated by A.S. Kline. *Theory and Play of the Duende*. Available at: https://www.poetryintranslation.com/PITBR/Spanish/LorcaDuende.php (Accessed: 8th September 2020).
- Matyja, JR (2010). 'Embodied Music Cognition', University of Edinburgh. https://era.ed.ac.uk/bitstream/handle/1842/5325/PRACA.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y (Accessed: 30th May 2021).
- Milne, Kieran (2016), 'The Embodiment of Experience: Art as Catharsis', BA (Hons) Fine Art thesis, Dundee University, https://www.academia.edu/20637252/The_embodiment_of_experience_Art_as_catharsis_Speculative_realism_and_Somaesthetics_in_Contemporary_Practice (Accessed: 4th March 2021).
- Reybrouck M. (2005) 'Body, Mind and Music: Musical Semantics Between Experiential Cognition and Cognitive Economy', *Transcultural Music Review 9*. Available at: http://www.sibetrans.com/trans/a180/ body-mind-and-music-musical-semantics- between-experiential-cognition-and-cogni-tive-economy (Accessed: 3rd February 2021).
- Shahzad, Farrukh. (2018) 'Aristotle's Catharsis: Some Theories', *Journal of Emerging Technologies and Innovative Research*, Vol. 5 (Issue. 6), pp. 277-279.
- Ward, Graham. (1990) 'George Steiner's *Real Presences*', *Journal of Literature and Theology*, Vol. 4 (no. 2), pp. 237. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/23924508?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents (Accessed: 16th September 2021).

- Wulfhorst, Martin. (1998) 'Louis Spohr and the Modern Concept of Performance', *Das Orchester*, 46/7-8, pp. 2-9, Available at: http://www.spohr-society.org.uk/Spohr_Journal_25_1998_p2_Wulfhorst_Spohr_Modern_concept%20_of_Performance-2.pdf (Accessed 5th November 2021).

Online articles and resources

- Barnard Health Care, (n.d.). *Impulsemomentum Relationship*. Available at: https://www.barnardhealth.us/qualitative-analysis/impulsemomentum-relationship.html (Accessed: 20th October 2021).
- Birmingham Conservatoire. (2020-2021) 'BMus Hons' *Course Specifications*. Available at: https://www.birmingham.ac.uk/undergraduate/courses/music/music.aspx#TeachingAndAssessmentTab (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
- Guildhall School of Music. (2020-2021) *BMus Programme & module specifications & assessment criteria for 2020/21*. Available at: https://www.gsmd.ac.uk/music/courses/undergraduate/bachelor_of_music_honours_degree.html (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
- Harper, Douglas. (n.d.) *Intent,* Online Etymology Dictionary. Available at: https://www.etymonline.com/word/intent (Accessed: 3rd November 2020).
- Leibowitz, Rene. (n.d.) 'The Secret of Maria Callas'. Available at: https://www.rodoni.ch/busoni/callasleibowitz.html (Accessed: 30th October 2020).
- Merriam Webster Dictionary, (n.d.). *Duende*. Available at: https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/duende (Accessed: 8th September 2020).
- Royal Academy of Music. (2020-2021) *BMus (Hons) Programme Specification*. Available at: https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/piano-bmus, https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/voice-all-bmus, https://www.ram.ac.uk/study/courses/violin-bmus (Accessed: 10th October 2020).

- Royal Irish Academy of Music. (2020-2021) *Bachelor in Music Performance: Instrumental Handbook*. Available at: https://www.riam.ie/degrees-programmes/full-time/bmus-keyboard (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
- Royal Irish Academy of Music. (2020-2021) *Bachelor in Music Performance: Vocal Handbook*. Available at: https://www.riam.ie/degrees-programmes/full-time/bmus-vocal (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
- Schoenberg, Arnold (1928). *Moses und Aron*, Act 2, Scene 5. Available at: https://www.chandos.net/chanimages/Booklets/HA3314.pdf (Accessed: 20th September 2021).
- Shaffer, K.A. (n.d.) 'Maud Powell: A Pioneer's Legacy'. Available at: http://www.musicweb-international.com/classrev/2002/jun02/Maud_Powell.htm (Accessed: 30th October 2020).
- Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance. (2020-2021) *Programme Specification.* Available at: https://www.trinitylaban.ac.uk/study/music/ (Accessed: 10th October 2020).
- QS World University Rankings. (2020) *Performing Arts*. Available at: https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/university-subject-rankings/2020/performing-arts (Accessed: 10th October 2020).

Primary sources

- Appendix 1. (2021) *Interview with Kenneth Edge.*
- Appendix 2. (2021) *Interview with Smaro Gregoriadou.*
- Appendix 3. (2021) *Interview with Sylvia O'Brien.*
- Appendix 4. (2021) *Interview with Patricia Rozario.*
- Appendix 5. (2021) *Students' Experience Questionnaire.*

Appendix 1

Interview with Kenneth Edge

Kristina Ammattil: So, what I am researching is the phenomenon surrounding the moment of performance. As a performer, we know that it is a complex process. It is a situation where scientifically, so many parts of the brain are active and working at the same time. But as an individual, knowing that weeks and months of work has gone into preparing for a performance, working closely with the music, is there an intention behind delivering a performance? What is the role of the performer communicating the music to the audience? These are topics that I have unfortunately missed out on in my study as a performer, and so I want to discuss these topics. Such as, how to further elaborate the topic of embodiment of music, what does that mean. What is the intention with which we perform which also leads to, what is my role as a performer. What does that preparation and embodied learning all boil down to? What is it that I am hoping to achieve in that moment. So I just want to know a little bit about how you approach your practice towards a performance, and your experience. It is an interesting phenomenon and I really want to draw out what that experience looks like for you.

Kenneth Edge: Sure. That sounds fascinating. It's kind of exactly what I'm thinking about for the last couple of years! All of the exact kind of things. So I suppose if your crux of the research is embodiment? We take it into our system, and we kind of communicate it. The writing that I've been doing is what you'd call auto-ethnographic writing, I'm sure you know the research and the researcher are one and the same more or less. And I took a group of pieces by Irish composers that were written for me, one by Ben actually, it's one I love but it's really hard to play, so it was perfect to kind of go into this with? So I took 6 different composers, and two of the composers are much more rooted in traditional music than western art music. So that was kind of interest because I don't think that that's been hugely approached in the performance literature. It would be more to Western art music and the virtual kind

of 19th century kind of a thing. But by including those people in, I was able to get far closer to things about embodiment because two of the composers that I worked with that would use notation more as a performance cue than a deliberate absolute text that has to be. Well, there's nothing that has to be followed, but it doesn't give everything. It doesn't give every sort of meaning of the music, and it doesn't try to. It would kind of give the melody and ornamentation and various things like that are absolutely left, more or less, to the discretion of the performer. So there is an element of trust within that between the composer and the performer. The composer kind of uses the performer to complete the work. And that, from what I've discovered I've used that then to tie it into far more rigidly notated pieces such as Ben's piece which is forensically notated. But still outside of all that notation there's a huge amount of performance interpretation choices that can be made. Not only in preparation, you were talking the preparation, the process of preparation and then performance. So these choices can be made in preparation and in performance as well —choices are still alive within performance. So I suppose my kind of thinking took me away from, what would you call it, the idea of an autonomous score. And made me think of it as kind of an abstract, well not entirely abstract I'm sure composers will not like that, I mean an abstract set of instructions that don't really come to life until somebody performs them. I suppose it's anyway an interesting issue because the artistic research, artists and performers and such are coming into research, but the opposite isn't happening. Researchers aren't creating works of art in order to make a kind of circle of a thing. So that's a starting couple of ideas I guess.

K: Yes, I have also noted this in terms of performance and the performer being someone that takes a piece of music that already exists and simply presents it. But I think we have got a far more important role to not only take up a piece of music, but also to realise it within its creative context and also within our own perception of music and taking into consideration what that piece of music might mean to us. Currently, I think we are far more focused on the more tangible elements of technique and interpretation that allow us to be flawless performers but are in effect missing out of a more elusive aspect of performance since it does not seem to be discussed. These are very important skills that we must learn, but I have recognised

that there are more elements of performance that we can tap into and incorporate within our study and practice that might help us deliver a performance that is more affective. So, if we could start with a simple question: how do you as a performer, approach the practice of preparing for a performance?

KE: I do it as absolutely methodically as I possibly can. I do use tools that I am working on to help me with depending on the complexity of the notation of a piece. Generally, if they are first performances there are no records, you can't go listen to a recording, there's no way of contrasting an interpretation. I would use tools like, musical hardware and software programmes like ProTools and Logic and stuff like that just to create a scaffolding or something like that that gives me a way in to it. I mean, I go back to Ben's piece again, it's not possible to actually count to do the maths in your head as you're playing the certain kind of time signatures and stuff like that that are constantly changing. They're like 11/16 and things like that, so you just can't. So you work out a framework of absorbing this so that you're not trying to count it, it's sort of in your body that you're feeling very much as something innate. It's something that through repetition, the sort of physical body is just doing and you can rely on it to do that. That just goes into a lot of the kind of more psychological things like the sort of expertise studies and deliberate practice studies and things like that… really isolating issues and focusing on those. I suppose, I mean my feeling on it is that it's an incredibly personal thing, your physical reaction or your physical embodiment of music, it has to go beyond the mind. I do performances where we're focusing like mad and be aware of issues and problems coming up. That's just the nature of it, but in an ideal world the absolutely entire performance would be embodied through practice before any performance, because performances could go haywire for many reason anyway. So, my kind of thinking is to do absolute technical preparation and then releasing it into the wild in a performance. I think that's my kind of feeling on it.

K: Alright! So, this might be a tough question, but: how would you describe the experience of a performance?

KE: Oh… I mean, all performances vary. My own personal feeling of a performance that goes well is when you can step outside the performance as it is happening in sort of real time, and you are just watching from outside as you feel everything is under control. I suppose it's what would be called a kind of "flow state". What's that psychologist? Czikszentmihalyi. All those things about 'flow'. Arriving at a flow state where everything seems to slow down, you're stepping outside and everything seems under control and coming at you very easily. That kind of a flow state would be my ideal of a performance.

K: I had a previous interviewee who related it to the matrix. And I absolutely loved it, the idea of the 'flow', the fluidity of time when you're in that moment.

KE: That's exactly it. That's exactly, there's not pressure, sort of like when everything slows down and you're kind of… You have a feeling of control. And that's affected, not just by being technically on top of things, it's affected by the environment you're performing in. If you're not aware of the environment, if you've been distracted… I mean sometimes going into a hall and suddenly into a performance, it's kind of dangerous because there's so many distractions. That is important as well.

K: That's another thing that I'd like to ask next. Practice as we know is quite an isolated endeavour that we take on as musicians. We spend a lot of time, like you said on personal deliberation, there are a lot of things like embodiment itself, it's very personal. A lot of this cannot be taught after a point either. So from this almost meditative state of practice to a very public performance, a moment of culmination of all the work and deliberation, it's a dramatic shift. How would you describe that?

KE: Hmm, going from practice to performance… Well, I suppose if you have a couple of performances, if you have the opportunity to do the same performance a few times, that's a massive learning thing. I feel a lot of learning. I think intuitively we know a lot about the piece that we're playing through performance like there is an element or aspect of it that we don't learn in practice. Because after the performance you sit back and you think, "Oh no I should've done this" and "I should've done that". Things

become really clear. Mistakes that I make, I just say "oh my God", "how did I do that?" So through performance… I see a kind of continuum between between practice and performance. This kind of continual loop that you're still learning. So, I just have the learning thing in my mind still I'm doing performances otherwise I kind of slip into, I don't know, overly comfortable with something. So yeah, I am aware and I generally learn a lot through performance. Which adds pressure, I mean, if you spent months learning something and you have ONE performance… it's a really unnatural kind of a thing. It doesn't happen a lot with other things.

K: That's true. And what would you say, if you had a few performances lined up for a work and in your first performance you've noticed a mistake, would you say that for the next performances you would try and be mindful about that? You would prevent that mistake from happening again?

KE: Yeah I would be mindful in rehearsal but I tend to avoid…yeah, I would not think about it in performance. Of course that would be my own personal way of doing it, I try and get everything done in practice. As that gives me a sort of confidence in performance as well. I mean, there's a sort of confidence in feeling, "well, I've done as much as I can". I have worked as much as I can and I have done as much as I can. So this is it. Going into a performance thinking "If only I had another week to have prepared this it would be so much better", you're probably in trouble.

K: Yeah that's what I think as well. Regardless of how much I assure myself that I am well-rehearsed for a performance, I find that I am not able to control very much during a performance.

KE: Yeah. There's writing about it, you know, there's a good writer I can't think of her name… Dack. She has a piano trio, she's great, she writes a lot about artistic research and stuff. She also writes not just about preparation, she's written really good papers on performance. How she's learnt through performance.

K: And what was her first name, sorry?

KE: M-I-N-E Mine. She has a middle name D-O-G-A-N-T-O-N. She's done tons of research into performance and that sort of a thing. Academic research into it as she's doing it.

K: Sort of like performance as research, or practice as research that's coming up at the moment?

KE: Yeah, it's that kind of a thing!

K: Alright, thank you! And you have been teaching for a number of years as well, haven't you?

KE: Yes I have, yeah.

K: So, as a teacher, how do you approach the pedagogical side of performance? Knowing that a lot of these things cannot be fully taught? How is that you approach the pedagogy of performance?

KE: Well, all of the experiences you're talking about are all totally subjective. I mean, the pedagogy, just physically teaching an instrument and stuff like that is pretty straightforward. All of that correct thing, correct technique, I mean, it's not straightforward, but it's something that can be quantifiable. And they are the things that are easy to teach. The more subjective things, I would imagine they come through offering some sort of inspiration, for want of a better word, inspiration or insight of thinking about the music. Also, thinking about why you are playing the music you're playing, why you've chosen this piece, what do you think of this piece? Some of my students, they would just play a piece because it is part of the canon and stuff like that…they just learn it. So it's funny, yeah, all those subjective things, they can't be discussed but aspects of it can. I give kind of reading lists to students, I ask them to listen to various recordings that I have found and I would kind of ask them to explain why they say what they say if they don't like it, or if they thinking something about

it. Just to try and engage with discussion even with two totally differing opinions on the same performance by somebody. I try and have a dialogue where I would try and put in the words… but words are a bit of a waste of time when you're teaching music, but you try and put it in to words why you think this is really good, and then you ask them to put into words why they think this is really good or whatever. But words only go so far. I suppose, I play a lot in lessons as well. Some teachers don't play at all, that's fine, that works as well. It's completely subjective. But I try and inspire students to engage with why they're doing what they're doing.

K: Yeah. So, a few things there. I do find it fascinating that you mention that these things that you initially learn as a performer are almost quantifiable. It is troublesome to say that most of what we learn as performers are objective elements in the sense that they are quantifiable, you almost put a finger on it [points at vocal chords] and say "it's here", this is the technical skill you must achieve with this phrase, this is the manner in which you might be able to use your body in order to carry out this technique and so on. What I am hoping for is more discussions on things that you are not able to put a finger on. The "objective" elements are very important and are vital in the study of a performer, but there are other elements that are going unnoticed. You had mention inspiration as well, and that leads me on to the next question: what do you think is the role of 'intention' in the practice of a performer? Why you are picking up a piece of music like you said… what are your thoughts on this topic.

KE: Oh I think it's absolutely fascinating, I mean, and it changes. It's not something that is rigid, it changes from when you begin learning an instrument and it's tied into the ageing process. The intention is the big one, I think. When we start to lean an instrument, I'm only speaking of instrument sorry.

K: One might argue that the voice is also an instrument, and I am interested in hearing about experiences of performers of different disciplines.

KE: I speak out of external instruments. I mean, I started as a child in wind band, so my very first thing was in a wind group, this incredibly loud, really bad, everyone

playing at the same time. But what happens at that age is, everybody kind of wants to show off their prowess on their instrument it's an extraordinary thing. I mean, technically in wind ensembles, more so than in string or orchestral setting which are a little bit more controlled. But the wind ensemble is fascinating, it's a kind of concertinos and the trumpets are being made a carnival and everyone is making this noise as they're warning up. So there's this kind of, the first intention is like "listen to me' or "look at me". I think that's the very first intention, but as we grow older I think it takes a while for the intention to become, "I want to interpret this piece of music by this wonderful composer, and I'm going to do it justice." I think the intention for quite a while remains "this is me, this is what I do", "listen to me", and "look at me" and whatever. That kind of intention is pretty intrusive and it does stay with a lot of people for a long time. I think that sort of ties into, as we get older, there's a theory I was reading about that I don't fully understand called "self-determination theory". That might mean, I am Ken and I am a saxophonist. So I would identify as a saxophonist as opposed to someone who plays the saxophone. A big part of my identity becomes what I do. And then I think you become very vulnerable then, you know, when your identity can be based on the fact that you're doing this. So the intention is extraordinary. As I get older, my intention is really focused on the music and try and serve the music to move away from "this is what I can do" and stuff like that. So all of those kinds of level of intention.

K: And has this idea been discussed when you were a student? Either in your undergraduate year or following education as a performer?

KE: No! Not things like this.

K: So it's fairly recent?

KE: Yeah, none of this. The early years of learning were very much geared towards things like… there's an exam coming up, this is the repertoire, do this and try and pass. You know, everything is kind of goal focused.

K: And you do teach undergraduate students now, don't you?

KE: Yes, and I've also got a master's student!

K: And would you say it's the same as when you were in your undergraduate years as well? Or has it changed in any manner or form?

KE: A lot of it is similar. There are changes in that knowledge is completely free, accessible so I think some of the spark has disappeared I think. The idea of "legendary performances" has sort of disappeared because everything is totally available. Whereas, there used to be an aura about certain performers and stuff like it that nobody had really heard them. You know, kind of hard but, 19th century Paganini, nobody has ever heard him but there's this legend that has persisted. But that feeling of "legend" has, sorry I am getting off the subject, but it's just something of interest to me that this feeling of the "legend" has gone because you can just look someone up on YouTube. So, I suppose yeah things have changed in terms of somethings: attention spans maybe has slightly sort of, lowered… But some things are brilliant. The accessibility of knowledge is incredible. That's just incredible.

K: You can almost reach out and grab on to whatever you'd like to learn.

KE: Yeah from your home.

K: Yeah I know! And that sort of idea, what students are learning at the moment, like you said, some of it seems like the magic has diminished since we have all this information at our fingertips. Part of my research has been to look at the syllabi from institutions within the UK and Ireland, and I have found that these elements are rarely, if ever, talked about. This idea of a pedagogical structure that focuses primarily on the more objective elements might have led to such a situation where we are unable to discuss elements that are less tangible and much harder to discuss. I am currently trying to articulate this in a way that won't get me into trouble.

KE: Haha yes, never to be seen again! Yeah I know, it is true. I do agree completely.

K: Yeah. Moving on from intention to another element I have found to be quite interesting. That is the embodiment of music. Have you ever had to explain to a student what that might mean, or had a discussion with peers about it?

KE: I do talk about it all the time. The physicality of things, and just the absorption of things I suppose. Where something goes beneath the conscious level and becomes innate, it becomes a skill that is inside. That would be a big part of learning. Not automatic, but something that is not, what do they call it? The cartesian thing where your mind and your body are separate. I think it's called cartesian dualism, so NOT that. You're sort of using the body to learn music, like the body is learning it physically. It's both basically through repetition and I think mimetics… miming what you're hearing and seeing physically. And I mean, I'm not a neurologist, but one aspect that I was reading about, there's an amazing book called *Mimetics* by a neurologist musicologist Arnie Cox and it's all about this. It's all about mirroring your arms and stuff like that and how we can sort of… how our bodies learn and then it becomes, you know, it's not conscious learning. It's not from the top-down, it's from the bottom up basically. So I do, I talk about that all the time with the students. Generally because I mean, a lot of the gesture and a lot of the physicality training with the saxophone, it's difficult to do naturally, it's difficult to actually do it. So a lot of my teaching would be about the body, the body doing and being under little pressure as possible or strain or stress as opposed to the brain being the main focus. The embodiment in this is very important. And also because I train traditional music as well, the embodiment is an absolutely central part of that. And gesture with rhythmic gesture and how our bodies are with our instruments… more so than in Western art music I guess. People are more physically connected in traditional music, and in jazz, the people almost mould themselves into the shape of their instruments so that their body is completely involved. And classical music, someone like Glenn Gould like absorbing the piano physically. Yeah, I supposed everybody's body is central to what they do.

K: Yeah, and I think that does make this a completely subjective process. That's why I wanted to have this conversation with you and other performers and educators. It's hard to put a finger on, and some might find that it is not worth putting a finger on. I would like to know what you think. Do you believe that these are elements worth discussing in the study of a performer?

KE: Incredibly, and we are miles behind. I have been reading a lot of sports psychology, and music psychology is so far behind that and so much to learn. When I was writing about embodiment, the most fascinating think that I found out is that these articles and books, articles mostly by John Sutton. And he writes about cricket, about how cricketers develop the innate skill and how they embody everything they're doing in cricket so that their bodies are absolutely secondary to their bodies. The writing is brilliant, and it's completely applicable to music students, 100 percent. Everything he says, like the physical thing, our bodies choosing the exact right reaction to something without our brains being involved at all. So that sort of writing in sports psychology is, I suppose better funded. There's loads to be learnt there about embodiment. And that's performance. They think of sport as performance obviously, so yeah, that kind of thing. Those should be cherry picked and taken into musical performance preparation I think.

K: Definitely, and why do you think this has not been the case within the field of music? Most of the performers that I have spoken to have expressed a similar view. This part of the research seems quite limited.

KE: I think it's because performers are only starting to be involved within the research. I think performers were the subject of research previously and now performers are actually doing the research. And it's far more relevant to actual performance than it would be more so than I suppose maybe the musicological aspects may not have the same relevance, the performance aspect of it. But I think because it's been maybe only 20 years now that performers have been really doing research. This kind of research that we can call academic research and I think that's the reason it's only cropping up now.

K: That is interesting, I do agree with that. And it's been interesting trying to navigate this research through interdisciplinary topics, I am definitely going to look into John Sutton and his research in the field of cricket.

KE: Oh it's brilliant. And bizarrely he's actually quite funny? Unusual, but totally academic as well! His paper seems to be famous, I mean, the practice about cricket is secondary it's about performance. Physical performance, human performance.

K: There's so much to learn from these different fields. One of my biggest influences is Federico Lorca's theory of the *duende*, and I am attempting to incorporate the theory within my research and within the field of Western Classical music performance. I do understand why technique and interpretation are important skills to master. You have got to be able to communicate what you've realised through the music, and the only way one might be able to do that to a high standard is through these skills. You do need your tools for communication. But there are these interesting yet elusive topics as well to discover. Another one is the idea that there is a transcendental dimension that music can transport you to. How one might deliver this as a performer is another fascinating topic that I have come across. As a performer, have you experienced this? What are your thoughts on this?

KE: Oh…that's like… there was a lovely quote by Daniel Barenboim which says, "the opium in music". That's the thing that everyone is looking for. In every art, it's that opius that you sort of float away. That's the purpose of it. Just to go back to one think you were saying, you were just talking about what we can hope to be as technically perfect as possible and deliver what we can. There is a lot of thinking in musicology that the score is absolutely open-ended and that it's impossible for one performance to deliver a score. There's a lot of academic writing about that, Rink and those guys. I think that sort of "the opium in music" or "the opium in art" it's the whole reason for the whole thing. And I suppose that's what I suppose keeps it out of the academic world. It could be frowned upon by people who rely on objectivity because that opium is a 100% subjective. You can't put that into words. So writing

about it, I'm writing about it in injunction but sort of listening to it probably works you know? The way people are writing now is very multi-media and stuff like that so all of this can be brought in which is brilliant. But yeah, that transcendent thing… it definitely does not happen every time. It can be seldom enough, but it is fantastic when it does. But it is a drug, I suppose it is an opium that's it.

K: And expressing that you do believe that this should be incorporated within the study of a performer, we've talked about the fact that these surely must be discussed but there are things that we are simply unable to put into words. How do you think we might be able to tackle this conundrum?

KE: I think, passion? Passion is actually an academic subject now. I have been reading papers on passion which is fascinating. I know you might think this is going to be dreadful, but it's not. Passion can be spoken about, it's not ineffable and it's also kind of academic. So the things been reading about, the papers by this Kay Anders Ericson, wrote about expertise in sports and music and chess. Just in general expertise. He wrote tons about that, and he wrote that innate talent is not as important as deliberate practice. So it's all completely open, I don't fully agree with that, but the deliberate practice thing, one thing that we found was amazing. He writes a lot of medicine, medical practitioners tend to plateau at a particular level because they're meant to keep learning all the time, and they have to keep learning all the time because medical practice changes. But a lot of them don't so experience and repetition are not the most important things in medicine even though a lot of people think they are. So a lot of medical practitioners tend to plateau because they can sort of do their thing without even being aware of it. I'll look it up, someone wrote a brilliant paper about it. And the fact that the step beyond that is passion. When you're learning you're told what to do, "do this", "learn this" a lot of the time. But when you're older, it's intrinsic. It has to come from inside why you're doing it. Without the passion for what you're doing, you're kind of doing it at another level. I suppose passion would be somewhat similar to *duende*. That can be spoken about. That has been researched how practitioners tend to peak without the intrinsic sort of, pushing themselves, and they rely on reputation. They kind of a thing.

K: And would you say "passion" and this hunger for knowledge almost, the practice of continuous learning. Do you think that could be nurture to a certain extent? Do you think that might be possibly taught or cultivated in a young performer?

KE: I'm not sure it can be taught. I think it's very from inside. I think the importance of it can be taught, to be continuously curious. Some people are like that naturally, and some people are not. So I do think that it should be taught, because there are great performers that do peak and do rely on reputation. There's a huge amount of performers who do that. There's always a risk involved in taking on something like standing up in public and performing.

K: Alright, that's all I wanted to ask you today. It is always great to see a different perspective to things so thank you very much!

Appendix 2

Interview with Smaro Gregoriadou

Kristina Ammattil: So, Ms. Smaro in your practice as a pedagogue and a performer, how is it that you approach the pedagogy of musical performance?

Smaro Gregoriadou: You know gradually into the years I started to realise that something was going wrong. With my technique… I could not find what it is exactly, but I was always trying to give answers or deepen the questions actually, that what is it to be a real performer. And what is the real essence of performance. Some very great ideas were coming into my antennas such as: it was *gravitas*. Bach told that in order to have a great performance you need to have *gravitas*. Or *duende* by Garcia Lorca, which is amazing. Or, the Ancient Greek *catharsis* which is the purification mentioned in Greek drama. And so I started to see what the great pedagogues had to say. I remember I was reading a correspondence by Arnold Schoenberg, and it was a letter to a 21-year-old conductor then, and Schoenberg talks about an *inwardness* intensified. And he told what you do is passion, okay, passion is okay, but what is needed here is a higher form of an emotion which is an inwardness intensified and nobody can reach this kind of space in performance very easily. And he said that for the underlying emotion to be, you don't have to demonstrate such inwardness, you have to feel it. So I realised immediately that what I missed was to be able to feel this kind of emotion. Even though I had the technique, even though I had the musicological background, and even though I had this "musicality" (which I don't know what it means even today), I saw that there was a huge void behind. So, all these words could not give me this radical change. An experience which was more radical than we have. So I started to observe things in the education programmes, I mean, universal educational programmes. I saw that most of the music schools and universities, they see the student as a machine to play fast and loud —and I could see that in myself as well, and my fellow musicians, we felt an awkward feeling and we tried to hide this. We created a good surface: our technical abilities, with temperament, we used

style but it was a void behind. So, gradually, I realised the importance of *embodiment*. For instance, I could hear a Chopin mazurka by, let's say, the giant Ignaz Friedman, and you could dance! I mean, you could see him playing or hear his recordings and you could feel that in this mazurka that he played it was not a dance, it was a representation of a dance, like a Bach suite, etc. You could feel that you are dancing; all your body is taking part to this. I also saw actors of great performances, great directors, you could see that for them, of course, for an actor the body is an asset. The voice is an asset. But I could feel that for them embodiment was a huge awakening of a collective memory, like they evoked the ancient shaman and remind all of us of our common destiny —which was very important to me.

Gradually, I was trying to decode all the physical laws, necessities and causalities that are involved in what we name as *embodiment*. And I realised that the key to this is the inner motion, the undercurrent of emotion and energies that are masterfully woven inside the musical fabric by each composer. As a Greek, I always remember Aristotle who says that, "Life exists only in motion". So, what is this inner motion about? What Charles Ives, for instance, let's go to the other side of the pond, said "For God's sake, what does music have to do with sound?" Meaning that there is something hidden in that we have as a performer to bring into play. So, movement is the first thing that has to go with embodiment, and you see that for instance, all the essays from the period of Husserl's time they speak about movement and they give some characteristics of movement. They say it is a spirit, a feeling, it has a character, it is *grave*, it is *lento*, it is *largo*… and they say it has a speed, it has a tempo. But what about the direction of the movement? How about the energetic identity? I talk about all these things because they are crucial parts of my pedagogy as well. If for example you take a chaconne by Bach, you have on the surface beautifully put notes and chords and everything. But it is like you have the surface of the sea, or the drawing of a face, but what exists under? The undercurrent of the scene, what exists as the emotions of the piece? This is my terminology of what inner motion actually is… and so, until now I realised that to understand the secret of the rhythmical syntax of the piece, the melodic syntax, to know about the form, and the formal aspects of the piece as we studied in musicological terms —most of the time it's not enough because what you

should do as a pedagogue I do as a performer as well —what I do as a pedagogue, I do as a performer, it's not a different thing. So I understood that it is understanding the energetic content, how the music generates and the composer's vision on dramaturgy of the piece is totally another story. So, embodiment, this is the secret of embodiment and I started to encourage my students to be able to physically embody or incarnate if you will, or animate every single aspect of the form, of the plot, of the texture, of the fabric of the flow of the piece. And of course in order to do that relatively, you have to activate all your available human universal resources of expression which is: breathing, singing, which is moving and gesturing. So, this is the main approach of my pedagogy which I have called 'Inclusive Interpretation, Function and Technique'. I would very gladly tell you some things now about how I mean embodiment, what exactly I mean and how do I process and approach the sense of embodiment. Do I talk a lot?

K: Haha, not at all, I am enjoying it. I am absolutely loving this! The approach towards embodiment and how you convey this to a student isn't it?

SG: Yes, this is very important. This is a very difficult thing because the main answer the student asks me is "okay Smaro, when you are not there how do we embody the music?" So, trying to awake this embodiment business, we try to create a line of action which is a living script that can reflect the inner motion of the music, what has been going on underneath. What are the different psychic states of the piece, different forms and processes. These elements, are they static, are they dynamic, are they transformative? Where does this transformation go? Do they trigger new energy or what? So "line of action" means a sequence of all the subsequent energetic quantities that are to be found in the hidden dramaturgy of the piece. So let's see, I will speak with examples: So if you have a fugue or if you have a sonata, there are always some very well defined external events that are going on. The theme for instance in the fugue, there is a theme, there is a counter theme, episodes and so on… but how can you find, how can you embody the hidden reality behind all of this? First of all we have to try to recognise some kind of laws that exist and that are present in great

compositions. For example, we have the law of 'hold and release', this is a very common law that we have —always in Bach's music, or Baroque music. What is this? This is the logic of the arrow hold and release. So, if you take for instance a prelude, a violin sonata by Bach (1006) [hums tune]. There you have this principal into play, it is very clear. In the first place Bach releases *breathes in* [hums first measure] this is a release, and then 'mi-fa-sol-la-sol-fa-mi' [hums seconds part of theme] this is the generating action, You see how he holds and how he releases the action and all these I encourage my students to dance with them, to breathe with them, to move with them, and to sing. Another thing, if I can give you some examples, is the way we try to phrase each phrase because we say 'phrasing' but what does it mean (bodily terms)? And I have seen over the years that our breathing does the main phrasing, whereas our body, from shoulders to waist let's say, they are doing the gestures of the phrase, and then the fingers just put the details —the articulation between the staccato and legato. So, let's take any theme in any fugue by Bach, maybe the most known [hums, breathes in and out representing the flow of the phrases]. This is the phrasing, the general image is made by the breathing whereas then the body comes to do the gestures. You give and you take back. Then you have the fingers either the violin, or for us guitarists, you have the small details that can be put in there and that have to do with the performance taste. As Donald Kirkpatrik said, "great music has some inherent musical notes that you don't have to interfere with." So, I don't want my students or myself to expose the personality, just the opposite. I want them to annihilate the personality in order for the real content of the music to draw forth. And I will give you a third example about the embodiment. So for instance, in the western notation (which is in many aspects very deficient but this is a another story) we see some directions like for instance *vivace* and *allegro*. Yes, but what kind of *allegro*? This is *andante*, well what kind of *andante*? This *ritenuto*, this is *accelerando*. So for the *ritenuto*, what kind of *ritenuto*? Is it hesitating? Is it delaying? Is it lingering? Is it postponing? And the *accelerando*, is it a resuming motion hurrying forward? What kind? Is it made with the body, is it made with the mind? Because you feel something. This is all a part of the embodiment business and this is very interesting to see how pieces are transformed by the same student or the same player all these rules are being involved in their playing. The most important factor I think is to be able to negotiate

with your own breathing. And especially in the beginning, breathing gives the initial momentum to breathe movement from a dead matter, the score —some black signs there. We need to have the initial breathing and then, you have something very important, which I try to give to my students as well, it is the impulse, and how the impulse is connected to the intention of the performer. When I say impulse, is what happens to the body of the musician or the singer or the actor, before the action. It is like an esoteric motivation so I see you 500m ahead of me and your wallet has been falling from your pocket and I want to shout at you, "Kristina your wallet!" Okay? This is my initial impulse, which an important thing, this initial impulse if it is true and if it is genuine it will create the right necessity. So I will raise my voice as much as needed and I will raise my hand as much as it is needed and I will create an intention which is always right IN-tension. Okay? This is always right when the impulse is right, is clear and is sincere. So, intention creates the right muscular activation and not vice versa because you see performers try to exhibit all their muscular abilities (how nice, how loud, how beautifully, how fast) but this is not important for me. For me it is to create the right impulse through embodiment and then the right activation, the right intention so as to use the right motor skills accordingly. So I think this is what I can say for now about embodiment.

K: I did enjoy that, so with especially impulse and intention, I think you do have performances that come with the primary intention of showing off this talent. Not just the talent, but the skill of, like you said, how loud you can get, or how fast your runs can be and so on. So what does go missing is the music and I think the music, it comes from an inspired place and it has been delivered through this inspiration and that work and that relationship that as a performer you must have with the music. So you said that your role as a performer and as a pedagogue is not too different, they are very much interlinked. But as a performer during a performance, how do you approach a piece of music in particular. In terms of embodiment, in terms of intention and also going towards that moment of performance. What is it? How do you mentally prepare for it?

SG: Exactly, this is where the embodiment business leads us to because we have to have some practice room strategies cause otherwise how can we make all these things real? So yes, I have three main strategies, two of them I take the name by what Van Gough, describes: "I dream of painting and then I paint my dream." So my strategy no.1 is dream my painting. What does it mean? Trying to create during my practice an ideal mental image of figuring out what I like a phrase to sound like —how I dream my sound. What I want to hear while I play, trying to forget the technical difficulty, you know? So creating an ideal of the sound, dream the sound that you want. And, for me, I try to do as much exact and accurate mental image and choreography of the piece in play and if this mental image can be strictly repeated in my head (if I can repeat it over and over again and be the same like the actors), then it is for me a sign that it is time to go to the technique; it is time to go to the 'hands'. And somebody would say, "okay, but where is the spontaneity?" But I have seen that a high level spontaneity can only come to play when you have an exact, strictly structured piece to work on. So spontaneity is impossible without intention. So this is what I am trying to do into the first stage of dreaming my painting.

And then comes the 2nd part, which is exactly what it is: painting my dream. Which is use our technique and all our motor skills and all other skills to make our vision real. So, you reflect your mental image to your hands and here, of course, we have many techniques with which I communicate with my students and we talk about a host of things like how you warm up, how you use your metronome, how you use variety and alternativeness in your playing, how you use different rhythms and dynamics and articulations, how you negotiate with the stimuli. For instance, if I play soft and very light, if I lower the stimulus, then my brain is capable of more refined connections so I have many things to gain. On the other hand, I have to exercise my power to play loud, again as a result of my right impulse and intention. So, we talk about things like how you use your metronome: is it always there? In what proportion, or how do you distribute the beat? Do you use the metronome for bigger beats, slower beats? The pulse, how do you subdivide the pulse, how do you feel the pulse? How do you experience the down beat, the up-beat and things like that? Or things like

synchronicity. How do you synchronise your two side of your body? What does slow practice mean? You understand all these things that are important in order to make your dream real. And now it is the third, and very important strategy, that is the simulation of the performance practice. So what do you do for the performance practice?

Number 3: What I am interested in, is to be able to have an interpretation that is able to transmit in real time to the listener all the power of music, which can be healing, can be transcendental, all the spiritual things it has, and having a cathartic experience for both the performer and the audience. I have seen that in order to achieve that, you need from the part of the performer something which I call a 'vital burning' of the performer. But, we can talk about this in the actual experience of the performer. As for the mental practice, you have to know what are the difficulties involved in getting into the stage. So, what we do with my students is to realise what is, as Perlman said, "you have to know the end, you have to know how to deal with the beast." So the stress, we were very much talking about the stress response, and we have seen that this has the three ways to be expressed. The first is, of course, the physical response (what happens physically to our body), what happens then mentally to our body, and what happens to our emotions.

So, this third strategy of performance practice includes playing to other people, or playing in front of microphones in order to see. For instance, I put my student to observe "Okay, today you will play 20mins of music, of your music, and your aim is to observe what are your physical responses, what happens to your body." I have here some answers: "my muscle contracts, gets stiff and tired" says one. Then, "my respiration changes, my breathe becomes shallow." And for each one of them, we try to give a solution for the next time. So if, for instance, your respiration changes, it becomes still while you play, then you will do these exercises in the wing/wings. This is how we approach, we just observe and write down what is my physical response. And then we try, for each one of the students (because everyone is different), we try to find out what are the best solutions for him or her. Then, the mental response: "my brain speeds up" says a student, "and my sense of time changes." So how do

you get the student to slow down the speed that he or she feels during a performance, and have some more natural and realistic tempi. I can speak for hours about that, but the idea is that you have to beat all the criticism that you give yourself, all the worries, the doubts, the self-chatter that goes and goes. And actually, it is a defensive condition. We are going on stage already in fear. Whereas, what I try to encourage my students to do is to have a reasonable brevity. If you have done this line of actions, as I call them, and if you are very clear on what is your impulse and what is your intention, then you don't have many things to fear, believe me. If you know, of course, how to proceed with them. So the experience of the performance is a very fruitful experience, even in the first stages. But, you cannot leave the students in the desert, in the abyss of this task without having done all this, you know?

K: Yeah, I know, I really like that: removing the defensive mechanism, the constant chatter that is always there. As a performer, it distracts a lot as well, and I think removing yourself from the equation, yes you are the performer, but you are the performer there on a duty. And this comes back to intention, and this is also what I am trying to understand and articulate on my own. What is the relationship between you (as a performer) and the music? And what is the relationship between you and the audience. There is always a relationship. Philosophy is ingrained in such a topic, and I think it is most evident in our own experience. So, during that moment of performance, are you able to articulate what that experience is like for you?

SG: I will do it as much as I can, because exactly what you said about you are not the centre of the world. You are a vessel, and if possible, an empty vessel in order to allow the reality of the piece, and the composer to come through. And so, to reflect what is being going on in the music, this is what exactly I mean by saying this 'vital burning' which is connected to this living reality. Which is not much different than the procedure that was made in the ancient times in which the performer had to find ways in order to get into this zone of transformation in order to provide for the audience new symbolic contents, I would say. New symbolic contents, new consciousness, new awareness. And this is really the most important social impact of music. And if you present your personality during the performance, then

you don't allow enough space for this transformation. If you already are there, what kind of transformation is this? You have to allow to empty yourself. This is a very important thing for what the ancients called "catharsis" or "purification". So, music is abstract and concrete at the same time and interpretation is experiential; it is a living process. It is not Moses' order carved into the stone. So we don't reproduce notes, we just live again, breathe again, become again those notes. And in order for that to become real, we have to do all this—for the embodiment. You start your interpretation with just breathing, allow yourself to breathe as simply and modestly and possible. And then you just follow the line of actions that you have prepared in your practice room. You try to remember this has become your body, and you have to remember them and treat the performance as a natural extension of what you did in the embodiment stages. And all of a sudden you see that the musical spirituality starts to react and the people, as you said, start to interact. This is an amazing thing. And the only thing I can tell you for sure is then a whole mechanism of protection starts to be active for the performer. This magical here and now—the sound images, the kinaesthetic input, the emotions that doesn't have to do with the self-criticism, but have to do with what has been going on 'here and now' and what it feels like to produce this sound here and now, this is an amazing experience. As far as I can tell, this is really a transformative procedure for the audience as well, and I enjoy it very much when I see it for myself.

K: Yes, I do agree but are you able to describe this very easily? So I think with this research that I am undertaking, it is quite challenging in that I am trying to articulate such an experience. It is evident, it is experienced, but when I try to discuss this topic, the words seem to move further and further away. At my age and where I am at the moment, I don't have a developed understanding of the philosophy and the technical workings behind such a phenomenon. All I do know is that I feel it. And that is what is driving me to understand and find out what this is. So, what you have just shared really does help, of being the empty vessel and having a particular intention/impulse.

SG: I don't think that these are getting into the zone. In the zone where you experience this vital burning, of this *duende* feeling by Lorca. It is not something to explain because explanation changes the truth, even one word changes it. So if you feel it, if you come to feel that way, the more unable you are to explain that, the more true it is. The closer to truth it is. So it is very important that you try to feel and chisel as much as you can this emotion inside. But this is not very easy to share. We only can share images. I can tell you that it is like meditation or it is like the sea. But this is not important, for everyone it is different I think.

K: Yeah, I agree. To go back to the vital burning, or *catharsis*, how do you understand this concept?

SG: It has to do with the transformation feeling that comes into play. It is kind of upgrading our human consciousness because you become a lens. You reflect during this vital burning. Like in ancient drama for example you have Oedipus and Antigone, the actor reflects the hero's fateful realisation through the rhythm and the measure. For instance in ancient drama they used some repeated rhythmical patterns in order to create this restless energy for the actor and then he/she would be in this trance situation and become the reflective lens of the hero's awareness. This is what happens, you have the music, you have the rhythm for instance (the chaconne or whatever), this becomes your trigger to try to breathe the chaconne, to try to move with the chaconne, to remember what was going on during your embodiment procedure. And then, this is what happens: this opens up a whole new world of transformation for you and this is amazing. I mean, you have to deconstruct yourself in order to present the truth. And this is what is happening in all the communities. They use the triggers always . Music provided shouting, rhythmical patters, pedal notes, or in some other cases the drugs or the fasting. Every culture needs to have different triggers. This is what you do. You provoke this kind of vital burning with this triggers. Triggers can be this kind of musical rhythm or how you perceive the embodiment, how you perceive the harmony and the contrapuntal or your mental work. You try for instance to play a work that has 4 voices that coexist. You have to memorise, and this is the most difficult part, to memorise all these things

at the same time. You have to remember 1st voice, 2nd and whatever, all these, they are triggers. They are pretext in order for the performer to be able to burn their thoughts of the moment. And the thoughts can be: "how beautiful" "how skilful I am!" Or the thoughts can be: "you're totally useless." No. You have to really put that aside and do your work.

K: So this catharsis is this transformation you say, and I think that is very much linked with something that is also equally ambiguous, the transcendental. What transcends our world. I think that is quite a difficult concept for many to grasp as well, and this may be a side note, but in a world where from the 18th and 19th centuries onwards, we have been further and further away from spirituality, religion, and the other-worldly. We are focusing more on what is correct rather than the truth. Do you think this affects, or might have contributed to the fact that this part of performance does not have many treatises. Apart from a few philosophers or poets talking about this, or a performer realising something picking from a different field in philosophy or spirituality and bringing it into their music. We don't have this, within our curriculums, we don't have something like this that we can look to and say "this is a treatise for how we may embody the music". Why exactly do you think that is?

SG: First of all, I think that great composers, great philosophers, great musicians have told enough if you want to get into that train, you do have enough information. For instance, Beethoven's terms of music is that "it is a revelation above all science and arts", and he also says that "music provides an immaterial access to knowledge" Who? Beethoven. Okay? And then, I can remember for instance Debussy said, "I was aiming to bare flesh of emotion" and he told also, "this is what the idiot ones call impressionism." So, we do have enough information. Of course these are things that are, as Schoenberg would say, "they are felt, and cannot be demonstrated." So they cannot be proven very much. Schoenberg himself he told that "I don't care about beauty, I care about the truth." So, it has a certain stimulus ,all these kinds of things they tough in a way or another every big composer but these are things that are very difficult to share. Verbal communication is not very important. Actually, verbal communication is the power that we have to slow down

if we want to communicate those things. But, on the other hand, I think it is very important to try for the next generations to try to verbalise, as you do. This is crucial, this is critical to try to verbalise things that are really up to now, hard to negotiate with. Just because with this embodiment, we found a way to call it, and we found a way to say catharsis and whatever else. But, it is the level of consciousness of every human being, how people understand those things. So, in reality, if you pick up 50 people, and you say okay give me the term of what is bread, everyone will give you a different terminology. So I think these things need a special direction. Emotional and a special necessity. Somebody can be a great musician without having sensed or having no understanding about all these things. Somebody can have it instinctively and that's all. But to me, we have to chisel our instinctive forces towards this direction.

K: And finally, transcendence, for you, what does that feel like? Acknowledging that the verbal communication is of course quite a challenge, how have you experienced this?

S: I will give you two words. The first is emptiness, this is how I feel, emptiness and annihilation. The transcendence during the performance is for me, these two things. You empty yourself, you empty the surface of yourself and if you can do it during the whole life of yours, then it is easier to do it during the performing time. If you search what this absence, what its spiritual condition means: emptiness of the self, then it is maybe easier to find this kind of transcendence during the real time performance. And it always needs, I might add in a third word, it always needs affirmation. This is God through me breathing. It is the fuel, breathing, and the embodiment, impulse and intention as we have created in the practice room. They give you the fuel which you will burn yourself during the performance. If I can say in a way, they give you the breathing. You start to breathe, and you find the rhythm of breathing for the chaconne, then you cannot think of who you are. You just breathe the chaconne, you can become the rhythmic reality of the chaconne. Then if you want, as I told you, doors start to open during the performance. So yeah, this is how I would say it. Annihilation of who you are in your everyday life because I feel that we are

something much deeper than our everyday self. And much more universal. All people have something in common, okay? So, transcendentalism is the tool a performer has in order to reveal sides of this unknown.

K: Thank you very much for that, it has given me lots to think about now moving forward. How you added impulse as well along with intention. That is something that needs consideration. A lot that I have gotten from this conversation, so thank you very much!

Appendix 3

Interview with Sylvia O'Brien

Kristina Ammattil: As a performer, how do you prepare for a performance? How do you approach a piece of music for an upcoming performance?

Sylvia O'Brien: Well, I am very clear, and very aware of elements. And they are the controllable environment that I call them, so I am very specific so you are really asking the right question. I am very specific about my controllable environment. My controllable environment is: the music (the three elements of music, melody, text and rhythm), the *music* by that I mean the environment (it could be Mozart or it could be Stockhausen, the music), then the other element which is the space that I am in, the actual auditorium. And in my preparation, and this is where it is very specific, in my preparation of technique I am involved in all of those controllable elements. So, definitely it has evolved this, I wasn't always this way. I wasn't always this way consciously. I will progressively evolve; I won't just go in and sing a piece and hopefully I can get to it and find what it's saying. No. I look at it very strict from layers, I strip it down to black and white dots, I strip it down to codes (decoding, structuring), and I layer it up. If it's not in my head, how could it possibly be in my emotion? Yeah? So, I don't have an emotional connect because for that reason I can't properly do my job objectively if I am emotionally connected to something, I don't even know what the outcome is. So it is very specific now for me. And the reason is because I do contemporary music and standard music, I've had to do contemporary and I've also related that to standard. So, the controllable environment is my body but to a level like an athlete, I very much look at it like an athletic pursuit as well by the way. The athletic aspect is preparing to the nth degree, and then performing a game or running a race. So, my objectivity is within that controlled environment. So if you are an athlete you're talking about the altitude, you're talking about the weather. So my controlled environment is where I am placed on stage, my space, my dress —what I am wearing, what I have decided to wear will also be involved in the objective controllable

environment. That's one thing. I take that all into consideration. Sometimes I feel very lost when I am putting something together and I haven't seen the space. I don't know what to do, because I am envisaging already in a objective space. I am envisaging where I am, what colour, and how much projecting I will have to do. If that's a camera, if it's 3000 people, if it's 3 people, I want to have that in my head because *how*, and this is also interesting, people don't know this, but how you perform is not the same in all environments. To 3 people is a whole other different demeanour to 3000. Technique doesn't change. So, does that answer that question?

K: Yeah definitely. That's an interesting way to approach it as well. Would you also say that you really imagine how that performance would play out before you go on stage?

SB: A hundred percent. I have already gone through that performance. So I have done all of my, and this is for my own wellbeing, I have gone through the whole performance in my dress with the performers in the space. I don't mean vocally. I haven't vocalised it. I've got it here [points to head]. So obviously, technically I've gone through all my bibs and bobs, I've done my [vocalises] lalalala, all that part, that's really… I won't say it's irrelevant, that's already in the bag. So, with all of the other elements, it's parts of the puzzle if you want to say, are the environment. I recently did a live stream, and I couldn't work it out because I have never done just to nothing! I had done one last year actually, that's a lie. But it also just set me, I couldn't get my head around it. I was performing, I was doing an opera, but it was to a white wall. I just had to get my head around it. 8:30 I had to put my head into a space where I was more internal than external. So I was in the room, I was really actually more imagining the space as a film, as a theatrical environment where I wasn't emitting to somebody. I was emitting to the environment, to the inner space. But yeah, so that's crucial and also plays a part because at the end of the day, it all feeds into the technique. All of these elements feed into the technique. It all feeds into the technique. All these elements feeds the technique, cause the technique is your body, is your brain.

K: I would like to go on to the experience of performance itself. During that moment of performance how would you describe that experience?

SOB: I'm free. The time I am most free in my whole day, being, life, ever. It's like a matrix moment. It's like the matrix. I stop and I can do everything and I am everything. That sounds a little too far, but the moment where it really is in the best space, or I am in that best space, is the matrix.

K: I love that! Coincidentally I have just watched the first two parts of the Matrix just last week…

SOB: Oh my God it's the best movie ever!

[… on a tangent …]

So getting back to the thing, it's that freedom. Hopefully you're in a space of freedom. Freedom happens when all of the controllable environment has been dealt with and you are now suspended.

K: How I have thought about that is, for me, mostly anxiety of performing versus the excitement of it all, where they meld together and where you let yourself be guided by the music. I really like what you've said about the freedom, because you do want to free yourself.

SOB: I would go to another space. I would say that it is not just letting go, I would say that when, and this is where the uniqueness of performance is, is that you go to another dimension.

K: I do love the analogy of the Matrix as well! So as a teacher of performance, do you approach in the same way as performance, using such analogies? How is it that you convey this preparation for a performance to a student?

SOB: Okay. So here is the thing: I can't tell you how to perform. I can't tell you what to dip in to, that's your soul and I can't touch that. What I can do, is exactly what I do for myself, is layer the controllable environment, they're tangibles, and I prepare them to an inch of their life so that you can go out and be your soul and present that. I can do all of the psychological issues, I can say "do you know what dress you are going to wear?" "No that's not a good idea" —I'm not even talking about aesthetics, I'm saying, you know, maybe this piece it's so wonderful you don't want to detract from it in this ballgown, you know? It's not a frothy piece, let's be under dressed, let's wear all black and let this piece talk for itself. I will go to those elements which are not exactly tangibles, they're sort of aesthetics, you know, but I will prepare the layers so the person is finding what I am finding in me. I can't find it in them, I can sort out technique, which is again a peripheral. I would call them all the foundations to get there, but I can't get there for them.

K: Yeah, that's very true. And the practice itself, that we go through as performers involves a lot of personal deliberation, even when it comes to interpretation, preparing yourself and your mind for the performance. There is a lot of time that you spend in isolation before going on to this very public performance. As a teacher have you had to guide your students through that? And even as a performer yourself, how is it that you navigate that shift between practice versus performing, being in that free, boundless dimension?

SOB: Just one second, slight freeze on the camera there, could you repeat that? How do I capture what?

K: That shift between being focused and practicing, focusing primarily on the tangible elements, and then experiencing the intangible during your performance, where all of these elements meld together and you're in that other dimension, how would you describe that experience?

SOB: Depends on the piece. It depends on the piece, but it is all about the piece of music. If it's something that you've done, an aria that you've done a hundred million

times and this is an enjoyment environment, your approach is: it's about the energy. So you are in this jovial state and in this elevated frothy, I won't saw superficial, but you're trying to gather enough momentum to be in the same momentum as the environment requires, okay? So if it is a piece, I'm a but enamoured with Daniel Day-Lewis at the moment, but if it's a piece that demands a lot technically, but just also demands because it's a little but supernatural, so for instance Feldman's *Niether* which is an hour long monologue and you are integrated, you are invisible, you are instrument, you are everything. You have to shut off from everything and come introspective into that piece and into that world. You enter, your work doesn't happen on stage, your work happens before that to enter in to become one with that piece, to be in that piece, and that will require this. If that's an operatic world it also requires what is necessary in that operatic world. If it's a chamber work, you see in opera you are given your environment, you're given costume, lighting, the stage and all the other actors who help you be who you're supposed to be. What I love about chamber works and contemporary work, anything where it's just you and the elements, nothing to prop you up. I love that for that reason because you have to make that happen, and you've to create that moment. And that involves a lot of hard tool work. Understanding of the music and understanding of the music and connection with the music, and I love that. You can get more out of that, you're totally immersed. On the opera it's so dependant, the conductor is going to mess it up, the director is going to mess it up, the lighting is crap, anything really. It's just like, "let's get this over with", but when you get to your moment whether it's a little soliloquy or monologue, you then have control, then you have your free space. Just put the light on me, and everybody just shut up. And that's not from a selfish point of view. That means you can get into the music. You can get into it. So, it really is all about getting into the moment. Having the symmetry, the whole thing coming together. What was the question? So, it's about getting for the piece. It's piece-dependent. I can be any element that is going to be concentrated into, whether it's the text, the demand is on the music, your priority is the vocal, could be a vocal concentration you need… and yeah. So again, for the kids (I call them), it's about preparing all of those tangibles to the point where you are in that space before-hand. I will tell them "stop yaking",

"stop yaking with your neighbours", "go and find a space that is quiet". You need to be in it here [points to head], not here [points to throat], here [point to head].

K: That idea of being "totally immersed" in a piece, as you referred to earlier, and fully *being* in that space is an interesting concept that I have come to understand within the concept of the embodiment of music. Is this something that you have discussed before, or come across in your practice? This idea of not only presenting the music, but *being*, in that space, immersed. Especially for vocalists, our instrument is embedded within us. It is literally through us that the music is realised and communicated. What are your thoughts on this?

SOB: Well, that idea follows on very smoothly especially from the previous. So, the only way to get to that moment and yes, that is what I have experienced, some in more music than others, and then you come into your personal tastes and your personal attachment to the text, whatever it is. But, there is no way I get to that space without the layered process. And so, you can't jump lightyears ahead and get to that, you can't get there without, in whatever capacity your education is. Luckily, I understand an awful lot of what is around me, musically, harmonically, the sound world, and instruments and so on. I understand what composers mean. I have that understanding consciously now. That's not just what they want to say with the melody. I understand what they want to say with the piece instrumentally and so on, so my part comes in to the realm. It's not like "here I am, guys do whatever you want to do back there!" I am definitely in the sphere. Doesn't matter if it's a piano and voice, or chamber and voice, or opera I understand. But generally when I don't understand, it's poor writing. I'm not being conceited by saying that, but it often is because they don't know what to say. So, that comes from not singing. It's not the singing part that gives you that. It's sitting down and pondering, and understanding the music. But then, that comes from the particular process I have. I don't see a piece until I know what it is. I don't lamp in my voice, and my voice looks for the pieces. I work out everything objectively layered, and then by the time I'm vocalising, I'm vocalising with a vertical and horizontal understanding of the music —which gets quite…that's a serious moment. The problem is, a lot of people when they're saying they have "technical

difficulties", but they don't understand the music, it's because they haven't gone that route. And, a lot of the time, a lot of people try and fix technical issues, when actually you don't actually know what your words are, you don't actually know that pitch properly. And then you have a technical issue. So, let's fix the technical issue, let's put a band-aid on this instead of getting a systemic solution to the problem. So, embodiment comes from fully understanding.

K: That makes a lot of sense, yeah. Alright, what we first addressed, this "other dimension" that you had mentioned when you're in a performance, like you are in a different dimension, completely free, what are your thoughts on that dimension also relating to the music having an innate transcendence about it, a different dimension that the music can transport you to. Is it the music, or is it your preparation as a performer?

SOB: It is the music. It's the music that's doing it. It's like you've locked into that realm. We all have these strings that keep us earthed. So without the strings, any technical difficulties, without any fear, and because you're so embodied, all those strings… it's like the ad for Lancôme by Julia Roberts. All those threads just go away and you're now no longer attached to the Earth, you're in the realm of music. And you are free in that space. And that's why fixed interpretation doesn't make any sense. That's where you can go and do whatever you want within this space, you know you're not going to do a bad interpretation in that space.

K: Hopefully not!

SOB: I think you're not, because you're circling in this, you're not going to. If you do then you're not in it.

K: So, you do believe that the music should lead you there, and you should also let the music take you there?

SOB: You're only a vessel. You're nothing. It's not about you, that's the very thing: it's not about you. And you've got to appoint, and there are singers that you hear their voice and the music. And there are other singers where you hear the music and their voice. It just happens to be, but you're hearing their music. And the exceptional people who do that, are exceptional. Early Frank Sinatra, exceptional. Judy Garland, exceptional, Maria Callas, exceptional. They have the music before them. So, a lot of people say "Oh Rene Flemming, fabulous!", she's very successful but it's all about her voice. It's all about Rene. She's brilliant, and of course who am I to say? But that is a fact. She slows down stuff, it's all about her milky sounds. She's an exceptional musician, but she has also got this massive ego that presents itself before Mozart and before Brahms and before Mahler. In my very humble opinion.

K: I have heard that view several times, and I have experienced that as well which has prompted me to explore the idea of intention. As a performer, as part of society, the performer had a role to play and that is to communicate that music using the talent that you have, using the ability to realise the music and what the composer is trying to convey. You want to present that to your audience. I think intention, for me, is an important first step in realising your purpose as a vessel carrying the music. You work to master your instrument which will further your understanding of how to affectively communicate through music. So these intangible things are what I am attempting to take on with this research. So what are your thoughts on these intangible elements being discussed as part of the study of a performer. Keeping in mind what you mentioned earlier that you can lead the donkey to the water, or maybe it was a horse, either way.

SOB: I think there's a few things. So, just on what you said there, our function. I think there is a very important thing: our function. Our function as entertainer, but then our function as artist. And I mean, this is very very important, our function as artists and that would be the category I would lie in, it depends, if I am doing an entertaining evening or I'm doing an artistic evening. I present myself in two different bodies. And to be an artist is, we're talking Picasso, we're talking an artist that speaks. An artist is a person who can speak how they want without any ties to technical restraint. Yeah?

That's what an artist is. An entertainer is a whole other thing. They'll get the thing out, but they will have restrictions and they'll be tied to them. And they will also be restricted to the fact that they are just entertaining. So they are not embodying, they're not saying what they truly want to say, they are restricted to a box of entertainment. So that answers both the previous question and this question.

The intangibles. Speaking of intangibles is a very [significantly long pause for deliberation] open space. You're diving into the ocean. Or actually you're going to space, because you're talking about so many variants of what we're experiencing. What your experience is, you can write that down. You could measure it with medical instruments what you're experiencing. How it's being delivered you cannot measure that with medical instruments. So, when I talk about the trough, I am bringing people as far to the stage and producing what they should produce. I am more an enabler, a facilitator is what I would suggest I am —after a point of being a teacher. It's giving them the facility, but it's something that [audio cuts out]

K: Oh, you cut out for that last bit. I can hear you now!

SOB: Yeah, it's where…

K: So just beyond, as a teacher you are an enabler…

SOB: And a facilitator. I think when we have this person singing in front of us, and we want to teach them, I want to set them free. I want to set their instrument free. The problem is that most teaching, and I'm going to say something extremely controversial now, the problem in most teaching is: we get a sound and, it's like a piece of cake, we try and shave off a bit here and change a vowel here, lift the palate there, and that's all A topic…bull. Masterclasses! So much! I went to, Leontyne Price gave a masterclass in Juilliard. That was informative. She spoke about ethereal things. My whole lessons are about intention. You talk about discovering intention, it's all about intention. Me speaking to you and how I phrase it is about my intention. So without my intention, how am I supposed to deliver a piece? And the only way I get that

intention is by understanding. I cannot put onto someone an intention. I can't stick onto their head intention. But I can get them to find intention and how they find their own intention. And hopefully they have intention enough to perform. Maybe it's not! Some people saying, "I need to technically do this", and I say maybe you don't have, not what it takes, but you don't care enough. May it's not the vessel for you. Maybe something else is the vessel for you to express what you want to express, maybe this isn't it. I played the piano from when I was 6 years of age. I played all sorts of things, these works… that wasn't my vessel. So there are many aspects to this. And intention, I had it on my wall with a phrase, can't remember the end of it.

K: I think that definitely helps put my research into perspective. It's very interesting to hear professionals talk about this, and teacher and performers who experience it as well. It gives me a lot of confidence and ideas to progress my work. I do want to explore whether this is a topic of performance that might help us, moving forward as performers, to think about. Not just, like you said, going to a masterclass and shaving off a bit here or there... I want to know if there is something else that needs to be developed in order to fully realise and communicate the music. And I do agree, at the end of the day, it is not about us. It's about the music.

SOB: Yeah. It's not about you, it's about the music.

K: That was really a really insightful conversation. Thank you very much, and thank you for your time as well.

Appendix 4

Interview with Patricia Rozario

Kristina Ammattil: Alright, so you've had a very long performance career and you have had a lot of experience in the pedagogy of performance as well. In your experience, what goes into preparing for a performance?

Patricia Rozario: Preparation for me is first of all learning the music, the text, understanding the text, dwelling on the text, absorbing the ideas, and also thinking of it from different angles. Here I need to differentiate that I love performing spiritual music because I find that there is a dimension there that one can get in to. So there is oratorio there, or religious texts, then you've got the song repertoire, and then you have opera. I think each of these categories require slightly different approaches in preparation. With song repertoire you're dealing with language, poetry, you're dealing with literature and that is really important. That one is able to establish a strong connection with the language, especially if it isn't English, which is my mother tongue. So for example if I were to do something in Russian, I have studied German, Italian, French, and a bit of Spanish, but Russian I have never studied. I find that the process there is that you work with a native speaker, really listen to the sounds of the language, savour the sounds and try to sound as original as a native speaker. I mean, I think preparation goes in stages. When I get to a piece originally, I am just doing the basics of notes and rhythms, I make sure that technically I can access the notes that are difficult, working on breath —the flow of breath, very important. Then as one gets familiar with the piece, you start to let it flow. There is always an ebb and flow. So understanding what the composer wants when he wants you to take time in a particular phrase or section of a piece, and it is rehearsing all of that so that it gradually starts to come alive in the essence of the music and the poetry. And I think I find that when the two come together, and one realises that the composer has really brought something extra to the poem, and I think what is also very important that when singing one needs to savour the language. Quite often there is a sense of

onomatopoeia but there are also the subtle nuances of adjectives that add something to the main text. And I think paying attention to that with the voice especially one start to choose colours in your voice according to the vowels that you are singing, and that needs to be linked to the deeper meaning of the poem.

K: Yeah, I did hear a couple of recordings of your performances of the John Taverner pieces, and like you mentioned, you do sing quite a lot of spiritual music as well, and I have enjoyed that very much. How would you describe that experience of such a performance? As part of the spiritual repertoire, what has been your experience during its performance?

PR: Do you know, very early on, before I met Taverner and Arvo Part who wrote pieces for me, when I did oratorio (so John Passion, Messiah, Mathew Passion, Mozart's Requiem), for me that was a vehicle to communicate the deep spiritual meaning in the text which was enhanced and heightened in the music and I always found that there was a certain seriousness in it that I connected with, with it was also an uplifting experience performing these oratorio pieces. There is also the Nelson mass, there are lots of masses, but for me really feeling the intensity of, for example a Kyrie, or most composers when they set the Credo, an aria would be based on one phrase. The fact that it repeats, if you think in terms of Indian music or ideas, it's like a mantra, you're repeating it. But actually in the pieces of music, the inflection change and the whole thing build as an arch that one needs to discover which is the journey through the aria. It gradually builds, and one needs to keep the freshness and sincerity while performing as though it is the first time when performing it, and one is genuinely communicating these emotions and these ideas to the public through performance.

K: Yeah, I have felt the same way as well and that is also a huge part of why I am undertaking this research. The idea of intention and having that sincerity and that intention to convey the music to the public because you have the talent, you've worked on the skill, you are at a stage where you are attempting to master it, but what is it for? I think the primary goal is to communicate that, to transmit that music. So in

terms of intention, what are your thoughts on how it fits into the study and practice of a performer?

PR: I have always experienced that there is something that happens in one's mind and in one's body as you walk out on stage, and I love that. One doesn't really feel it as a loving experience, but I look forward to that because, and I am now talking through that process of the day of the performance (hopefully it is relevant to your study). For me, I am always quite low in energy, I stay low. I like to be alone, I like to think about my music, think of the score and quietly keep assimilating. Same for a song because whenever you perform, the hardest form is a song recital since it is entirely up to you and your pianist. You as a singer, even more, since you are communicating directly to your audience, you've got to entertain them, keep their interest in one song right through the end. I have always experienced that once I get on stage, it is almost as if those nerves are, I keep calming myself but keeping focused on the music that I am about to sing, and then something happens. And it is inexplicable, but it is almost as though the adrenaline kicks in and you are able to focus your attention so much that you can just sense some really subtle differences in the way that you sing, or be inspired to give that little bit more, or find colours. For example, a piece like the Alleluia from the Exultate Jubilate, I choose Alleluia because the whole aria is based on one word. I have often thought, this would be part of my preparation, how do you communicate alleluia and keep it fresh and interesting and keeping the audience's interest. And I think that for me, I would follow the line, the little twists and turns that Mozart has put. Sometimes it is a longer phrase, sometimes it's lots of repetitions which create an excitement, and I think one has to be in a way in a meditative state of in the word "alleluia". I think then Mozart's music brings something unique and you are able to communicate it. I remember singing it once, and remember an audience member came up and said to me, "were you really so happy, cause you look like you were excited. When singing it you looked so thrilled and so joyful." And I said "Yes I was!" I was doing my job, but I was performing it in that state of praise, of joyful praise and exultation. And it was nice to hear that because you never know if you were able to sustain that. And I think that in order to sustain it, you have to rely on the form that the composer has given. I think every great piece has a shape and you

discover the high point and then it subsides, but even then it is joyful, it is as though one is fulfilled in the praise, and enjoyment, and in the glorifying process. And then it subsides, but it is still joyful.

K: One thing I really caught on to is when you said that when the adrenaline kicks in and it's a slightly different feeling, that is another thing I have experienced. How to use that feeling, and fuel it into something that projects more. When I came across Lorca's text on *duende*, the fearlessness of taking a risk, of walking a fine line. As performers, when you're on that stage, you have to take the leap and the risk, give it your all and I think that has changed my perspective on performance. And it is encouraging to hear another performer feeling the same sense of a tipping point, to flow right out.

P: Yeah, you have to. When you really are so focused, and you immerse yourself and you take that leap. I think that is when the best performances happen. What I have learnt over the years with recital work is you have to almost enlarge your personality in order to encompass the audience. And yet you will have to be able to do things that are really subtle. I think our brains work on certain levels, and one is able to encompass the audience yet you take them through a journey. If it is a big robust song, yes you have got to deliver it, but when it's a piece that has subtler shades, you can still keep the intensity. The idea of projecting it to the last row in the audience so that everybody is involved and enveloped in your sound world, this also happens when one knows the music really well. The thing I have found occasionally frustrating was that if you were doing a tour, or concerts with a pianist that you didn't know so well that they would do only so many rehearsals because I can only spare so much time. I always love to rehearse a lot with the pianist because then when it comes to the performance you know that the pianist is absolutely with you and understands how the piece works together. Then you can afford to risk. Otherwise, you find that the pianist is going in a different direction or leaning back when you want to go forward. And that also relates to oratorio performances here in England where you turn up on the day, you rehearse in the afternoon and you perform in the evening. Whereas in Europe, it is such a pleasure to go and perform where you have

two days where you rehearse. The second day where you have a dress rehearsal, and then on the day of the performance you just turn up to perform. You're rested and fresh, and then you really do a performance as you've explored the parameters of the work together. The conditions are not always ideal, but when they are, it gives you the chance as a performer to go further. Actually, as a performer, one has a great responsibility to deliver the piece in the way that one conceives of it while also bearing in mind what the composer wanted and is trying to do. That is why I always stress to my students to go back to the score, to look at it, observe every aspect of it, learn it out of heart, look at the dynamics of it. In a way those are clues as to what the composer wants with the variation and tone which brings the poem in a musical setting. It adds something to that poem.

K: And it is different relationships isn't it that a performer has with the music, fellow musicians sharing in the same music, and also the audience, the conductor and so on. Different relationships all working towards one performance. I see how practice is very important as you are all trying to get into that same frame of mind, and work on those relationships in order to realise the music. In that sense, when you are working with the music, and studying the music, in delivering this to the audience, I have found the embodiment of music to be an interesting concept. What are your thoughts on this?

PR: I mean I think when you do an operatic role, you do embody the character and the music is written after the character. To create the character you go into the music and you find all the different aspects that would build the real life being that you represent. And I think with song recitals, every song is like a mini opera. As a performer you have the duty to bring it alive, to tell the story. I just find that I work to loose myself in that. If I am doing a particular song, I want to be so intensely in tune with the emotions. In performance sometimes new things suggest themselves, and I'll go with it because it makes it much more spontaneous and that I am inter-weaving with the music not just singing notes and words and rhythms exactly as the composer has written it, but I am adding something of myself. So, with great respect to the music, you can only go so far, if you push it too far then you can risk destroying some

aspects of it. Having said that, I once did a performance of a work, a Cole Porter song called "What is this thing called Love?" You might know it. And there's a lot of syncopation, and the words flow… Now, it is usually sung at a certain pace but I did it with John Taverner. I mean, he was a very good pianist but he had very eccentric views about it. And he kept saying "no no not so fast, not so fast, don't let it go that fast." And he set the tempo so slow. I can't demonstrate it, but actually the recording exists somewhere because it went into a film about his life, if you would like to find it. And I remember hearing from, I am so bad at names, but there is a pop artist who also connects with Classical music. And he is an Irishman, can't remember his name. He happened to do a programme at the South bank and invited me to do a few things. And he said "I heard that recording, and I was amazed that it worked at such a slow pace." So obviously you can put a completely different slant on a piece and people know it very well. I think jazz singers do renditions of, you know, Summertime, and they might do some scatting in between, and I think it's all spontaneous and that's what makes live performance so exciting. One can do that sort of thing.

K: Definitely, I really like that how you framed that. So, moving on to the idea of, and I don't think this relates only to spiritual music, but in performing, having this experience of a transcendental dimension of music that exists. A rather intangible force that touches many people witnessing an affective performance. Are there any experiences that you might be able to share with this feeling?

PR: Do you know, sometimes, I have experienced this very strongly. But sometimes, a place can transport you. Before the new millennia, before 2020, I was invited to perform to perform in Greece in Delphi in the area where there would have their games in the ancient times. And it was an amazing experience because we were doing Taverner, the Greeks loved his music, but I was singing in Russian on a stage in Greece out in the open air late at night. Adjacent to the arena was a hill, it was quite mountainous and everything was very quiet. You could hear the mountain goats with their little bells every now and again. And when performing, you could just feel like you were one with nature. It is very hard to put it in words, but there was

something about the atmosphere which was so strong. In silence there was resonance. In a space like that you really feel transported, and you get in a way closer or deeper into the music. I mean, those sort of experiences are heavy experience. I find that sometimes when I have done those kinds of performances, I come off and I am on a high! And I think when things work, and you've absorbed the music in your practice and you really know exactly where it is going and what you want to do with it. When you perform it, it goes onto another level. You actually don't even know the impact of the way you are doing things. See, when I met Arvo Part, he said to me, "I want to write for that voice." I mean, I was standing right in front of him and he said, "I want to write for that voice." He heard something in my voice when I was performing and he was there and initially, we wanted a piano trio and voice combination. But he said, "no no no, I don't write to demand like that. I want to write for that voice." And it always stayed with me, that impersonal description of "that voice" as though it was an entity in itself. And it may be something that he heard in the performance and connected with and wrote this big work which is half an hour long for soprano and orchestra which is half an hour long which I have done quite a lot. The other thing was that Taverner, when I sang his music, I sang it in many different places —in little churches, chapels, outdoor amphitheatres, I went to Ephesus and performed in the amphitheatre there, as I said before a few places in Greece as well. He always said that he didn't want anyone else to sing his music because he felt that what I brought to it was exactly how he wanted to hear it. I said, "what is it? Surely, any good singer can do it." And he said, "there is something primordial about your voice." Which I did not understand then… For me, I was just little old me, doing the best I can enjoying and loving it. And that's another thing as well. I used to feel so shy doing modern music because I was so scared the music would be too difficult. But actually, the very first modern piece that I did, I was terrified. It was an opera by a composer called John Casting. My part wasn't difficult, but it was what went around it, you know, when you're doing a rehearsal, the pianist chooses what they play. They can't play the whole orchestral part. And I had worked how I would get my entries because it was quite discordant. But within the texture, there were instruments sustaining clues that led to my part. But in the first run, we did a sing through on the first day, and you know what, I wasn't able to enter,

I wasn't able to sing my part at all I was terribly silent. I thought of my God they're going to kick me out… but actually, I went to the pianist and said "I didn't hear the clues" and he said "look, I am just reading a whole orchestral score, I just choose what I can, so just tell me what you need." So that was quite a terrifying introduction to contemporary music. But then, I found that working with the composer, they would explain what it is they were after. They would just give you little words or little phrases, or little ideas that you worked on. And then when they heard the right sound they would give you freedom to do it. It was a wonderful experience really working with many different composers but it was a perfect understanding about what the composer wanted. Often it was a sound world, and then you had this sense of responsibility to deliver the piece, but you also felt that you understood the composer's sounds world and intentions so that you could be a little bit free-er and bring out something that is unique in your voice in the performance.

K: That is very interesting. Thank you for that. So, I would like to wrap this up with one more question. These ideas that I have just asked you about: the intention, embodiment, communicating the music and so on, are these ideas that you have discussed in relation to your performance, or during your studies, or at any point in your professional career? Have these possibly been discussed among your peers or teachers?

PR: You know, actually, it is something you discover as you progress and as you gain experience, you get little illuminations. I don't think, you know, talking about it isn't doing it. Now, here when I say something you connect with it, because you have experienced it. If you haven't experienced it, you wouldn't be able to comprehend it. It would like something odd. All good performers, I think as artists and performers, we had the gift of voice, the gift of the facility to play an instrument and make something out of it. Therefore, as a performer one is really open to things that suggest themselves to you. Actually, one thing that I found more difficult at the start of my career was doing opera because I hadn't done any opera growing up, and coming from India there is more segregation, and I was slightly embarrassed to be quite close to each other on stage. But then the more I did

of it I realised, you know, we're all focused on our characters and the interplay between characters it's a game, it's pretend! We are getting into character, but it's a pretence. But it is a genuine exploration of the character. I think opera, in a way, is the grandest of all because you loose yourself in the character and the music takes you further. And when you are in this world, when you are transported in this world of opera that we are doing, and the orchestral dimension adds another aspect to it. It really communicates. One has the freedom through the character, that one might be embarrassed to do standing on a stage. And so that's the magic world of opera, it gives you the opportunity to explore even further. It's a visual, so it has a stronger impact on the audience and the listener. With teachers, when I was studying, they would point out the style of a particular composer, they would talk about the language – to really understand what it was all about. And I think those are the little steps that add and build a foundation process that goes through with every next piece that one does, or programme that one does. But I have never really sat down and talked about it because I feel it is quite intangible. It's something that you connect with, and these sparks occur in performance that illuminate your mind as you perform and allows you to go that bit further to connect with the audience. When one performs at the highest level, one is like a singhali, you know, casting a spell on the audience. And I think that is the exciting thing about being a performer. It's a spark in them which by giving them the opportunity to perform and tweak —encouraging them to think about that aspects. For example if you did the role of Nanetta in Falstaff by Verdi. It's a magical character, sung by a young girl. And there's a scene in the evening where they're pretending to be fairies. Anyway, the music is so delicate and magical that it comes alive and everything else fits, the lights and everything. But the music has it in it, even if you don't have the setting. I always remember singing the aria in concert and feeling this wonderful sense of fairy footsteps in the accompaniment. You need the young singer to come up with it, to really go on a journey and transform them. Not to be too present, in a sense that you have to require the character to take you over.

K: Yeah, and I have found very interesting and I do agree that as musicians as performer most of our practice happens in isolation. (Oh, can you hear me?) Most of

our practice and the work that goes into a performance happens in isolation, it is more of a solitary act. So it does only make sense that all of these deliberations are quite personal and it does remain there. But I did also find interesting that while we share so much in a classroom setting, or amongst peers while we share tips and trick about techniques, about interpretation. We're sharing all these ideas, I found it very fascinating hat maybe is the intention that someone goes on stage with worth discussing? Is that something that might inspire similar conversations as well in terms of the performer before they have touched the music, as. A person who is going to embody this music while they are on stage. That is one area that I am finding quite interesting. This third area, it is a mixture of a lot of things, but mostly personal deliberation and a lot of independent work. So that's all the time I will be taking up today.

PR: I just want to add one more thing, it may not be useful. You were just saying about do we discuss the approach to being on stage and things like that, and I think these days at music college they do a lot of movement and drama, deportment. I never did it when I was studying, but one realises that if you were presenting yourself in front of an audience, you had to be poised and you had to dress well and you had to be aware of every aspect —as a singer one does develop that. It's not a bad idea to explore what it is that makes one look more elegant or give oneself an impressive décor. Actually I learnt that in drama, cause one of the teachers just gave us a feat and it was little movements of the head. It made you aware of how you could convey different expressions by just moving your head every so slightly, a little tilt here or there. So you know, one can learn all of that but at the end of the day, the inspiration, and you mentioned just now that caught my attention, the little tips and tricks that people talk about. I believe that there would not be any tricks, I believe that people should master a technique that is so natural, you know, it's like breathing. When you have to sing you immediately breathe and open up and stretch and prepare spontaneously, that becomes second nature. All those things that your singing teacher chants at you in your lesson, do this, remember the core and the support.

K: Yeah, that is fascinating. So a lot for me to think about as well. Thank you very much for sitting down with me.

PR: No problem. Being a soloist and being an artist and a performer, you had just used the word "solitary", it does. I realise now, I am starting to connect with my contemporaries whom I would meet when I did an opera. You know, you get very close when you do an opera cause you're spending 5 weeks working on it together and you perform together. But as soon as the opera is finished, you go your separate ways. And then you do something else, you meet other musicians and so on. Thorough this career one has a very lonely path, and as a singer you have to be silent most of the time when you're not singing, so you're saving it —you can't really socialise and actually look in any other direction, you know. That's something one needs to do, and just now in these couple of years I am aware that I am meeting more of my contemporaries and connecting with them on platforms to discuss or help different people or even teach which feels very different to when we were.. that's why in a way you're also competing with each other, the voice type. Especially as a soprano one is finding one's path and connecting with the people that will give you more opportunities to perform. Anyway, I am talking too much!

K: That might be a conversation for another time.

PR: Another time, yeah definitely.

K: Thank you very much!

Appendix 5

Students' Experiences Questionnaire